



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru The National Assembly for Wales

Y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg The Children, Young People and Education Committee

**Dydd Iau, 2 Gorffennaf 2015
Thursday, 2 July 2015**

Cynnwys Contents

[Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon](#)
[Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions](#)

[Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1](#)
[Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans \(WESPs\)—Evidence session 1](#)

[Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 2](#)
[Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans \(WESPs\)—Evidence Session 2](#)

[Papurau i’w Nodi](#)
[Papers to Note](#)

[Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42\(ix\) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o Weddill y
Cyfarfod hwn ac o’r Cyfarfod Cyfan ar 10 Mehefin](#)
[Motion under Standing Order 17.42\(ix\) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Remainder
of the Meeting and from the Whole of the Meeting on 10 June](#)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,
cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o’r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
Suzy Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymru Welsh Conservatives
Ann Jones	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Chair of the Committee)
Lynne Neagle	Llafur Labour
David Rees	Llafur Labour
Aled Roberts	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Simon Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Catrin Griffiths	Cynghorydd Her sydd â chyfrifoldeb am Gymru, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru Challenge Adviser with responsibility for Welsh, Welsh Local Government Association
Elin Maher	Aelod o Bwyllgor Cenedlaethol Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg (RhAG) a Chynrychiolydd Lleol Casnewydd Member of the Parents for Welsh Medium Education (RhAG) National Committee and Local Representative for Newport
Gareth Morgans	Prif Swyddog Addysg—Sir Gaerfyrddin, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru Chief Education Officer—Carmarthenshire, Association of Directors of Education in Wales
Ceri Owen	Cyfarwyddwr Datblygu—Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg (RhAG) Director of Development—Parents for Welsh Medium Education (RhAG)

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Sarah Bartlett	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Siân Thomas	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Marc Wyn Jones	Clerc Clerk

Dechreuodd rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod am 10:01.
The public part of the meeting began at 10:01.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Ann Jones:** Good morning, everybody. Welcome to the Children, Young People and Education Committee. I'll just do the usual housekeeping rules. We're not expecting the fire alarm to operate. If it does, we'll take our instructions from the ushers. If we're able to get out through the entrance to my left, then the assembly point is the Pierhead building. Other than that, as I say, we'll be guided by the ushers. We've had apologies this morning from John Griffiths and from Angela Burns and Bethan Jenkins. Bethan's substituting on another committee that's taking a piece of legislation forward. I think John Griffiths is as well. I think Angela has just got other commitments. So, we have no substitutions. So, there we go. We operate bilingually, as you know, so it's channel 1 for translation from Welsh into English, and channel 0 is the floor language for amplification.

10:02

Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1 Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs)—Evidence session 1

[2] **Ann Jones:** We're starting a new inquiry into Welsh in education strategic plans. Does anybody need to declare any interest that they haven't already declared, seeing as it's the first session of a new report? No. We're happy with that. Okay, fine, thank you. So, we'll move on then to our inquiry into Welsh in education strategic plans and our first evidence session. We're delighted to have with us Elin Maher and Ceri Owen. Elin is a member of Parents for Welsh Medium Education, and Ceri is the director of development from the same organisation. You're both very welcome and thank you both for your evidence. If it's okay with you, we've got a series of questions. We've got about an hour for an exchange. It's more of an exchange rather than a combative—. We want to hear from you, so it's more of a discussion than anything. We've got a set of questions to try and work our way around. We're going to be looking at WESPs, as they are now coming to be called; the Welsh Government's Welsh-medium education strategy; assessing and meeting local demand, which we want to talk about; monitoring, reviewing, reporting, approving and compliance—that little bit there; and then WESPs and the broader Welsh Government policy. Those are the four broad areas that we're going to be covering. As I say, thank you very much for your written evidence. Suzy, we'll start with you, and then we'll go to Keith.

[3] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, thank you very much. This inquiry is quite narrow in its context—it's how WESPs, as they look today, look as compared to the Welsh Government's own strategy for improving the Welsh language. Thank you very much for very comprehensive evidence. I was struck by some of your opening remarks here:

[4] 'Our concern is that the plans in their current form'

[5] —and this is universal—

[6] 'do not reflect the spirit...of the School Standards and Organisation...Act'.

[7] In particular, you think that's because local authorities generally haven't embraced the new way of thinking. Is that the fundamental reason for your disappointment—you just think that councils just don't get it?

[8] **Ms Maher:** I roi cyd-destun, **Ms Maher:** To put it in context, we feel that roeddwn yn teimlo bod cyfle arbennig fan there is a special opportunity here to be able

hyn i fedru edrych ar addysg Gymraeg mewn goleuni newydd ac i fod yn arloesol. Felly, o bosibl, yn y cyd-destun, nid oes cynllunio mor fanwl â hyn wedi bod ar gael. Felly, ein gobaith ni, fel Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg, oedd y byddai'r cynllun yma a'r canllawiau yma'n rhoi cyfle i ni weld cynlluniau hollol arloesol a hollol chwyldroadol a fyddai'n wirioneddol gyfrannu at ehangu a chynyddu niferoedd y plant o fewn ein haddysg Gymraeg ar draws Cymru. Yn anffodus, gyda'r cylch cyntaf, beth bynnag, nid ydym wedi gweld yr ysbryd yma'n cael ei ddal a'i feithrin a'i ddathlu yn y cynlluniau cychwynnol.

to look at Welsh-medium education in a new light, and to be innovative. Therefore, possibly, in the context, such detailed planning hasn't been available until now. Our hope, as Parents for Welsh Medium Education, was that this plan and this guidance would give us an opportunity to see innovative and revolutionary planning that would really contribute to expanding and increasing the numbers of children within Welsh-medium education across Wales. Unfortunately, with the first round, we haven't seen this spirit being captured and nurtured and celebrated in these initial plans.

[9] **Suzy Davies:** Can you give us—

[10] A yw'n bosib rhannu cwpl o esiamplau, er enghraifft?

Could you just share a few examples with us, perhaps?

[11] **Ms Owen:** Wrth gwrs, mae gennym ni weledigaeth yn y strategaeth, a'r cam cyntaf yw hynny yn y broses gynllunio. Mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol, wedyn, trwy'u cynlluniau strategol, gyfrannu mewn ffordd weithredol tuag at gyflawni'r nodau ac amcanion sydd yn y strategaeth, ac i gyflawni'r weledigaeth yn ehangach, felly. Ac, i atgoffa'n hunain o beth ydy'r weledigaeth honno: cael system addysg a hyfforddiant sy'n ymateb, mewn ffordd sydd wedi'i chynllunio, i'r galw cynyddol am addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg, sy'n cyrraedd ein cymunedau amrywiol ac sy'n adlewyrchu a sicrhau cynnydd yn nifer y bobl o bob oedran a chefdir sy'n rhugl yn y Gymraeg, ac sy'n gallu defnyddio'r iaith gyda'u teuluoedd, yn eu cymunedau ac yn y gweithle.

Ms Owen: Yes. Of course, we do have a vision in the strategy, and that's the first step in the planning process. Then, every local authority, through their strategic plans, has to contribute, in an active way, to achieving the aims and objectives in the strategy, and to achieve the wider vision. And, to remind ourselves of that vision: to have an education and training system that responds, in a planned way, to the increasing demand for Welsh-medium education and reaches our varied communities and reflects and secures an increase in the number of people from all backgrounds who are fluent in the Welsh language and can use the Welsh language with their families, in their communities, and in the workplace

[12] Felly, dyna'r peth, wrth gwrs, sy'n gyrru'r holl amcanion a sicrhau bod teuluoedd ymhob rhan o Gymru'n medru cael mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg, yn rhesymol, o fewn eu cymunedau, fel y mae'n bosib gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd o safbwynt addysg cyfrwng Saesneg.

So, of course, that's what drives all of the objectives in ensuring that families in all parts of Wales can access Welsh-medium education reasonably and within their communities, as it is possible to do at present from the point of view of English-medium education.

[13] Roeddech chi'n cyfeirio at gael enghreifftiau, efallai, o gynlluniau sy'n disgyn o dan y safon ddisgwyliedig, ddywedwn ni. Beth fuaswn i'n ei ddweud hefyd yw, er mwyn cael y maen i'r wal, mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol dorchi llewys a chyfrannu tuag at wireddu nodau ac

You mentioned having specific examples, perhaps, of plans that fall below the expected standard, shall we say? What I would say is that, in order to achieve our objectives, then all local authorities have to roll up their sleeves and actually contribute towards achieving the aims and objectives of the

amcanion y strategaeth. Nid yw'n ddigon da i gael un sir, o bosib, yn gwneud y gwaith i gyd; mae'n rhaid i bawb gyfrannu mewn modd cymedrol a rhesymol tuag at gyflawni'r targedau.

[14] **Suzy Davies:** Cyn i ni symud ymlaen, a ydych chi'n gwybod a yw rhai o'r cynghorau wedi rhannu'u profiad, er enghraifft, neu syniadau?

[15] **Ms Owen:** Hynny yw, mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, neu—?

[16] **Suzy Davies:** Ie. Jest i gymharu un cyngor sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, yn eich barn chi, a ydyn nhw wedi bod yn siarad â'r rhai lle mae yna ryw fath o ddiffyg, gawn ni ddweud?

[17] **Ms Owen:** Cwestiwn da. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny efallai'n rhywbeth y dylai ddeillio o'r drafodaeth hon; bod angen mwy o rannu arfer dda mewn siroedd lle maen nhw'n llwyddo. Wrth gwrs, mae Gwynedd, o bosib, yn esiampl dda o safbwynt y cynradd, ac o safbwynt polisi. Ac, o bosib, mae angen rhaeadru mwy o'r arferion da hynny mewn lot o siroedd eraill lle nad ydy hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Targedau twf, y buaswn i'n ei ddweud, yw un o brif ddi-ddordebau RhAG, hynny yw, ein bod yn cynyddu niferoedd y plant saith oed, sef deilliant 1 yn y strategaeth. Mae targedau twf, hynny yw i agor mwy o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg a chynyddu'r llefydd, yn rhywbeth sy'n ddiffygiol drwyddi draw yn y cynlluniau strategol. Mae yna ddiffygion o safbwynt nodi y bydd nifer benodol o ysgolion newydd yn agor o fewn cylch cyntaf y cynlluniau fel maen nhw'n sefyll ar hyn o bryd.

[18] **Ms Maher:** Roeddech chi'n gofyn am enghreifftiau o rannu arfer dda, yn ogystal. Rwy'n ymwybodol, yn dod o ardal y de-ddwyrain yng Nghasnewydd, gan fod Casnewydd wedi gwneud ymarferiad mesur y galw, er enghraifft, sy'n un rhan hanfodol o'r cynlluniau newydd hyn, fod nifer o awdurdodau lleol ar draws Cymru wedi cysylltu â swyddogion yng nghyngor Casnewydd a oedd wedi mesur y galw cyn bod mesur y galw yn rhan o unrhyw strategaeth. Felly, mae gennym ni

strategy. It is not good enough to have one county doing all of the work; all of them need to contribute in an equitable and reasonable way towards achieving the targets.

Suzy Davies: Before we move forward, do you know whether some of the councils have shared their experiences or ideas, for example?

Ms Owen: Do you mean in a positive manner or—?

Suzy Davies: Yes. Looking at one council that's been successful, in your view, have they been speaking to councils where there's been some deficiency, shall we say?

Ms Owen: That's a good question and that is, perhaps, something that should emerge from this discussion; that we need more sharing of good practice in counties where they are successful. Gwynedd is perhaps a good example in terms of primary education and in terms of policy. And, perhaps, we need to actually cascade much of that good practice in other counties where that doesn't necessarily happen. Growth targets, I would say, is one of RhAG's main interests, in that we are seeking to increase the number of seven-year-olds, which is outcome 1 in the strategy. Growth targets, namely to increase the number of Welsh-medium schools and places available, is something that is deficient, broadly speaking, in the WESP. There are problems in terms of noting that a specific number of new schools will open within the first round of the WESPs as they currently stand.

Ms Maher: You were asking for examples of sharing good practice, as well. I am aware, coming from the south-east area in Newport, that, as Newport has undertaken an exercise on meeting the demand, which is an essential part of these new plans, a number of local authorities across Wales contacted officials in Newport council, which had fulfilled this undertaking before the need to do so was contained in any sort of strategy. So, we do have examples of where good practice has been transferred from one county to another,

enghreifftiau o le mae arferion da wedi cael eu trosglwyddo o un sir i'r llall, ond nid ydyn nhw'n ddigon niferus, o bosib. Wn i ddim pam nad yw e wedi digwydd—y mesur y galw. Efallai oherwydd ei bod yn broses newydd ac efallai nad yw ambell sir yn siŵr iawn sut i gychwyn ar y broses honno. O gael y canllawiau mwy penodol a phendant yn y mesur yna, roedd yn haws, wedyn, i lunio'r gwaith ar fesur y galw.

[19] Rwy'n siŵr y byddwn ni'n siarad am fesur y galw yn fanylach wedyn, ond mae dehongli mesur y galw yn dal i fod, ac mae gwahanol bobl yn dehongli mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Ond, mae yna enghreifftiau, yn bendant yn y de-ddwyrain, o rannu'r wybodaeth honno ar draws Gymru.

[20] **Suzy Davies:** Gyda'r rhai sy'n dda, a ydyn nhw'n cymryd mwy o sylw o'r targedau yn strategaeth y Llywodraeth ei hunain, ac nid jest y cynllun lleol? Achos, yn eich tystiolaeth, fe ddywedoch chi,

[21] 'There seems to be no clear relationship between the Welsh-medium education strategy and individual WESPs.'

[22] Sori, mae hwn ond yn y Saesneg fan hyn. A yw'r rhai sy'n llwyddo wedi cymryd mwy o sylw o'r berthynas hon?

[23] **Ms Owen:** Wel, hynny yw, yr hyn yr ydym yn trio ei ddadlau yw bod yna ddiffyg cydgysylltu rhwng y strategaeth—y polisi cenedlaethol sy'n cael ei yrru gan y Llywodraeth—ac wedyn gweithredu hynny ar lawr gwlad gan awdurdodau lleol drwy gynlluniau strategol. Mae yna ddiffyg cydberthynas rhwng y weledigaeth a'r targedau a sut mae cyflawni hynny ar lefel leol. Felly, rwyf yn meddwl mai dyna yw un o'r prif broblemau ac, o bosib, mae hynny'n deillio o ddiffyg ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth o sut i fynd ati. Roedd Elin yn cyfeirio at y gwaith—yr echel bwysig honno—o hyrwyddo. Rydym yn symud i ffwrdd rŵan, onid ydym, o jest diwallu'r galw? Mae angen i siroedd fod yn symbylu twf, yn ysgogi twf, ac yn cynyddu'r niferoedd. Felly, mae hynny'n shifft sylweddol o ran meddylfryd, onid ydyw? O bosib, nid yw'r siroedd ar hyn o bryd yn derbyn hynny efallai mewn rhai achosion, ond nid ydynt yn deall ychwaith, ar lefel

but perhaps they're not as numerous as they should be. I don't know why this hasn't happened—the meeting the demand exercise. Perhaps it's because it's a new process and some counties aren't sure how to start that process. In having these more specific guidelines within that measure, it was therefore easier to plan the exercise on meeting the demand.

I'm sure we will talk about meeting the demand in more detail later on, but interpretation of meeting the demand still takes place, and different people interpret it in different ways. But, there are examples, especially in the south-east, of sharing that information across Wales.

Suzy Davies: With those who do work effectively, do they take more notice of the targets in the Government's own strategy, and not just the local plan? Because, in your evidence, you said,

Sorry, I only have an English copy before me here. Are those that are successful taking more notice of that interrelationship?

Ms Owen: What we're trying to argue is that there is a lack of correlation between the strategy—the national policy driven by the Government—and the implementation at grass-roots level by local authorities through their strategic plans. There is a lack of correlation between the vision and the targets and how to achieve that on a local level. Therefore, I think that is one of the main problems and, possibly, it stems from a lack of awareness and understanding of how to undertake this. Elin referred to this important work of promotion. We're moving away now, aren't we, from just meeting the need? Counties need to be stimulating and promoting growth and increasing numbers, and that is a significant shift in terms of mindset. Counties, at the moment, don't perhaps accept that in some cases, but neither do they understand, on a practical level, how to implement and feed that into their plans in order to achieve the necessary growth.

ymarferol, sut i weithredu hynny a sut i fwydo hynny i mewn i'w cynlluniau er mwyn cael y twf angenrheidiol.

[24] **Suzy Davies:** Wel, mae—

Suzy Davies: Well, there—

[25] **Ann Jones:** Sorry, Simon's got a point on this.

[26] **Suzy Davies:** Well, this is the same sort of point, but it'll be my last point. Is that okay?

[27] **Ann Jones:** Go on, then.

[28] **Suzy Davies:** Ar y pwynt hwnnw, rydych yn dweud eto yn eich tystiolaeth fod rhai o'r cynlluniau yn hollol aneffeithiol. Ai ar y pwynt hwnnw y mae hynny, sef nad dydynt yn dangos sut i weithredu twf?

Suzy Davies: On that point, you say again in your evidence that some of the plans are utterly ineffectual. Is it on that point—that they don't actually demonstrate how they are going to achieve growth?

[29] **Ms Maher:** Wel, mae yna ddiffyg targedau pendant ac, mewn ambell sir, mae'r niferoedd yn y sir wedi cwmpo yn hytrach na thyfu.

Ms Maher: Well, there's a lack of specific targets and, in some counties, the numbers have fallen rather than grown.

[30] **Suzy Davies:** Ocê, diolch.

Suzy Davies: Okay, thank you.

[31] **Ann Jones:** Simon.

[32] **Simon Thomas:** Mae gen i gwestiwn sy'n perthyn i'r mater hwnnw, jest ar gyfer y cofnod, mewn ffordd, a jest i sefydlu'r maes yr ydym yn ei drafod fan hyn, ac i fod y glir. Ai'r cynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg yw'r unig arf sydd gan awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer cyflawni'r strategaeth addysg Gymraeg genedlaethol? Ai dyna'r unig arf?

Simon Thomas: Well, it's a related question and just for the record, in a way, and just to establish the area that we are discussing here, and to be clear. Is it the WESPs that are the only tool available to local authorities to achieve the national Welsh-medium education strategy? Is that the only tool?

[33] **Ms Owen:** Hynny yw, mae o'n erfyn pwerus statudol. Fel yr oedd Elin yn dweud ar y dechrau, mae'n gyfle hanesyddol, onid ydyw, i fod yn symud pethau yn eu blaenau? Ond, rwy'n credu hefyd fod angen i'r strategaeth a'r cynlluniau strategol fod yn rhan ehangach o, a ffitio'n daclusach ac yn well efo, holl feysydd polisi'r Llywodraeth ym mhob adran, felly, fel bod yna brif ffrydio wedyn rhwng y meysydd blynyddoedd cynnar, cynllunio, cludiant, rhaglenni fel Dechrau'n Deg ac yn y blaen. Dylai'r holl bethau yma fod yn priodi efo'i gilydd yn llawer gwell er mwyn cyrraedd y nod. Ar hyn o bryd, rwy'n credu bod pob strategaeth mewn gwagle, a does yna ddim cydgysylltu na chydweithio digonol ac effeithiol rhyngddynt nhw er mwyn cael y twf yr ydym

Ms Owen: It is a powerful statutory tool. As Elin mentioned earlier, it is a historic opportunity to be moving things on. But I do think also that there is a need for the strategy and the WESPs to be part of a wider aim and to fit more neatly with all the policy areas of the Government, so that there is then mainstreaming between early years, planning, transport, programmes such as Flying Start, and so on. All of these things should be marrying together much better in order to reach the aim. I think that, at the moment, all the strategies are working in silos and there isn't sufficient correlation and co-operation between them in order to achieve this growth.

am ei weld.

[34] **Ms Maher:** Mae safonau'r Gymraeg yn ymbarél dros y cyfan, wrth gwrs, hefyd.

Ms Maher: The Welsh language standards are also an umbrella over all of this, of course.

[35] **Simon Thomas:** Mae'n amlwg yn eich tystiolaeth chi ac yn y dystiolaeth yr ydym wedi'i derbyn fod yna fwch rhwng y cynlluniau a'r strategaeth genedlaethol. A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o weithgarwch arall—boed yn wael neu'n dda—mewn awdurdodau lleol sy'n adeiladu tuag at y strategaeth genedlaethol ond nad yw eto wedi'i gwmpasu y tu mewn i'r cynlluniau addysg?

Simon Thomas: It's clear from your evidence, and other evidence that we've received, that there is this gap between the plans and the national strategy. Are you aware of other activity—be that positive or negative—within local authorities that does build towards that national strategy but hasn't yet been encompassed within the WESPs?

[36] **Ms Maher:** Wel, mae yna ddiffygion, yr ydym yn teimlo, gyda rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, er enghraifft. Mae yna gyfle yn y rhaglen honno i sicrhau bod mwy o blant yn dod at y Gymraeg yn gynt yn eu bywydau.

Ms Maher: There are deficiencies, we feel, with the Flying Start programme, for example. There is an opportunity within that programme to ensure that more children come to the Welsh language earlier in their lives.

[37] **Simon Thomas:** Gan fod hwnnw'n anstatudol ac, felly, nid yw'n rhan o'r cynlluniau Cymraeg mewn addysg.

Simon Thomas: Because that is non-statutory and is therefore not a part of the Welsh in education plans.

[38] **Ms Maher:** Wrth gwrs. Mae'n rhaid edrych yn arloesol ar sut rydym yn cynllunio addysg Gymraeg erbyn hyn, ac mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar sut rydym yn bwydo'r system statudol, felly. Hynny yw, allwn ni ddim dibynnu'n llwyr ar blant yn cyrraedd y dosbarthiadau meithrin o un man. Mae'r cynlluniau—beth yw eu henwau? Mae'r astudiaethau dichonolrwydd gofal plant, er enghraifft, yn rhan hanfodol o bob cynllun addysg Gymraeg. Mae'r rheini yn anstatudol, ond, o fewn y rheini, mae awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod dangos yn hollol amlwg sut mae'r cynlluniau hynny'n bwydo'r system statudol. Mae'r rheini yn fypwyol, hefyd, o sir i sir—y cyfraniad hynny i'r cynlluniau. Mae yna rai sydd yn amlwg yn gweithredu yn arbennig o dda ac yn cydgysylltu â'r partneriaid cymunedol sydd o'u cwmpas nhw. Rwy'n credu y gallwch chi edrych ar enghreifftiau, yn enwedig—. Rwy'n dod o Gasnewydd, ac mae'r pwyllgor plant a phobl ifanc yn bwydo yn helaeth iawn i'r cynlluniau addysg Gymraeg yn fanna. Ond, eto, mympwyol yw e ar draws Cymru.

Ms Maher: Of course. But there is a need to look at how we plan Welsh-medium education innovatively, and we need to look at how we feed the statutory system, therefore. We can't rely entirely on children reaching the nursery classes from one place. The plans—what are they called? The feasibility studies on childcare are an essential part of each Welsh-medium scheme. They are non-statutory, but, within those, local authorities have to show clearly how those plans are feeding the statutory system. Those also vary from county to county, regarding the contribution to the plans. There are some that are clearly operating especially well and collaborating with local partners around them. I think you could look at examples—. I come from Newport, and the children and young people committee feeds quite extensively into the Welsh-medium plans there. But, again, it is arbitrary across Wales.

10:15

[39] Ond nid yn unig Dechrau'n Deg—buaswn i hefyd yn sôn am raglenni Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf a Chymunedau'n Gyntaf, er enghraifft, lle mae yna gyfle o fewn y rhaglenni polisi hyn i sicrhau bod rheini yn cyfrannu mewn rhyw fodd neu'i gilydd tuag at gynlluniau addysg Gymraeg.

[40] **Simon Thomas:** Ac o gofio holl rychwant y gweithgarwch sydd yn ymwneud â theuluoedd a'r iaith, ac ati, yn y cyd-destun yna, a ydych chi, serch hynny, yn meddwl bod potensial gan y cynlluniau Cymraeg mewn addysg i wireddu'r targedau pe byddant yn cael eu gweithredu?

[41] **Ms Maher:** Heb os nac oni bai.

[42] **Ms Owen:** Yn bendant, heb amheuaeth, rwy'n meddwl.

[43] **Simon Thomas:** So, mae dal gyda chi ffydd yn y posibiliad yn y system. Y feirniadaeth yw'r ffordd maen nhw wedi cael eu gweithredu mewn ffordd wahanol ar lefel awdurdodau lleol.

[44] **Ms Owen:** Ie. Hynny yw, mae gennym gyfundrefn newydd, ond, ar hyn o bryd, nid wyf yn credu bod y gyfundrefn honno yn cyflawni beth yr ydym am ei weld. Hynny yw, rwy'n credu fod yna ddiffyg dannedd gan y gyfundrefn—mae'n siŵr y byddwn yn trafod hynny yn fanylach nes ymlaen. Mae yna ddiffyg, o bosib, dealltwriaeth, diffyg perchnogaeth leol, diffyg cydgysylltu strategol â pholisïau a strategaethau eraill, fel bod y cynllun strategol wedyn yn erfyn i wthio nid jest cynyddu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg—ond mae yna botensial i sawl peth arall hefyd o'i wneud o'n gywir.

[45] I gyfeirio at Dechrau'n Deg yn benodol, mi fyddai RhAG yn dadlau bod agenda'r rhaglen honno yn—bod angen rhoi pwys aruthrol ar y rhaglen honno o ran y potensial mae'n ei gynnig o ehangu'r rhaglen sydd wedi digwydd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac, o bosib, sydd yn mynd i barhau. Mae gennym rai siroedd fel Merthyr lle mae hyd at 90 i 95 y cant o'r sir yn ardal Dechrau'n Deg, ond, o'i gymharu hynny wedyn efo lefel ddarpariaeth a nifer y lleoedd

But not only Flying Start—I would also mention the Families First and Communities First programmes, for example, where there is an opportunity within these policy programmes to ensure that those contribute in some way or other towards Welsh-medium education plans.

Simon Thomas: And given the whole range of activities related to families and language, and so forth, in that context, do you, however, believe that the WESPs do have the potential to achieve or attain the targets if they were implemented?

Ms Maher: Without doubt.

Ms Owen: Definitely, without doubt, I think so.

Simon Thomas: So, you still have faith in the possibility in the system. The criticism is the way in which they've been implemented in different ways at local authority level.

Ms Owen: Yes. That is, we have a new regime, but, at the moment, I don't think that that regime is achieving what we want to see. That is, I think that there is a lack of teeth in the system—I'm sure we will be discussing that in more detail later. There is a lack of understanding, possibly, a lack of local ownership, a lack of strategic co-ordination with other policies and strategies, so that the strategic plan then is there to push not only increasing Welsh-medium education—but there is potential for a number of other things in doing it correctly.

To refer to Flying Start specifically, RhAG would argue that the agenda of that programme is—that there is a need to place a great emphasis on that programme in terms of the potential it offers of expanding the programme that has happened over the last years, and, possibly, is going to continue. We have some counties such as Merthyr where up to 90 to 95 per cent of the county is a Flying Start area, but, if you compare that then with the level of provision and the

cyfrwng Cymraeg, mae'n druenus o isel. Felly, sut yn y byd mae modd cyflawni targed deiliant 1 os nad ydym yn bwydo a chynyddu o'r pwynt cyswllt cyntaf yna, a fydd, i nifer o deuluoedd mewn ardal diffreintiedig fel Merthyr, dywedwn ni, yn ddarpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg? Os nad ydy'r lleoedd hynny yn rhai cyfrwng Cymraeg ac os nad ydyn nhw ar y stepen drws, fel y maen nhw o ran darpariaeth cyfrwng Saesneg, fyddwn ni byth yn medru cyflawni'r targedau. Mi fyddwn ni hefyd yn anfantaisio teuluoedd ar sail eu safle a eu statws economaidd o ran cael mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac mae hwnnw, rwy'n meddwl, yn rwystr mae'n rhaid i ni ddechrau ei daclo, a Dechrau'n Deg, rwy'n credu, ydy'r ffordd amlycaf o wneud hynny.

[46] **Ann Jones:** Keith.

[47] **Keith Davies:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Fel un sydd wedi bod yn ymladd dros addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg am dros 50 mlynedd, siŵr o fod, nawr—rwy'n cofio ymladd â'r cyfarwyddwr addysg yng Nghaerdydd amser oedd fy nghrwtyn hynaf i yn bedair mlwydd oed. Yn y pen draw, rwy'n croesawu'r WESPs—rwy'n credu ei fod e'n gam ymlaen ar beth sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Rwyf eisiau gofyn cwpwl o gwestiynau ar yr awdurdodau lleol. Yn eich tystiolaeth, roedd rhywbeth arall roeddwn i'n groesawu'n fawr iawn—rydych yn sôn am fynd nôl i wyth neu naw o awdurdodau lleol; rydych yn cefnogi hynny, ac roeddwn i'n meddwl 'ie', oherwydd roedd pethau'n rhwyddach mewn ffordd pan mai dim ond wyth awdurdod lleol oedd â chyfrifoldeb am addysg Gymraeg, ac roeddwn i'n gweld hynny lawer yn rhwyddach. Ond mae cwpwl o bethau rydych yn sôn amdanynt fan hyn. Un o'r pethau yw: a ydyn nhw yn ymateb—. Nid wyf eisiau sôn am y strategaeth a'r targedau—mae'r rheini yn mynd i ddod yn y pen draw, gobeithio, ond a yw'r awdurdodau nawr yn ymateb i'r galw am addysg Gymraeg? Nid y targedau, ond, os oes rhiant eisiau plentyn gael addysg Gymraeg, a yw'r awdurdodau yn ymateb i'r galw yna?

[48] **Ms Maher:** Mae'n lun amrywiol ar draws Cymru gyfan. Mewn rhai—. Mae'n dibynnu ar beth yw 'ymateb i'r galw'. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, nag ydyn—mae'n hollol—.

number of Welsh-medium places, it is very low. So, how on earth can we achieve the outcome 1 target if we aren't feeding and increasing from that first contact point, which will, for a number of families in an disadvantaged area such as Merthyr, let's say, be Flying Start provision? If those places are not Welsh-medium and if they're not on the doorstep, as they are in terms of English-medium provision, we'll never be able to achieve the targets. We will also be disadvantaging families according to their economic position and status in terms of access to Welsh-medium education, and that, I think, is a barrier we need to start to address, and Flying Start, I believe, is the most obvious way of doing so.

Keith Davies: Thank you, Chair. As one who has been fighting for Welsh-medium education for over 50 years now, I'm sure—I remember fighting with the director of education in Cardiff when my eldest son was four years old. Ultimately, I welcome WESPs—I think it is a step forward on what has been happening in the past. I have a few questions on the local authorities. In your evidence, there was something else that I very much welcomed—you mentioned going back to about eight or nine local authorities; you support that, and I thought 'yes', because things were easier in a way when there were only eight local authorities with responsibility for Welsh-medium education, and I saw that as much easier. But there are a couple of things you mention here. One of the things is: do they respond—. I don't want to talk about the strategy and the targets—those will be achieved ultimately, hopefully, but are authorities now responding to the demand for Welsh-medium education? Not the targets, but, if a parent wants a child to have Welsh-medium education, are the authorities responding to that demand?

Ms Maher: The picture varies across the whole of Wales. In some—. It depends on what you mean by 'responding to the demand'. In some areas, no—it is

Mewn rhai ardaloedd, er enghraifft, Castell Nedd Port Talbot, nid ydym weld gweld twf o gwbl yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

[49] **Keith Davies:** Nid wyf yn sôn am dwf nawr—rwy'n gofyn am ymateb i'r galw. Mae yna wahaniaeth.

[50] **Ms Owen:** Fel yr oedd Elin yn ei ddweud, mae'r darlun yn gymysg ac yn amrywiol iawn ledled y wlad, ac, wrth gwrs, mae pob awdurdod lleol yn cychwyn o fan cychwyn gwahanol o ran niferoedd ysgolion, pa mor agos ydy'r darpariaethau hynny at gymunedau, ac yn y blaen. Rwy'n meddwl hefyd bod yna gwestiwn ynghlwm â hyn o ran natur ieithyddol y ddarpariaeth a dehongliad siroedd o beth ydy ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mewn sawl ardal, mae yna ddadleuon ynghylch hynny. Er enghraifft, yn sir Gâr, mae RhAG wedi cefnogi teuluoedd sydd wedi bod yn brwydro i gael mynediad at ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg, hynny yw, categori A, ond bod y sir o bosib yn dadlau bod ysgol categori B gyfystyr â'r ddarpariaeth y byddai rhywun yn medru ei gael mewn ysgol categori A. Felly, mae yna ddadleuon felly hefyd ynghlwm o safbwynt y galw a dehongliad y sir o beth ydy natur y ddarpariaeth honno y dylai rhiant fod yn medru cael mynediad ati hefyd.

[51] **Keith Davies:** Felly, beth yw'ch ymateb chi nawr i'r cynlluniau yn Llanelli? Yn Llanelli nawr, mae yna dair ysgol gynradd Gymraeg. Mae nhw'n sôn am adeiladu ysgol gynradd newydd, ble mae dwy ysgol Saesneg yn dod at ei gilydd, ond, yn yr ysgol newydd, mae nhw'n dweud y bydd ffrwd Gymraeg a ffrwd Saesneg. A ydych chi'n cytuno â hynny neu beidio?

[52] **Ms Owen:** Mae polisi RhAG wedi esblygu a symud ymlaen o unedau cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac rwy'n meddwl y byddai symud yn ôl at hynny yn gam yn ôl. Mae RhAG wastad wedi dadlau mai ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn eu iawn bwyll, hynny yw, ysgolion annibynnol, fel y byddai rhywun yn cael ysgol cyfrwng Saesneg annibynnol, sydd yn ddelfrydol, er mwyn gwarchod statws, natur a chymeriad ieithyddol yr ysgol honno, a medru cyflawni y broses o drochi, sef beth a ddylai fod yn digwydd mewn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mewn darpariaeth lle mae

completely—. In some areas such as Neath Port Talbot, for example, we have seen no growth in those areas.

Keith Davies: I'm not talking about growth here—I'm talking about meeting demand. There's a difference.

Ms Owen: As Elin said, it's a very mixed and varied picture throughout the country, and, of course, each local authority is starting from a different starting point in terms of numbers of schools, how close that provision is to communities, and so on. I think there's also a question implicit in this in terms of the linguistic nature of the provision and counties' interpretation of what a Welsh-medium school is. In many areas, there are arguments about that. For example, in Carmarthenshire, RhAG has supported families who have been fighting for access to a Welsh-medium school, that is, a category A school, but the county would possibly argue that a category B school would provide Welsh-medium provision equivalent to that which would be available in a category A school. So, there are arguments such as those also in terms of the demand and the county's interpretation of the nature of the provision that parents should be able to access also.

Keith Davies: So, what is your response now to the plans in Llanelli? In Llanelli now, there are three Welsh-medium primary schools. They're talking about building a new primary school, where two English-medium schools will come together, but, in the new school, they say there will be a Welsh stream and an English stream. Do you agree with that or not?

Ms Owen: RhAG's policy has evolved and moved on from Welsh language units, and I think moving back to that would be a retrograde step. RhAG has always argued that Welsh-medium schools, that is, independent schools, as one would have an independent English-medium school, are the ideal, in terms of protecting the linguistic status, nature and character of that school, and being able to achieve the process of immersion, which is what should be happening in a Welsh-medium school. In provision where there are two streams that

dwy ffrwd, mae'n bosib bod hynny yn fwy heriol. Rwy'n fodlon derbyn bod enghreifftiau ledled y wlad lle mae hynny yn digwydd yn llwyddiannus iawn, ond mae hynny lawr i un unigolyn, sef pennaeth sy'n medru rheoli hynny yn llwyddiannus. Ac, o bosib, rydym ni'n mynd lawr llwybr llithrig o ddilyn polisi felly lle nad oes sicrwydd neu warant bod hynny yn mynd i fod yn sicrwydd i'r hirdymor. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod angen bod yn wylidwrus. O bosib, mewn rhai mannau yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n bolisi neu'r unig ffordd ymlaen, ond rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n deg i ddweud bod RhAG yn eirioli ac yn cefnogi sefydlu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg annibynnol.

[53] **Keith Davies:** Rwy'n derbyn hynny, ond, yn eich tystiolaeth chi, rydych yn sôn bod ambell i awdurdod, oherwydd diffyg cyllid, yn ffael ymateb. Yn Llanelli nawr, er enghraifft, mae'r sir newydd wario £15 miliwn ar adeiladu ysgol Gymraeg newydd yn Ffwrnais, ac efallai taw'r rheswm am yr ysgol newydd hwn y bydd dau ffrwd yno yw oherwydd diffyg cyllid. So, sawl awdurdod, yn eich barn chi, sy'n ffael ateb y galw oherwydd cyllid, achos mae cynllun ysgolion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain gennym nawr?

[54] **Ms Maher:** Yn anffodus hefyd, dim ond hyn a hyn sydd ym mhot yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ac mae pot yr unfed ganrif ar hugain wedi cael ei bennu ers nifer o flynyddoedd erbyn hyn o ran y gwariant. Felly, o ran unrhyw beth sydd o fewn y cynlluniau addysg Gymraeg, a hefyd unrhyw dwf sydd angen digwydd ac unrhyw adeiladu sydd yn gorfod digwydd y mae angen arian cyfalaf ar eu cyfer, wel nad oes cyfle yn mynd i fod i wneud hynny. Er hynny, er ein bod ni yn sôn am ddiffyg arian, rydym hefyd yn teimlo efallai nad dim ond arian sydd yn mynd i wireddu rhai agweddau ar y cynlluniau. Mae modd edrych ar ffyrdd amgen, er enghraifft, dosbarthiadau cychwynnol. Rydym wedi gweld enghreifftiau ar draws Cymru, yn ddiweddar yn y de-ddwyrain, lle mae dosbarthiadau cychwynnol. Dim ond cyfalaf ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf o reidrwydd, ac yna adeiladu blwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, sydd ei angen ar gyfer ysgolion felly. Mae modd ei wneud e. Nid dim ond arian a chyfalaf ar gyfer ysgol gyfan sydd ei angen ar gyfer rhai

may be more challenging. I'm willing to accept that there are examples the length and breadth of the country where that does happen very successfully, but that is down to one individual, namely a head who can manage that successfully. And we may be going down a slippery slope in adopting such a policy where there is no certainty or guarantee that that will be assured for the longer term. So, I think that we need to be a little guarded. Possibly, in parts of Wales, that is the policy or the only way forward, but I do think it's fair to say that RhAG would advocate and support establishing independent Welsh-medium schools.

Keith Davies: I accept that, but, in your evidence, you talk about the fact that some authorities, because of a lack of funding, cannot respond. In Llanelli now, for example, the authority has just spent £15 million on building a Welsh-medium school in Furnace, and perhaps the reason for this new school that will have two streams is because of insufficient funding. So, how many authorities, in your view, can't meet the demand because of funding, because we have the twenty-first century schools scheme now?

Ms Maher: Unfortunately also, there is only so much money in the twenty-first century schools pot, and the twenty-first century schools pot has been allocated for a number of years now in terms of the expenditure. So, in terms of anything within the WESPs, and also any growth that needs to happen and any construction that has to happen and requires capital investment, well, there is not going to be an opportunity to do that. Despite that, although we are talking about a shortage of funds, we also feel that it's not simply a matter of funding that will achieve some aspects of the WESPs. We can look at alternative ways, for example, starter classes. We have seen examples across Wales, recently in the south east, where there are starter classes. It is only capital for the first year necessarily, and then building year-on-year, that's required for such schools. So, it can be achieved. It's not just funding and capital investment for a whole school that's required in terms of certain aspects too. We do need to look more practically at this, and more widely, and think outside the box. Very

agweddau hefyd. Mae angen edrych yn fwy ymarferol ac yn fwy eang, ac edrych mas o'r boes. Yn aml iawn, ni sydd yn dod â'r syniadau yma i awdurdodau lleol, lle nad ydyn nhw wedi meddwl amdanynt o'r blaen.

[55] Ar y nodyn yna, rydym yn bryderus am y capasiti mewnol. Oherwydd bod swyddogion awdurdodau lleol erbyn hyn wedi crebachu o ran eu niferoedd, rydym yn bryderus iawn am allu awdurdodau lleol i gynllunio'n fwriadus ar gyfer addysg Gymraeg. Yn ogystal, pan fo cyfle'n dod, a phan fo yna darged, hyd yn oed, yn cael ei sefydlu, rydym yn pryderu am allu awdurdodau lleol i fedru cynllunio'n fwriadus hefyd.

[56] **Keith Davies:** Ond, wedyn, roedd Ceri'n sôn am ysgolion Cymraeg, ac rwy'n derbyn hynny, ond mae yna ddwy ysgol gyfun nawr yn sir Gâr nad ydyn nhw'n ysgolion cyfun Cymraeg wedi penderfynu eu bod nhw'n mynd i gael ffrwd Gymraeg yna, un yn Llandeilo, yn Nhre-gib, ac un yn Llanelli, ym Mryngwyn. A ych chi'n cefnogi hynny? Achos, os oes diffyg cyllid gyda'r awdurdod, y ffaith yw bod y penaethiaid a'r llywodraethwyr yn ddwy ysgol hyn yn cynnig mwy o addysg Gymraeg yn yr ardaloedd.

[57] **Ms Owen:** I fod yn glir, mae RhAG yn cefnogi pob ymdrech i symud pob ysgol yng Nghymru ar hyd y continwmm a chynnyddu lefel y ddarpariaeth a chyfleoedd i bob disgybl gael y gyfran helaethaf posib o'u haddysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Wrth gwrs, mae angen bod yn realistig o ran sut i wneud hynny, ac mae angen i bob ysgol unigol wedyn gael amserlen ar sut i symud yr ysgol ar hyd y continwmm hwnnw. Ond rwy'n meddwl hefyd bod rhaid inni fod yn onest â ni ein hunain ac â'r rhieni o ran beth ydy natur y ddarpariaeth honno a beth fydd y deilliannau ieithyddol a fydd yn dod yn sgil hynny, ac mae RhAG yn dadlau, ac mae'r Llywodraeth ei hun yn derbyn yn y strategaeth, mai'r unig ffordd lwyddiannus o sicrhau bod gan ddisgybl lefel hyfedredd gyfartal yn y ddwy iaith ydy trwy drochi a thrwy addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, mae angen bod yn onest trwy wneud hynny efo'r rhieni.

often, it's ourselves who bring these ideas to the local authorities, where they haven't really considered them in the past.

On that point, we are concerned about the internal capacity. Because local authority officers have been reduced in number, we are very concerned about the capacity of local authorities to plan strategically for Welsh-medium education. In addition, when there is an opportunity available, and when a target, even, is put in place, we are concerned about the capacity of local authorities to be able to plan properly as well.

Keith Davies: But, then, Ceri was talking about Welsh-medium schools, and I accept that, but there are two comprehensive schools in Carmarthenshire that have now decided that they are going to have a Welsh stream, one in Llandeilo, in Tre-gib, and one in Llanelli, in Bryngwyn. Do you support that? Because, if the authority has insufficient funding, the fact is that the heads and the governors in these two schools are offering more Welsh-medium education in these areas.

Ms Owen: To be clear, RhAG supports every effort to move any school in Wales along the continuum and to enhance the level of provision and opportunities for all pupils to have the greatest possible proportion of their education through the medium of Welsh. Of course, we need to be realistic about how we do that, and every individual school has to have a timetable for how they move their school along that continuum. But I also think that we have to be honest with ourselves and with parents about what the nature of that provision is and what linguistic outcomes will emerge from that, and RhAG argues, and the Government itself has accepted in the strategy, that the only successful way of ensuring that a pupil has equal skill levels in both languages is through immersion and through Welsh-medium education. So, we need to be honest with parents in doing that.

[58] **Keith Davies:** Ie, ond y rhieni a fydd yn dewis yn y pen draw. Os ych chi'n dod o deulu Cymraeg yn ardal Llandeilo, bydd dewis gyda chi pa un ai mynd i ffrwd yn ysgol Tre-gib ai mynd i Ysgol Bro Myrddin.

Keith Davies: Yes, but the parents will be the ones choosing in the end. If you come from a Welsh-speaking family in the Llandeilo area, you'd be able to choose whether to go to a stream in Tre-gib or to go to Bro Myrddin.

[59] **Ms Owen:** Wrth gwrs, mae'r dewis yna i bawb, ac mae angen mwy o'r dewis yna, ond beth ydw i'n ei ddadlau ydy bod angen bod yn onest o ran deilliannau ieithyddol mynd i'r gwahanol ddarpariaethau ieithyddol hynny felly.

Ms Owen: Of course, that option is available, and we need more of that, but what I'm saying is that we need to be honest about the linguistic outcomes of going to those different sorts of linguistic provision,

[60] **Keith Davies:** Y cwestiwn oddi wrthyf i wedyn yw ar y fforwm addysg Gymraeg. Yn ôl yn amser Morgannwg Ganol, byddai swyddogion y cyngor sir yn cwrdd â RhAG bob tymor, ac roedd e o werth oherwydd roeddech chi'n gallu dweud wrthym ni ble oedd y galw a ble y dylem ni fod yn edrych ar bethau. Sut y mae'r rhai sydd nawr wedi cael eu sefydlu yn gweithio? A oes un ym mhob sir, ac a ydyn nhw'n cwrdd â'r swyddogion yn aml?

Keith Davies: My final question relates to the Welsh in education forums. Back in the time of Mid Glamorgan, the county council's officials would meet RhAG every term, and it was valuable because you could tell us where the demand was and where we should be looking at things. How do the ones that have been established now operate? Is there one in every county, and do they meet officials regularly?

[61] **Ms Maher:** Eto, mae'r llun cenedlaethol yn ddarniog. Mae yna rai siroedd lle mae fforymau addysg Gymraeg wedi cael eu sefydlu, ac maen nhw'n cwrdd yn dda iawn. Rwy'n credu mai dim ond un enghraifft sydd gyda ni o fforwm rhanbarthol, lle mae fforwm y rhanbarth, consortiwm addysg Gymraeg y ddeddwyrain, o dan y GCA. Felly, mae gyda ni orolwg ar draws siroedd Gwent i gyd. Ond, fel yr wyf yn ei ddweud, mae'r llun yn ddarniog iawn ar draws Cymru. Mae ambell sir lle nad yw'r fforymau yn cwrdd o gwbl, neu ddim yn ddigon aml, ac felly wedi colli'r cyfle i ddod â phartneriaid a chael y mewnbwn gan y gwahanol agweddau, oddi wrth yr ochr broffesiynol academaidd, o ran y penaethiaid, sy'n fewnbwn hollbwysig i'r cynlluniau yma, a hefyd o ran y cymunedau, oddi wrth y mentrau iaith, oddi wrth y Mudiad Meithrin a'r holl bartneriaid sydd ynghlwm, ac, yn hynny o beth, y cyfle i siarad â rhaglenni Dechrau'n Deg, ac â rhaglenni Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf. Felly, yn anffodus, nid oes yna ddim cysondeb ar draws Cymru o'n profiad ni, ac ym ni yn ceisio, fel RhAG, fod yna gynrychiolydd o RhAG yn eistedd ym mhob fforwm fel ym ni'n gallu. Fel arfer, rhieni leol ydyn nhw.

Ms Maher: Again, at a national level, things are patchy. There are some counties where the Welsh in education forums have been established, and they meet regularly. I think we have only one example of a regional forum, where the Welsh language education consortium in the south-east has been established. Therefore we have an overview of the counties of all of Gwent. But, as I say, it's very patchy on a national level; there are some counties where the forums haven't met at all, or not often enough, and so they have missed the opportunity to get the partners together and get the input from the various stakeholders, from the professional academic side, in terms of the headteachers, which is a crucial input for these plans, and also from the point of view of communities, from the mentrau iaith, Mudiad Meithrin, and all the different partners who are involved, and, in that regard, it's an opportunity to converse with Flying Start and Families First. So, unfortunately, there is no consistency across Wales in our experience, and, as RhAG, we seek to ensure that a representative of RhAG sits on all forums. Usually, they would be local parents.

[62] **Keith Davies:** Ie, wrth gwrs.

Keith Davies: Yes, of course.

[63] **Ms Owen:** Rwy'n meddwl, jest i ychwanegu fanna hefyd, mae yna gwestiwn o safbwynt perchnogaeth leol y fforymau hyn, ac rwy'n credu bod y Gweinidog ei hun wedi datgan yn y Siambr bod y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw yn gorwedd gyda phob awdurdod lleol yn unigol—hynny yw, sut maen nhw'n mynd ati i drefnu'r fforwm a sut mae'r fforwm hwnnw'n gweithredu o ran aelodaeth ac yn y blaen. Ond mae'r cwestiwn yma o berchnogaeth leol yn bwysig, rwy'n credu, o safbwynt y rhanddeiliaid sy'n bwydo i mewn i hwnnw. Hynny yw, nid jest cynllun yr awdurdod lleol a'r swyddogion ydy o; mae'n gynllun sy'n cynrychioli ymdrechion holl fudiadau ac asiantaethau'r rhanddeiliaid sy'n bwydo i mewn i hynny, gan gynnwys Mudiad Meithrin ac yn y blaen. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod angen, yn sicr, i'r fforymau fod ar sail statudol—rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n fwlch ar hyn o bryd—ac efallai fod yna rôl graffu a monitro mwy cadarn a rhagweithiol gan y fforymau hynny, a bod angen sylfaen gadarnach i hynny ddigwydd.

Ms Owen: I think, just to add there as well, there is a question about local ownership of these forums, and I think the Minister himself has stated in the Chamber that that responsibility lies with each local authority—that is, how they go about arranging the forum and how the forum operates in terms of membership and so on. But this question of local ownership is important, I think, in terms of the stakeholders that feed into that. That is, it's not just the plan of the local authority and officials; it's a plan that represents the efforts of all the agencies and organisations and stakeholders that feed into that, including Mudiad Meithrin and so on. Therefore, I think that there is a need, certainly, for the forums to be on a statutory basis—I think there is a gap there at the moment—and perhaps there is a more robust and proactive scrutiny and monitoring role for the forums, and that there's a need for a more robust foundation for that to happen.

10:30

[64] Rwy'n credu bod yna ormod o bwyslais ar broses yn lle deilliannau ar hyn o bryd, a'i fod o'n fwy o ymarferiad tic yn y bocs, a bod y fforymau'n cwrdd yn chwarterol. Ond, a oes yna wir ddeiliant neu werth yn dod o hynny? Mae hynny'n gwestiwn. Rwy'n meddwl bod angen inni edrych ar hynny ar fyrder er mwyn sicrhau bod y cynlluniau strategol wedyn yn gweithio fel trefn newydd yn llawer gwell. Rwy'n meddwl bod y fforymau'n allwedd i gyflawni hynny.

I think there is too much emphasis on process rather than outcomes at the moment, and perhaps it is more of a box-ticking exercise, and that the forums meet quarterly. But, is there really an outcome or value coming out of that? That is a question. I think we need to look at that with some urgency in order to ensure that the strategic plans then work in a new way that is much better. I think the forums are key to achieving that.

[65] **Ms Maher:** Mi fyddai'n ddiddorol gweld a ydy'r cynlluniau sydd i'w gweld yn rhai gwell, a ydy'r fforymau hynny'n cwrdd, beth yw patrwm y fforymau hynny, ac a oes yna gysylltiad.

Ms Maher: It would be interesting to see whether the plans that are seen are more effective, whether those forums do meet, what the patterns are, and whether there is that interrelationship.

[66] **Ms Owen:** Mi fyddwn i'n dadlau, lle mae gennym gynlluniau cryfach, a lle mae'r cynlluniau drafft a gyflwynwyd yn gyntaf yn gryfach, fod y fforymau a weithiodd ar y rheini ac sydd wedi bwydo i mewn i'r broses honno'n gweithredu'n well. Rwy'n meddwl

Ms Owen: I would argue, where you have the stronger plans, and where the draft plans that were initially presented are stronger, that the forums that worked on those and fed into that process do work more effectively. I think there is a pattern emerging.

bod yna batrwm i'w weld.

[67] **Keith Davies:** Iawn. Diolch.

Keith Davies: Right. Thank you.

[68] **Ann Jones:** We're half way through the session, and we're only on the first section, and I've still got Simon and Aled to finish this section off. So, can we sort of try and be quick, so that we get through all of them.

[69] **Simon Thomas:** Rwy'n credu ein bod ni wedi cyfro rhai o'r pethau, a fydd yn arbed amser yn nes ymlaen, efallai.

Simon Thomas: I think we have covered some of the things, which will save time later, perhaps.

[70] Roeddech chi jest yn cyffwrdd ar un peth roeddwn eisiau gofyn. Roeddech yn sôn am un ardal lle mae fforymau rhanbarthol yn gweithio. Wrth gwrs, yn y ddeddfwriaeth, nid oedd opsiwn ond rhoi'r ddyletswydd yn statudol ar yr endid statudol, sef yr awdurdod lleol. Ond, yn ymarferol, gan drïo edrych tuag at sut y gall hwn ddatblygu, ydych yn gweld mai cynllunio rhanbarthol gyda'r consortia sydd, yn y pen draw, yn mynd i ateb y broblem yma, achos fe gododd Keith y pwynt fod gennych ddarlun eithaf darniog ar lawr gwlad? Mewn unrhyw ysgol, gall y pennaeth a'r bwrdd llywodraethol benderfynu cyflwyno addysg Gymraeg unrhyw bryd maen nhw'n moyn. Ond nid yw hynny o reidrwydd wedyn yn rhan o batrwm cynllunio gofalus dros y sir, ac yn sicr ddim dros y rhanbarth. Mae'r pethau yma'n codi fel grawn unnos, ac maen nhw'n gallu mynd hefyd. A oes arwyddion y gallai cynllunio rhanbarthol fod o gymorth fan hyn?

You just touched on one thing that I wanted to ask. You mentioned one area where regional forums are in operation. Of course, in the legislation, there was no option but to place the statutory responsibility on the statutory authority, namely the local authority. But, on a practical level, and in looking at how this could develop for the future, do you believe that regional planning with the consortia will, ultimately, actually solve this problem, because Keith raised the point, you do have a patchy picture on the ground? In any one school, the head and governing body can decide to introduce Welsh-medium education whenever they want. But that's not part of strategic planning over a county, and certainly not over a whole region. These things do emerge very quickly and they can disappear very quickly. So, are there signs that regional planning could be of assistance here?

[71] **Ms Maher:** I roi cyd-destun pam sefydlwyd yr un rhanbarthol yn ein hardal ni, roedd hynny'n fwy na dim oherwydd mai dwy ysgol uwchradd sy'n gwasanaethu'r rhanbarth cyfan. Felly, roedd o fantais i ni fod y consortia wedi dod i'r fei er mwyn sicrhau bod safonau ar draws Cymru yn codi ac yn cael eu cysoni. Felly, roeddwn yn awyddus iawn i wneud yr ymarferiad hwnnw'n lleol ac i glystyru ein rhanbarth. Rwy'n credu bod gwerth i'w wneud yn rhanbarthol. Byddai angen i'r fforwm hwnnw, rwy'n teimlo, fod yn fwy strategol hefyd. Mae Ceri wedi sôn am graffu. Rwy'n credu bod angen i'r rôl graffu fod yn fwy er mwyn gallu cysoni'r holl awdurdodau lleol gyda'i gilydd. Ond hefyd, yn y pen draw, rwy'n dal i gredu bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod y lefel lleol yn cael ei gwneud a bod yr gweddau llai yn iawn ac yn eu lle. Wrth i'r

Ms Maher: To place it in context, why the regional one was established in our area, it was because there are only two comprehensive schools serving the whole region. Therefore, it was advantageous for us that the consortia had come into existence to ensure that standards across Wales were rising and being made consistent. We were very keen, therefore, to do that exercise on a local level and cluster our region. I think there is a value in doing so on a regional level. There would be a need for that forum to be, I feel, more strategic as well. Ceri has spoken about a scrutiny role. I think there is a need for a greater scrutiny role so that we can ensure that local authorities are standardised. But also, we still need to ensure that the local level exists and that those smaller aspects are right and in place. With those in place, there is more hope, then, for the regional aspect to

agweddau llai fod yn eu lle, mae mwy o obaith wedyn i'r agwedd ranbarthol fod yn ei lle yn ogystal.

[72] **Ms Owen:** Rwy'n meddwl bod angen mwy o eglurder. Hynny yw, rydym yn symud rŵan tuag at newid chwyldroadol o safbwynt ad-drefnu siroedd. Pwy a ŵyr beth ddaw yn y blynyddoedd nesaf. Ond, wrth gwrs, rhaid inni weithio rŵan efo'r drefn sydd gennym. Rwy'n credu bod rhaid i bob sir gael perchnogaeth leol o'i chynllun strategol, ond bod hynny'n bwydo i mewn i haen ranbarthol uwch. Achos, wrth gwrs, o safbwynt addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, mewn nifer o ardaloedd, gan gynnwys y de-ddwyrain, mae nifer o elfennau, fel addysg uwchradd, yn gorfod gweithredu ar sail rhyng-sirol.

[73] **Simon Thomas:** Mae'n drawsffiniol, ydy.

[74] **Ms Owen:** Felly, rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn beth iach ac yn beth doeth, yn strategol, fod hynny yn digwydd, ond bod cydblethu agos rhwng cyfrifoldebau a'n bod ni'n ymwybodol ac yn glir am le mae'r cyfrifoldebau hynny'n gorwedd ar wahanol agweddau—ai'n lleol, ai'n rhanbarthol, neu'r ddau—a bod eglurder er mwyn sicrhau nad ydym yn disgyn rhwng dwy stôl a'n bod ni ddim yn cyflawni dim byd o gwbl.

[75] **Ann Jones:** Aled.

[76] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf jest eisiau gofyn, ar weithredu'n rhanbarthol, mae'r Gweinidog wedi awgrymu'n ddiweddar bod rôl i'r consortia i fonitro sut mae'r cynlluniau hyn yn cael eu gweithredu. A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o unrhyw weithredu o ran y consortia ar fonitro?

[77] **Ms Maher:** Mae'r fforwm rhanbarthol yma yn y de-ddwyrain, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw ranbarth arall sydd yn gwneud yn yr un modd.

[78] **Ms Owen:** Nid wyf i chwaith. Rwy'n credu bod gwersi i'w dysgu o'r model sydd wedi'i fabwysiadu a'i sefydlu yn y de-ddwyrain, ac y gallai ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru ddysgu o hynny. Wrth gwrs, mae yna le i wella hefyd yn y de-ddwyrain, onid

be in place also.

Ms Owen: I think we need greater clarity. We're moving now towards a revolutionary change in terms of council reorganisation. Who knows what will emerge over the next few years. But, of course, we have to work with the system we have. I think that every county has to take local ownership of their WESP, but that should then feed into a higher regional level. Because, in terms of Welsh-medium education, in many areas, including the south-east, there are a number of elements, such as secondary education, that do have to work in a cross-county way.

Simon Thomas: It is cross-border, yes.

Ms Owen: So, I think it is wise and strategically important that that happens, but that there should be dovetailing of responsibilities, and that we are clear where those responsibilities lie on different aspects, whether they are local, regional, or both, and that there is that clarity to ensure that we don't fall between two stools and don't achieve anything.

Aled Roberts: I just want to ask, on this regional working, the Minister has suggested recently that there is a role for the consortia to monitor how these plans are implemented. Are you aware of any work on behalf of the consortia on monitoring?

Ms Maher: There is the regional forum in the south-east, but I'm not aware of any other region that works in the same way.

Ms Owen: No, neither am I. I think there are lessons to be learned from the model adopted in the south-east, and other areas of Wales could learn from that. Of course, there is room for improvement in the south-east, too, isn't there? But, at least they have made a

oes? Ond, o leiaf mae yna gychwyn yn y fan honno, a'u bod nhw o bosib yn arwain y ffordd.

start there, and they are perhaps leading the way.

[79] **Aled Roberts:** A gaf hefyd jest ddatblygu beth ofynnodd Keith o ran statws ieithyddol ysgol? Nid oes diffiniad cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd, nag oes, achos rwy'n pryderu am y ffaith fod dogfen wedi cael ei chyhoeddi yn Wrecsam yn ddiweddar, lle nad oes ysgolion dwyieithog yn hanesyddol, ond lle mae pob ysgol erbyn hyn yn cael ei ddynodi un ai'n ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg neu'n ysgol ddwyieithog. Ac mae dysgu i ddweud 'Bore da' yn amlwg, yn nhyb cyngor Wrecsam erbyn hyn, yn ddiffiniad o ysgol ddwyieithog. Felly, a fydddech yn galw am ddiffiniad cenedlaethol?

Aled Roberts: May I just develop what Keith said in terms of the linguistic status of a school? There is no national definition at the moment, is there, because I'm concerned about the fact that a document has been published in Wrexham recently, where there are no bilingual schools, historically, but where every school is designated as either a Welsh-medium school or a bilingual school. And learning how to say 'Bore da', 'Good morning' obviously, in the opinion of Wrexham council by now, is a definition of a bilingual school. Therefore, would you call for a national definition?

[80] **Ms Owen:** Mae hwn yn rhywbeth y mae RhAG wedi bod yn galw amdano ers cychwyn y drafodaeth o alw am strategaeth, ac a dweud y gwir, rwy'n meddwl bod cael y diffiniadau yma yn gywir ac yn eu lle yn garreg sylfaen i weithredu a chyflawni'r strategaeth yn ei hun. Mae gennym ni ar hyn o bryd, os rwy'n gywir i ddweud, ddogfen interim o ran diffiniadau ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, ond dogfen interim ydy hi; mae'n parhau i fod yn ddogfen interim, ac felly mae'n caniatáu gofod i awdurdodau lleol ddehongli beth maen nhw yn ei hystyried i fod yn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg.

Ms Owen: This is something that RhAG has been calling for since the start of the debate on calling for a strategy and, to be honest, I think that getting these definitions correct and in place is a foundation stone for actually implementing and achieving the strategy itself. We have at the moment, I think I'm right in saying, an interim document in terms of definitions of Welsh-medium schools, but it is just an interim document; it is still an interim document, and therefore it allows scope for local authorities to interpret what they believe to be a Welsh-medium school.

[81] **Aled Roberts:** Pryd gafodd honno ei chyhoeddi?

Aled Roberts: When was that published?

[82] **Ms Owen:** Yn 2007-8 o bosib. Ond yn honno, mae yna rhestr—

Ms Owen: In 2007-8 possibly. But in that, there is a list—

[83] **Simon Thomas:** Yn 2008, rwy'n credu.

Simon Thomas: In 2008, I think.

[84] **Ms Owen:** Dyna fo; roeddwn yn agos.

Ms Owen: That's it; I was close.

[85] **Keith Davies:** Ai honno sy'n rhestru A, B, C—

Keith Davies: Is that the one which lists A, B, C—

[86] **Ms Owen:** Dyna fo, ar gyfer cynradd ac uwchradd.

Ms Owen: That's it, for primary and secondary.

[87] **Keith Davies:** Mae honno wedi bod mas ers blynyddoedd.

Keith Davies: That's been around for many years.

[88] **Ms Owen:** Ond o safbwynt yr uwchradd, wedyn, yn benodol, mae'r amwysedd yma yn caniatáu eto'r dehongli a'r ffordd y mae siroedd yn meddwl ac yn caniatáu i ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, yn erbyn ysgolion cyfrwng dwyieithog, gael eu dehongli, ac mae hynny wedyn yn creu amwysedd o safbwynt beth gall rhieni ddisgwyl o safbwynt lefel y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion hynny,

Ms Owen: But in terms of the secondary sector, specifically, this ambiguity allows, again, for that interpretation and the way in which counties think and allow Welsh-medium schools, against bilingual schools, to be interpreted, and that then creates ambiguity in terms of what parents can expect in terms of the level of Welsh-medium provision within those schools.

[89] Felly, i fynd yn ôl at y pwynt—rwy'n parhau rwan—ond mae angen ailedrych ar y ddogfen honno, rwy'n credu, i roi arweiniad a diffiniad clir i siroedd o beth sydd yn ddisgwylieidig ohonyn nhw, a beth ddylen nhw wedyn fod yn ei ddarparu.

To return to the point—I am going on a bit now—there is a need to review that document, I think, to provide clear guidance and definitions to counties in terms of what's expected of them, and what they should then be providing.

[90] **Simon Thomas:** Jest i fod yn glir, mae gennym ni gynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg sy'n statudol, ond nid oes diffiniad statudol o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

Simon Thomas: Just to be clear, we have strategic plans, WESPs, that are statutory, but there is no statutory definition of Welsh-medium education.

[91] **Ms Owen:** Ie, o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, y cart o flaen y ceffyl. [*Chwerthin.*]

Ms Owen: Yes, of Welsh-medium education. So, the cart before the horse. [*Laughter.*]

[92] **Ann Jones:** That's another inquiry for another day.

[93] **Simon Thomas:** Mae cneuen bach yna nawr.

Simon Thomas: There is a small seed there now.

[94] **Ann Jones:** We are now desperately, seriously, going to be running out of time. So, if the question has already been touched upon, we'll look at the evidence afterwards. So, please don't keep going back to it. On assessing and meeting local demand, I've got David and Lynne. Lynne first.

[95] **Lynne Neagle:** Thank you, Ann. Can I just ask about the extent to which the 2011 guidelines are being used by local authorities, given that they predate the statutory basis for WESP, and whether you can maybe give us a flavour of how consistent that is, if that is the case?

[96] **Ms Maher:** Mae'n gwestiwn da, achos nid ydym yn hollol siŵr lle mae pob sir arni o ran mesur y galw, a bod yn onest. Nid ydym yn hollol siŵr pwy sydd wedi mesur y galw yn ddiweddar a phwy sydd ddim. Rydym yn ymwybodol bod y canllawiau wedi cynorthwyo yn bendant rhai siroedd i wneud yr ymarferiad o fesur y galw. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi aros yn slafaidd gyda'r cwestiynau sy'n cael eu rhoi, oherwydd rheini oedd y cwestiynau angenrheidiol i'w gofyn. Rydym wedi gweld

Ms Maher: It's a good question, because we are not quite sure where each county is at in terms of measuring demand, to be honest. We're not quite sure who has measured local demand recently and who hasn't. We are aware that guidance has certainly been of assistance to some authorities to undertake the exercise of measuring demand. Some local authorities have kept slavishly to the questions that have been provided, because those were the questions that needed to be asked. We have seen examples of where local

enghreifftiau o le mae awdurdodau lleol wedi ehangu ac wedi gofyn am fwy o wybodaeth, sydd wastad yn beth da, er mwyn medru cael llun ychydig bach yn gliriach.

authorities have expanded and asked for more information, which is always a good thing, in order to get a picture that is a little clearer.

[97] Mae pwynt ynglŷn ag amseru rhai o'r mesurau hyn hefyd. Roedd un enghraifft lle roedden nhw wedi gwneud yr asesiad dros y Nadolig. Hynny yw, pwysigrwydd gwneud unrhyw fath o ymholiad fel yna yw cael gwybodaeth yn ôl a chael yr wybodaeth orau posib nôl. Felly, rydym wedi gweld gwahanol ffyrdd o fesur y galw yn cael ei wneud; nid oes patrwm pendant. Mae'r wybodaeth sy'n cael ei danfon allan hefyd yn bwysig iawn i ni fel RhAG. Fel rhieni sy'n edych ar ddarpariaeth addysg Gymraeg, am y tro cyntaf efallai, sydd heb glywed am addysg Gymraeg o gwbl, mae cael llythyr drwy'r post yn gofyn, 'Ydych chi wedi meddwl am addysg Gymraeg i'ch plentyn?', heb unrhyw fath o wybodaeth i gefnogi hynny, i ni, yn hollol ddibwynt. Mae angen rhoi'r cyd-destun ac mae angen rhoi gwybodaeth ychwanegol. Felly, rwy'n credu, o'n rhan ni, ein bod ni wedi helpu ac rydym yn ddiolchgar iawn i nifer o grwpiau cymunedol, er enghraifft, Cronfa Glyndŵr, sydd wedi cynorthwyo nifer o awdurdodau lleol a nifer o grwpiau RhAG ar draws Cymru i fedru cyllido deunyddiau i roi'r wybodaeth honno allan i'r rhieni ar yr un adeg.

There is a point about the timing of some of these assessments as well. There was one example where they had undertaken the assessment over the Christmas period. That is, the importance of making any sort of inquiry such as that is to get information back and to get the best possible information back. Therefore, we've seen different means of assessing the demand; there is no definite pattern. The information that is sent out is also very important to us as RhAG. As parents who are looking at Welsh-medium provision in education, for the first time perhaps, who haven't heard about Welsh-medium education at all, receiving a letter through the post stating, 'Have you thought of Welsh-medium education for your child?', without any kind of information supporting that, to us, is totally pointless. There is a need to provide the context and a need to provide additional information. Therefore, I think, for our part, that we have helped, and we are very grateful to a number of community groups, such as Cronfa Glyndŵr, which has assisted a number of local authorities and a number of RhAG groups across Wales to be able to fund materials to send that information out to parents at the same time.

[98] **Ms Owen:** Mae'n dod yn ôl at y cwestiwn o ofyn i rieni ddewis darpariaeth ar sail diffyg gwybodaeth, ac mae yna gamsyniadau yn parhau ledled Cymru o safbwynt addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg, ac mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Y neges rydym yn ei chael gan swyddogion addysg yw na fedrant gael eu gweld i fod yn tueddu un sector dros y llall, a bod yn rhaid bod yn ddiuedd. Byddai RhAG yn dadlau bod yna fyd o wahaniaeth o safbwynt mynd allan i farchnata'n galed a darparu gwybodaeth eglur, syml, sy'n egluro beth ydy addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg a beth fydd y deilliannau ieithyddol o hynny. Rwy'n credu dyna'r gwahaniaeth, ac mae'n rhaid inni ddechrau newid meddylfryd swyddogion y siroedd i ddechrau gweld hynny ac i weithredu ar hynny, oherwydd mae'n gyfrifoldeb rŵan iddyn nhw fod yn gwneud hynny er mwyn cyflawni dyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau

Ms Owen: It returns to the question of asking parents to choose provision on the basis of a lack of information, and there are misunderstandings throughout Wales in terms of Welsh-medium education, and we do have to tackle that. The message that we are getting back from education officers is that they can't be seen to be biased in favouring one sector over another and they have to be impartial. RhAG would argue that there is a world of difference between going out and marketing hard and actually providing clear, simple information that explains what Welsh-medium education is and what the linguistic outcomes of that will be. I think that is the difference, and I think we have to start to change the mindset of council officers to try to see that and to take action on that, because they do have a responsibility now to do so in order to achieve their statutory responsibility under the Welsh in education strategic plans.

statudol y cynlluniau strategol. Felly, mae'r cyfan oll yn ffitio i mewn i'w gilydd yn y modd hynny. So, it all fits in in that way.

[99] **Lynne Neagle:** Thank you. Do you think that there is confusion, then, or a conflict between their role to promote Welsh language education and also the role to assess demand? Is that causing any problems?

[100] **Ms Maher:** Y peth rŷm ni'n ei weld yw bod yn rhaid inni esbonio beth yw ystyr 'hyrwyddo' a 'hybu'. Hynny yw, mae 'hyrwyddo' a 'hybu' yn gallu golygu lot o wahanol bethau. Nid yw'n gorfod bod yn daflen, nid yw'n gorfod bod yn boster; mae hyrwyddo yn gallu golygu yn syml iawn, mewn llyfryn mynediad i ysgolion, nad yw ysgolion Cymraeg yn dod o dan 'Y' am 'ysgol'. Hynny yw, nid rhestr hir o'r ysgolion o fewn y sir a welir gan y rhieni, ond bod yna adran yn sôn am y mathau gwahanol o addysg sydd ar gael o fewn y sir: addysg Gymraeg, addysg cyfrwng Saesneg, addysg ffydd, ac yna mae'r ysgolion. Hynny yw, mae yna bethau sy'n gallu cael eu gwneud i hyrwyddo. Rydym ni, eto, oherwydd y diffyg hwn ac oherwydd, efallai, fod yr awdurdodau lleol ychydig bach yn gyndyn i wthio'r cwch i'r dŵr o ran yr hyrwyddo, rydym ni'n paratoi dogfen ar hyn o bryd a fydd yn gallu esbonio i swyddogion awdurdodau lleol y gwahanol fathau o hyrwyddo, er enghraifft, a'r gwahanol fathau o hybu—hyd yn oed cael pobl ar ochr arall y ffôn yn yr adran mynediad i ysgolion sydd â'r wybodaeth am bob math o addysg o'u blaenau ar y sgriniau a bod ganddynt neges bendant ar gyfer pob un, fel nad ydych yn cael, fel rydym yn dal i'w gael, yn anffodus, ar draws Cymru, 'Nid oes addysg Gymraeg yn ein hardal ni', oherwydd diffyg gwybodaeth yr unigolyn sydd ar ochr arall y ffôn. Felly, mae'r ymwybyddiaeth ar gyfer staff ac ar gyfer y gweithlu yn ffordd arall o hyrwyddo, mewn ffordd.

Ms Maher: What we see is that we have to explain what is the meaning of 'promoting'. That is 'promoting' can mean a number of different things. It doesn't have to be a pamphlet, it doesn't have to be a poster; promotion can mean very simply, in a booklet on access to schools, that Welsh-medium schools don't come under 'Y' for 'ysgol'. That is, it's not a list of schools within the county that parents see, but that there is a section discussing the different sorts of education that's available within the county: Welsh-medium education, English-medium education and faith education and then a list of the schools. There are things that can be done in promotion. Again, because of this lack of promotion and perhaps because the local authorities are a little reluctant to push things in terms of promotion, we're preparing at the moment a document that is going to be able to explain to local authority officials the different kinds of promotion, for example—even having people at the other end of a phone in the schools department who have information on every type of education in front of them on screens and that they have a clear message for each one of those, without you having, as we're still having, unfortunately, across Wales, 'There is no Welsh-medium education in our area', because of a lack of information on the part of the individual on the other end of the phone. So, the awareness of staff and the workforce is another way of promoting Welsh-medium education, in a way.

[101] **Ms Owen:** Rwy'n meddwl hefyd, jest i gamu i mewn yn y fan yma, fod angen eglurder o ran lle mae'r cyfrifoldeb o ran hyrwyddo yn gorwedd. Hynny yw, mae'n rhaid cael hyrwyddo ar lefel cenedlaethol gan y Llywodraeth, mae'n rhaid cael hyrwyddo gan yr awdurdod lleol, ond hefyd mae'n rhaid cael hyrwyddo ar lefel micro gan ysgol neu ddarpariaeth unigol hefyd. Trwy uno'r holl hyrwyddo yna, mi fydd rhieni wedyn yn

Ms Owen: I also think, if I could just come in there, that we need clarity in terms of where the responsibility for promotion lies. That is, we must have promotion at a national level from Government, and we have to have promotion at a local level from the local authority, but also at the micro level from the school or individual providers. By bringing all of those promotion methods together, then parents will be aware that there is an

ymwybodol bod yna gyfle arall, fod yna ddewis arall ar gael iddyn nhw, ac wedyn fe fedrant wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw dros eu hunain, ond mae'n rhaid eu harfogi nhw efo'r wybodaeth hynny er mwyn iddynt fedru gwneud y penderfyniad yn y lle cyntaf.

alternative available to them, and then they can make an informed decision for themselves, but we have to arm them with that information so that they can make that decision initially.

[102] **David Rees:** Just one quick question: obviously, you've been talking about demand and the promotion of Welsh-medium education, but you also talked about trying to meet the demand in the local communities of the children. Clearly, that's going to be variable across Wales because of funding possibilities, as one aspect. Are the local authorities actually addressing that issue as to how they can meet demand more locally for children in their local communities? We're going to see tougher times coming ahead of us; are they using funding as an excuse, or are they simply not doing it?

10:45

[103] **Ms Owen:** Mae hynny bendant yn bryder. Hynny yw, mae yna heriau a rhwystrau ariannol ac economaidd yn wynebu pob sir, wrth gwrs, ac rwy'n credu bod hynny yn eu gorfodi nhw, o bosibl, i wneud penderfyniadau a all fod yn andwyol o safbwynt addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ac na fydd, ychwaith, yn cynyddu y ddarpariaeth o fewn cymuned leol plentyn fel mae'r strategaeth ei hun yn rhoi pwyslais cryf arno. Mae yna un enghraifft ddiweddar iawn ym Mhen-y-bont, lle mae yna gynnig i adleoli ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg o gwm Garw a chanoli'r ddarpariaeth yn y Betws, ond mi fyddai hynny'n tynnu'r ddarpariaeth o'r gymuned leol ac yn dod â fo i lawr i ganol yr awdurdod. Mae yna ddadl economaidd yn fanna, onid oes? Ond wedyn, mae o'n tynnu darpariaeth yn lleol o fod o fewn cymuned y plentyn, felly mae rhywun wedyn yn amau a oes cymhelliant ariannol y tu cefn i hynny, sydd ddim wedyn yn gweithio tuag at ddeilliannau a thargedau'r strategaeth yn ei chyfanrwydd. Wedyn, mae yna bryderon, yn sicr.

Ms Owen: That certainly is a concern. That is, there are financial and economic challenges and barriers facing every county, of course, and I think that is forcing them, possibly, to make decisions that could have a detrimental effect on Welsh-medium education and will not, either, increase the provision within a child's local community, which the strategy itself places a strong emphasis on. There is one recent example in Bridgend, where there is a proposal to relocate a Welsh-medium school from the Garw valley and centralise the provision in Bettws, but that would take the provision away from the local community and would bring it down to the middle of the authority. There is an economic argument there, isn't there? But then, it takes provision away from the local level in the child's community, and then one might suspect that there's a financial motive behind that, which doesn't work towards the outcomes and targets of the strategy as a whole. So, there are concerns, certainly.

[104] Rwy'n credu, hefyd, fod yna gyfleoedd i awdurdodau lleol fod yn edrych y tu allan i'r boc, i fod yn greadigol o ran sut mae cynyddu'r ddarpariaeth. Fe wnaeth Elin gyfeirio'n gynharach at fodel o ddosbarthiadau cychwynnol, model sydd wedi'i fabwysiadu'n llwyddiannus iawn yng Nghaerdydd dros y blynyddoedd. Hefyd, roeddwn i wedi cyffwrdd ar symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwmm a newid cymeriad, efallai, ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg neu ddwyieithog i fod yn ysgolion cyfrwng

I also think that there are opportunities for local authorities to think outside the box and to be creative in terms of how they can increase the provision. Elin referred earlier to the model of starter classes, a model that has been very successfully adopted in Cardiff over the years. Also, I touched upon the idea of moving schools along the continuum and possibly changing the character of English-medium schools or bilingual schools to become Welsh-medium schools. So, I think that perhaps it's just an excuse and is

Cymraeg. Felly, rwy'n meddwl ei fod o, o bosib, yn esgus ac yn lluchio llwch i'n llygaid ni i ddefnyddio rhesymau ariannol i beidio â gweithredu. Mae yna ffyrdd eraill o'i wneud o, ond mae angen bod yn rhagweithiol ac mae angen i'r siroedd gael yr ewyllys i wneud hynny.

throwing dust in our eyes to use financial reasons to explain the lack of action. There are other ways of doing it, but you need to be proactive and the counties themselves need to have the will to do it.

[105] **David Rees:** Can I just ask one further point on that? Obviously, in your previous answer to Simon and to Aled about the regional aspects, have you seen any evidence of collaboration between authorities, in one sense, in this approach? Local reorganisation may be coming, too, our way. Are we starting to see the WESPs looking at the collaboration aspects as well, to ensure that there's a possibility of better delivery in the communities?

[106] **Ms Maher:** Rwy'n gwybod ac yn ymwybodol iawn bod yna alwadau i wneud hynny, ond nid wy'n credu ein bod ni wedi gweld enghreifftiau pendant ohonyn nhw eto. Rwy'n credu bod cyfnod y cynlluniau mor ifanc ac mor gynnar oherwydd mae'n hawdurdodau lleol ni mor agos ac mae yna gymunedau, efallai, sydd yn gweithredu ar draws. Rwy'n meddwl am y de-ddwyrain ond hefyd am gwm Tawe, er enghraifft, rhwng top cwm Tawe a Phowys, lle mae plant nawr yn dod o Bowys i lawr i Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera—

Ms Maher: I know and I am very aware that there are demands being made to do that, but I don't think that we have seen any concrete examples of that yet. I think the plans are still in their infancy and still at an early stage because our local authorities are so close and there are communities, perhaps, that work across. I'm thinking of the south-east here, but also about the Swansea valley, for example, between the top of the Swansea valley and Powys, where children are now coming down from Powys to Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera—

[107] **Keith Davies:** A sir Gâr.

Keith Davies: And to Carmarthenshire.

[108] **Ms Maher:** A sir Gâr, yn ogystal, ie. Felly, mae yna gyfleoedd mawr i gael yn fanna, rwy'n credu, ac nid ydym ni, eto, wedi gweld digon o weithredu ar draws. Yn y cyswllt yma, mae'r consortia hefyd, ond hyd yn oed o fewn consortia, ar draws awdurdodau lleol, mae yna berchnogaeth. Maen nhw'n moyn cadw popeth. Mae yna blwyfoldeb—nid wy'n siŵr iawn beth yw e, ond mae yna gyfle arbennig, er enghraifft, yn ne Caerffili a gogledd-orllewin Casnewydd i edrych ar ddarpariaeth yn yr ardal honno. Felly, rwy'n cytuno ei fod yn rhywbeth y mae angen i awdurdodau lleol feddwl amdano fe, ond nid ym ni wedi'i weld e ar lawr gwlad yn ddigon cadarn eto.

Ms Maher: And Carmarthenshire, as well, yes. So, there are major opportunities there, I think, and we haven't yet seen enough joint working across authorities. In that respect, there are also the consortia, but even within the consortia, across local authorities, there is a sense of ownership. They want to retain everything. There is some parochialism—I'm not sure quite what it is, but there is a particular opportunity, for example, in south Caerphilly and north-west Newport to be looking at the provision in that area. So, I agree that it is something that local authorities need to think about, but we haven't yet seen it emerging tangibly enough at grass-roots level.

[109] **Ms Owen:** Jest i ychwanegu, efallai, mae yna gyfleoedd inni fod yn edrych ar gynllunio o fewn cymuned, a hynny, o bosib, yn pontio dros ffiniau awdurdod lleol, gyda chynllunio traws-sirol, wedyn, yn rhoi cyfle i wneud hynny, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n gwireddu'r dyhead yna bod darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg o fewn cymuned leol

Ms Owen: Just to add, perhaps, that there are opportunities for us to be looking at planning within communities, and perhaps that could span across local authority boundaries, with planning across counties, then, providing opportunities to do that, in order to ensure that we realise this ambition for Welsh-medium provision within a child's local

plentyn. Yn sicr, i ategu sylwadau Elin, mae yna gyfleoedd, ac mae angen arweiniad gan y Llywodraeth ar sut i wireddu a chyflawni hynny.

community. Certainly, to support Elin's comments, there are opportunities, and we need leadership from the Government on how to realise and achieve that.

[110] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Shall we move on to the areas of monitoring and reviewing? We've got about 10 minutes, but I'm sure that you, being the expert questioner, will be able to get through this and Aled's part as well.

[111] **Simon Thomas:** Rwy'n credu ein bod ni wedi cyffwrdd ar rai o'r pethau eisoes. Yn ôl beth rwy'n deall o beth sy'n digwydd o ran monitro, yn gyntaf oll, mae'r Gweinidog yn gorfod cymeradwyo cynlluniau, wedyn, mae yna fonitro blynyddol yn digwydd y tu fewn i'r cynlluniau, ond nid yw hwnnw'n cael ei gyhoeddi, fel y cyfryw.

Simon Thomas: I think that we have touched on some of these things already. As I understand what happens in terms of monitoring, first of all, the Minister has to approve the plans, then, there is annual monitoring that is carried out within the plans, but that isn't published, as such.

[112] Y cwestiwn cyntaf, felly. Dim ond pump o'r cynlluniau, yn y lle cyntaf, a gafodd eu cymeradwyo'n syth gan y Gweinidog. A oeddech chi, fel RhAG, wedi gallu gweld dros rychwant y cynlluniau, a gweld pam oedd cynifer wedi methu â chael eu cymeradwyo yn y lle cyntaf? A oedd yna ryw beth cyffredin a oedd o'i le gyda nhw?

The first question, therefore. Only five of the WESP plans were approved in the first instance by the Minister. Did you, as RhAG, feel that you were able to have an overview of the range of the plans, to see why such a number of them failed to gain approval in the first place? Was there something in general that was wrong with them all?

[113] **Ms Maher:** Roedd lot gormod o hanes am sut oedden nhw wedi cyrraedd y pwynt yna. Roedd lot gormod o *waffle*—rwy'n defnyddio'r gair yna'n hollol ddifrifol—roedd gormod o wadio ac o badio. Roedd gormod o, 'Rŷm ni wedi gwneud yn dda a dyma beth rŷm ni wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn', yn hytrach nag edrych arnyn nhw fel dogfennau i'r dyfodol a dogfennau i weithredu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Roedd hynny'n gyffredin iawn yn nifer o'r cynlluniau, onid oedd e?

Ms Maher: There was far too much background about how they had reached that point. There was far too much waffle—and I use that word entirely seriously—there was far too much wadding and padding. There was far too much of, 'Well, we've done well and this is what we've done so far', rather than looking at them as documents for the future and as documents for future action. That was a very common problem with a number of the WESPs, wasn't it?

[114] **Simon Thomas:** A ydy pob un wedi'i gymeradwyo erbyn hyn? Roeddwn i wedi clywed bod un, efallai, heb gael ei gymeradwyo eto.

Simon Thomas: Has every single one of them been approved now? I had heard that there was perhaps one that was still awaiting approval.

[115] **Ms Owen:** Rwy'n credu, o bosibl, fod yna oedi gydag un oherwydd amgylchiadau'r sir. Rwy'n credu roedd dwy neu dair sir yn yr un cwch oherwydd cyddestun lleol ad-drefnu, ac yn y blaen. Rwy'n credu roedd sir Gâr yn un hefyd, o safbwynt argymhellion y gweithgor trawsbleidiol, wrth gwrs. Felly, roedd oedi yn hynny. Rwy'n credu, eto, roedd y darlun yn anghyson ledled y wlad. O safbwynt y broses o gyflwyno,

Ms Owen: I think there might be some delay with one because of the circumstances within that particular county. I think that two or three counties were in the same boat because of the context locally, with reorganisation and so on. I think that Carmarthenshire was one, too, in the context of the recommendations of the cross-party taskforce, of course. So, there were some delays there. I also think the picture was

roedd rhai siroedd wedi bod yn hwyr yn cyflwyno'u drafft er mwyn ei gymeradwyo, ac roedd hwnnw wedi cael effaith wedyn o ran y broses o graffu ac o dderbyn. Wedyn, roedd yr amserlen wedi llithro *slightly* o safbwynt pryd oedd y cynlluniau'n weithredol. Felly, yn sicr, mae angen tynhau hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod y cylchoedd yn gweithio yn gywir, felly.

[116] **Simon Thomas:** Jest i ddweud bod gan y Gweinidog bŵer ymyrraeth, onid oes? A ydych chi'n meddwl bod y pŵer hwnnw'n ddigon cryf neu'n ddigon clir o ran ym mha sefyllfa mae'n cael ei ddefnyddio?

[117] **Ms Owen:** Na. Hynny yw, mae angen eglurder o ran beth yn union ydy diffiniad y pŵer hwnnw i ymyrryd—sut y byddai hynny'n digwydd a beth fyddai goblygiadau a chanlyniadau hynny. Rwy'n meddwl bod angen camu yn ôl o hynny ac, yn y bôn, ni ddylai bod rhaid i'r Gweinidog ymyrryd. Mi ddylai bod y cynlluniau yn ddigon cadarn a rhagweithiol, ac yn blaengynllunio mewn modd digon cadarnhaol i osgoi gorfod cael sefyllfa lle byddai'r Gweinidog yn ymyrryd o gwbl. Pe byddai'r gyfundrefn yn gweithio fel y dylai hi, rwy'n credu na fyddai rhaid i'r Gweinidog ymyrryd o gwbl. Hynny yw, mae yna lu o enghreifftiau dros y flwyddyn neu'r 18 mis diwethaf—Caerdydd, er enghraifft, lle gwnaeth y cyngor dro pedol i ddechrau ar ymrwymiad a oedd yn y cynllun strategol i sefydlu ysgol Gymraeg yn Grangetown. Heb i'r rhieni ymgyrchu a lleisio barn yn gryf, nid wy'n siŵr a fyddai'r ysgol honno yn digwydd. Mae hi'n digwydd, ond dwy neu dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach na'r dyddiad a gynigiwyd. Felly, o bosibl, yn yr enghraifft honno, mi ddylai'r Gweinidog fod wedi ymyrryd, ond, wrth gwrs, o ran pwysau rhieni, mi wnaeth y cyngor dro pedol a bwrw ymlaen efo'r cynnig gwreiddiol. Felly, mae yna liaws o enghreifftiau yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd lle buaswn i'n dadlau bod angen i'r Gweinidog ymyrryd. Felly, pryd mae hynny'n digwydd yw'r cwestiwn arall—

very patchy across the country. On the process of submitting them, some counties were late submitting their draft for approval, which then had a knock-on effect for their scrutiny and approval. There was some slight slippage then in terms of the timetable as to when the WESPs were implemented. So, certainly we need to tighten that up in order to ensure that the rounds work effectively.

Simon Thomas: Just to say that the Minister has a power of intervention, doesn't he? Do you think that that power is sufficiently robust or sufficiently clear about the situations in which it may be used?

Ms Owen: No. That is, there is a need for clarity in terms of exactly what the definition of that power to intervene is—how would that happen and what would be the implications and the outcomes of that. I think we need to take a step back from that and, essentially, there shouldn't be any need for the Minister to intervene. The WESPs should be robust and proactive enough, and they should plan ahead in a sufficiently constructive way as to avoid finding yourself in the situation where the Minister intervenes at all. If the system worked as it should, I don't think there would be the need for any ministerial intervention. That is, there are numerous examples over the past year or 18 months—Cardiff, for example, where the council did a u-turn initially on a commitment within its strategic plan to establish a Welsh-medium school in Grangetown. If it weren't for the parents' vocal campaigning, I'm not sure whether that school would actually be going ahead. It is going ahead, but it will be two or three years later than the date initially proposed. So, in that example, perhaps the Minister should have intervened, but, of course, as a result of parental pressure, the council did actually do a u-turn and go ahead with the original plan. There are myriad examples where I would argue that the Minister needs to intervene. So, when that happens is another question—

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:49 a 11:03.
The meeting adjourned between 10:49 and 11:03.*

[118] **Ann Jones:** Right, we'll reconvene, and I'm not going to do the usual housekeeping

because nobody's moved anywhere. So, there we go. I can't remember where we were. Yes, you were talking, Simon.

[119] **Simon Thomas:** Rwy'n credu fy mod i'n gwybod lle oeddem ni. Rwy'n gwybod pa gwestiwn roeddwn i'n mynd i'w ofyn nesaf, beth bynnag, sef: wrth i'r broses monitro blynyddol ddigwydd, a oes rôl gyda chi, neu fudiadau rydych chi'n ymwybodol ohonynt, yn y broses yna? A ydy'r fforymau rŷm ni newydd eu crybwyll yn gwneud y gwaith yna? A ydy e'n waith mewnlol llwyr i'r awdurdod? Beth sy'n debyg o ddigwydd? Rydym ni'n gynnwys yn y broses, rwy'n gwybod, ond beth sy'n debyg o ddigwydd?

Simon Thomas: I think I know where we were. I know which question I was planning to ask next, anyway, which was this: as the annual monitoring process goes ahead, do you have a role or do any organisations that you're aware of have a role in that process? Are the forums that we've just mentioned doing that work? Does that work happen entirely within the authority? What is likely to happen? We're still very early on in the process, I know, but what is likely to happen?

[120] **Ms Maher:** Mae wedi amrywio eto, o ardal i ardal. Mae yna rai ardaloedd sydd wedi bod yn weithredol iawn yn y monitro, a rhai awdurdodau lleol lle mae bron â bod pob gwelliant sydd wedi'i awgrymu i'r cynllun wedi cael ei fabwysiadu. Felly, mae hynny'n galonogol: bod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn cydnabod nad nhw, efallai, yw'r bobl mwyaf gwybodus ar rai agweddau o'r cynllun. Eto, yn anffodus, mae'n ddarniog, ac nid yw'n gyson ar draws Cymru. Rŷm ni wedi gweld sefyllfa lle unigolyn sydd wedi ysgrifennu'r cynllun, un person, ac mae hwnnw wedi ein poeni ni'n fawr, ond maen nhw wedi cael cyfle, wedyn, i'w gryfhau drwy'r fforymau yn ogystal.

Ms Maher: Well, once again, it has varied from one area to another. Some areas have been very proactive in terms of monitoring, and some local authorities have adopted virtually all amendments suggested to the WESP. So, that's encouraging: that some local authorities do acknowledge that they are perhaps not the most knowledgeable people about some aspects of the plan. Then again, unfortunately, it's a very patchy picture and it's not consistent across Wales. We have seen some situations where an individual has drawn up the plan, just one person, and that's been a cause of great concern to us, but they've then had an opportunity to strengthen it through the fora as well.

[121] **Simon Thomas:** A oes canllawiau gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â beth ddylai ddigwydd? Mae yna reoliadau, onid oes e, sy'n ymwneud â'r broses yma, i raddau?

Simon Thomas: Is there any guidance from the Government as to what should happen? There are regulations, aren't there, relating to this process, to some extent?

[122] **Ms Owen:** Rheoliadau, oes, ond rwy'n credu bod y rheini yn bennaf yn ymwneud ag arolygon mesur y galw, ac yn y blaen. Nid wy'n siŵr a oes yna arweiniad digonol o safbwynt y fforymau, ac eto rwy'n meddwl bod yna alwad gan RhAG i'w gwneud nhw ar sail statudol fel eu bod nhw'n endidau sy'n medru cyfrannu'n llawn i'r broses a chryfhau'r broses gynllunio a monitro. Rwy'n credu bod yna lot o gwestiynau yn codi o safbwynt, eto, y berchnogaeth leol yma. Beth ydy gwir gyfraniad rhanddeiliaid i'r broses? A ydy hi'n broses tic yn y boc; 'Rydym ni wedi gofyn i rhanddeiliaid am eu barn nhw, ond nid ydym ni'n derbyn y sylwadau nac yn eu hymgorffori nhw yn y cynlluniau a fydd yn

Ms Owen: Regulations, yes, but I think that they relate mainly to the surveys for assessing demand, and so on. I'm not sure whether there is sufficient guidance from the point of view of the fora, and again, I think that RhAG has called for them to be statutory entities so that they can contribute fully to the process and strengthen the planning and monitoring process. I think that numerous questions arise from the point of view, again, of local ownership. What is the real contribution of stakeholders to the process? Is it a tick-box exercise; 'We've asked stakeholders for their opinion, but we don't accept the comments and we will not incorporate them in the plans that we will be forwarding to the Minister for his attention'?

mynd wedyn ymlaen er sylw'r Gweinidog? Felly, rwy'n credu bod yna gwestiynau i'w gofyn o ran y broses a thaith y cynllun o'i ddrafftio, o'i dderbyn, o'i wella ac o'i adolygu o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yn y cylch, ac wedyn pan fyddwn ni'n aildddechrau'r cylch newydd yn 2017-18.

[123] **Simon Thomas:** Ac yn rhan o'r daith yna, a ddylid cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynllun gan bob awdurdod?

[124] **Ms Maher:** Rŷm ni'n teimlo'n bendant y dylid cyhoeddi. Hynny yw, mae pob awdurdod lleol yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol ar ddiwedd blwyddyn beth bynnag, a beth sy'n wahanol mewn cynlluniau? Hynny yw, nid ydyn nhw ddim—. Rwy'n credu bod y Gweinidog wedi nodi o bosibl ei bod yn feichus ar awdurdodau lleol i wneud hynny. Rŷm ni'n anghytuno, achos rŷm ni'n gweld, os ŷch chi'n gyfarwydd â chynlluniau addysg Gymraeg, mae yna golofnau sy'n dangos sut mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn unigol wedi gwneud cynnydd. Ac felly, dyna i gyd sydd eisiau ei wneud, *really*, yw tynnu'r cynnydd yna ac ysgrifennu ychydig o naratif i fynd gyda fe i roi cefndir. Felly, rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig iawn.

[125] Eto, roedd Lynne yn gofyn am hyrwyddo. Mae e'n ffordd arall o hyrwyddo addysg Gymraeg oherwydd, ar y diwedd, rŷch chi'n rhoi llun o'r cynnydd yna sydd wedi digwydd yn ystod y flwyddyn, neu beidio, ac yna gellir dangos lle mae'r flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r dogfennau hyn—ac maen nhw'n dweud wrthym trwy'r amser mai dogfennau byw ydyn nhw—yn dangos bod yna newid drwy'r amser. Os ydyn nhw'n ddogfennau byw, mae'n bwysig ein bod ni'n gweld y daith sydd wedi cael ei gwneud yn ystod y flwyddyn neu'r ddwy flynedd neu'r tair blynedd ac, felly, rŷm ni fel RhAG yn teimlo y dylai fod yna adroddiadau blynyddol yn cael eu gwneud.

[126] **Ms Owen:** Rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n elfen anhepgorol o sicrhau tryloywder i'r holl broses ac, yn y pen draw, atebolrwydd ar lefel leol a hefyd, yn y pen draw wedyn, gan y Gweinidog. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn allweddol o safbwynt ymwybyddiaeth ymysg

So, there are questions to be asked in terms of the process and the journey of the plan from drafting to adoption to amendment and then to review from year to year within the cycle, and again when we start the new cycle in 2017-18.

Simon Thomas: And, as part of the journey, should an annual report on the plan be published by each authority?

Ms Maher: We feel that, certainly, that should be the case. That is, every local authority publishes an annual report at the end of every year in any case, so what's different about the plans? That is, they're not—. I think the Minister has noted that it would be a burden on local authorities to do that. We disagree, because, as we see it, if you're familiar with WESPs, there are columns that identify how an individual local authority has made progress, and all you would need to do, really, would be to extract that progress and draft an accompanying narrative to provide some background. So, I think it's very important.

Again, Lynne was asking about promotion. It is another way of promoting Welsh-medium education, because, at the end of the day, you're providing a snapshot of the progress that has been made, or not made, during the year, and then you can demonstrate where next year should take you. These documents—and they are constantly telling us that these are living documents—demonstrate that things are evolving constantly. So, if you have these living documents, it is important that we can identify the journey and the progress that's been made over a year, two years or three years and, therefore, we as RhAG believe that annual reports should be made, most certainly.

Ms Owen: I think it's an essential element of ensuring clarity throughout the process and, ultimately, accountability at the local level and from the Minister thereafter. I think it is key in terms of awareness among the main stakeholders, namely parents and families—

y prif randdeiliaid, sef rhieni a theuluoedd—hynny yw, eu bod nhw wedyn yn medru gweld ar lawr gwlad beth mae'r cynllun yn ei gyflawni neu, o bosib, beth nad yw'n ei gyflawni. Ond, ar hyn o bryd, rwy'n credu bod yna amwysedd yn yr holl broses, ac nid ydy'r rhieni'n ymwybodol o beth mae'r cynllun yn ei wneud a beth ydy'r potensial y gallai'r cynllun ei wneud, ac rwy'n credu y byddai adroddiad blynyddol yn hwyluso hynny'n fawr iawn.

[127] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch.

[128] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf eisiau symud at bolisi ehangach y Llywodraeth a gofyn a ydych chi eisiau ymhelaethu ar eich nodyn chi yn y dystiolaeth sy'n dweud bod yna bosibilrwydd y bydd addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ôl-16 yn chwalu o achos problemau trafndiaeth, mae'n debyg.

[129] **Ms Maher:** Mae cludiant ôl-16 yn bwnc dyrys iawn. Mae e'n bwnc sydd yn ein poeni ni'n ddirfawr iawn hefyd. Rŷm ni ar hyn o bryd yn gweld nifer o awdurdodau lleol ar draws Cymru yn ymgynghori ar gludiant ôl-16 a'r ddarpariaeth honno, a pha un ai i godi tâl amdano ai peidio. Nawr, wrth gwrs, mae cludiant ôl-16 yn cwmpo y tu fas i oedran addysg statudol, ond mae e'n dal i ddod o dan, ac yn ddarostyngedig i, adran 10 ym Mesur Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru) 2008, sydd yn nodi pwysigrwydd y ffaith bod pob awdurdod lleol yn cynllunio ac yn hyrwyddo mynediad at addysg Gymraeg, ac, ar hyn o bryd, mae yna achosion ar hyd a lled Cymru lle mae enghreifftiau gyda ni o ardaloedd, rhai siroedd, sy'n codi tipyn—dros £400 mewn un ardal—i blentyn gael cludiant i ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg. Nawr, nid oes gan blant yn yr ardaloedd yma ddim dewis ond teithio dros y 3 milltir i'r ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac, felly, nid yw'r ddarpariaeth yn y sir yn deg nac yn gytbwys, ac, felly, mae'r siroedd yn cosbi'r plant oherwydd nad yw'r ddarpariaeth yn lleol. Mae Casnewydd wedi bod yn codi ffioedd er enghraifft, hefyd. Erbyn hyn, mae'n £370 y flwyddyn i blentyn fynd ar fws ysgol. Mae yna rai siroedd lle nad oes yna ddim tâl o gwbl—maen nhw'n ei ddarparu fe—ond rŷm ni yn bryderus iawn am yr effaith y mae hyn yn mynd i'w chael ar allu ysgolion uwchradd i ddarparu'r ystod eang o bynciau sydd angen

that is, they are able to see at grass roots level what the plan is achieving or possibly not achieving at the moment, however, I think there is ambiguity in the whole process, and parents aren't aware of what the plan is doing and what the potential of the plan could be, and I think that an annual report would facilitate that greatly.

Simon Thomas: Thank you.

Aled Roberts: I want to move on to Welsh Government policy more broadly and ask whether you want to expand on your note in the evidence that says that there is a possibility that post-16 Welsh-medium education could collapse because of transport problems, it would seem.

Ms Maher: Post-16 transport is a very complex issue and a very worrying problem. We currently see a number of local authorities across Wales consulting on post-16 transport and the provision thereof, and whether they should charge for it or not. Now, of course, post-16 transport falls outwith the statutory school age, but it is still subject to section 10 of the Learner Travel (Wales) Measure 2008, which notes the importance of all local authorities planning and promoting access to Welsh-medium education, and, at present, there are cases the length and breadth of Wales where we have examples of some areas, some counties that charge a significant amount—over £400 in one area—to provide transport for pupils to a Welsh-medium school. Now, these pupils have no choice but to travel over 3 miles to the Welsh-medium provision, and, therefore, the education provision within the county is neither fair nor balanced, and, therefore, counties such as those are penalising those pupils because the provision is not available locally. Newport has been charging fees, also. It's now £370 per annum for pupils to travel on a school bus. There are some counties where there is no charge at all—they make the provision—but we are very concerned about the impact that this will have on the ability of secondary schools to provide that broad range of subjects that need to be provided within schools.

eu darparu mewn ysgolion.

[130] Mae hynny wedyn yn cael effaith hyd yn oed bellach ar yr ysgol gyfan ac ar yr addysg cyn 16 hefyd, oherwydd mae athrawon yn cael eu cyflogi i ddarparu addysg ar draws y cyfnodau allweddol. Felly, mae hefyd yn destun pryder nad yw addysg Gymraeg yn mynd i fod yn opsiwn i nifer o deuluoedd sydd jest yn methu fforddio talu yr arian hynny. Mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym ni'n gweithio'n galed arno fe ar hyn o bryd, ac rydym mewn trafodaethau cyson gyda Chomisiynydd yr Iaith Gymraeg a'r awdurdodau lleol hynny lle rydym yn pryderu am y ffordd y maen nhw yn ymdrin ag addysg ôl-16, a chludiant i addysg ôl-16 yn benodol.

[131] **Ms Owen:** Roedd yna gyfeiriad yn gynharach o safbwynt yr hinsawdd economaidd a'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r siroedd ar hyn o bryd. Mae pawb yn ceisio canfod arbedion hawdd a chyflym ac, wrth gwrs, mae cludiant yn cael ei weld fel un o'r ystyriaethau amlycaf i geisio gwneud arbedion drwyddo. Mae cludiant yn hanfodol o safbwynt yr hafaliad o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Heb y cludiant hwnnw, nid oes modd unioni'r ffaith bod yr ysgolion ymhellach yn gyffredinol oddi wrth cartrefi y mwyafrif o deuluoedd. Felly, mae sicrhau cludiant am ddim yn gwneud addysg Gymraeg yn opsiwn hygrych, hawdd a rhesymol i'r mwyafrif o deuluoedd. Mae tynnu hwnnw wedyn yn cael effaith anghymesur ac afresymol ar deuluoedd.

[132] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf wedi bod yn edrych ar nifer o'r cynlluniau yma, a buaswn yn dweud bod y rhan helaeth ohonyn nhw'n siomedig. Ond, maen nhw hyd yn oed yn fwy siomedig o ran y ffordd y maen nhw yn delio ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Mae gen i un esiampl yma o Wrecsam, a'r unig darged sydd ganddynt o ran anghenion ychwanegol ydy eu bod nhw yn cael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd efo'r penaethiaid.

[133] **Ms Maher:** Yn aml iawn, rydym yn clywed y ddadl o ran niferoedd plant a'r gallu i gynllunio o fewn cyllidebau ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig. Ac mae yna effaith wedi bod ers i'r consortia wahanu oddi wrth yr awdurdodau lleol oherwydd bod y

That then has an even greater knock-on effect on the whole of the school and on the pre-16 education, because teachers are employed to provide education across all key stages. Therefore, it is a concern that Welsh-medium education isn't going to be an option for many families who simply can't afford to pay those charges. It is something that we are working hard on at present, and we are in constant discussions with the Welsh Language Commissioner and with those local authorities where we are concerned about the way in which they are dealing with post-16 education, and transport to post-16 education specifically.

Ms Owen: There was a reference earlier to the economic climate and the challenges facing the counties at the moment. Everybody's trying to find quick and easy savings and, of course, transport is seen as one of the most obvious considerations in terms of making savings. Transport is essential in terms of the equation of Welsh-medium education. Without that transport, there is no way to align the fact that the schools are generally further away from the homes of the majority of families. So, ensuring free transport makes Welsh-medium education an accessible, easy and reasonable option to the majority of families. Withdrawing that then has a disproportionate and unreasonable impact on families.

Aled Roberts: I've been looking at a number of these plans, and I would say that the majority of them are disappointing. But, they are even more disappointing in the way that they deal with additional learning needs. I have one example here from Wrexham, where the only target they have within additional learning needs is that they hold regular meetings with the heads.

Ms Maher: Very often, we hear the argument made on the basis of pupil numbers and the ability to plan within budgets for children with additional learning needs. And there has been an impact since the consortia separated from the local authorities, because

cyfrifoldeb dros anghenion arbennig fel arfer wedi aros o dan oruchwyliaeth yr awdurdodau lleol. Ac yna mae'r arbenigedd gyda'r gwasanaethau athrawon bro a'r athrawon arbenigol yn eu pynciau wedi mynd i'r consortia. Mae hynny wedi cael effaith, rwy'n teimlo, ar ddarpariaeth anghenion dysgu ychwanegol oherwydd mae'r arbenigwyr wedi mynd oddi wrth y trefnwyr, fel petai. Oherwydd y gwahanu hynny, mae'r cynllunio wedi cwmpo ac mae wedi cael effaith andwyol ar y cynllunio hynny.

the responsibility for additional learning needs has usually remained with the local authority. And then the expertise seen in relation to *athrawon bro* and the specialist teachers' service has gone to the consortia. That has had an impact, I feel, on additional learning needs provision because the specialists have been removed from those responsible for planning services, as it were. Because of that separation, the planning has slipped and it has a detrimental effect on that planning.

[134] Ond hefyd, mae yna gyfle yn ogystal fan hyn i edrych ar weithio ar draws siroedd, sydd ddim wedi cael ei wneud yn ddigonol, yn fy marn i. Hynny yw, os oes nifer fach mewn un ardal, mae gyda ni enghreifftiau da i'w cael, yng Nghaerffili er enghraifft, lle mae yna ysgolion nawr wedi derbyn y cyfrifoldeb i fod yn ysgolion lle maen nhw yn edrych ar ôl plant ag anghenion arbennig, ond nid yw hynny yn gyson ar draws Cymru, yn anffodus. Mae yna ormod o ddibyniaeth nawr ar y gweithgorau arbenigol, sydd wedyn yn ddibynnol ar ysgolion eto i ddarparu'r arbenigedd. Yn hytrach na'i wneud e ar lefel awdurdod lleol, maen nhw nawr yn dibynnu ar ysgolion i gymryd y baich i gynllunio ar gyfer darpariaeth anghenion arbennig, sydd yn grêt oherwydd taw nhw sydd yn ei chanol hi, ond mae gan ysgolion ddigon i'w wneud fel mae hi, heb orfod edrych ar y ddarpariaeth ehangach yn ogystal.

Bu, there is also an opportunity here to look at cross-authority working, which hasn't been sufficiently, in my view. That is, if there is a small number in one area, then we have some good examples, in Caerphilly for example, where schools have now taken on the responsibility for children with additional needs, but that's not consistent across Wales, unfortunately. There is too much reliance on the specialist working groups, and it's again down to the schools to provide the expertise. Rather than working at the local authority level, they now depend on schools to shoulder that burden in terms of planning for special needs provision, which is great because they are at the heart of things. But, schools have enough to do already without having to look at that broader provision also.

[135] **Ann Jones:** I was just going to say, 'Please don't tell me you've got another little small question you wanted to ask', because I was just going to say 'No'.

[136] **Aled Roberts:** Another four. [*Laughter.*]

[137] **Ann Jones:** Can I thank you very much, and I apologise that we were disrupted part way through? Thanks very much for your evidence today; I think we found it useful. We'll send you a copy of the transcript to check for accuracy, and then we can publish it as part of our report. Thank you both very much for coming in. If committee is okay, we'll move straight on, given that we need to make some time up for our enforced stoppage.

11:15

Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth

2

Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs)—Evidence Session 2

[138] **Ann Jones:** Thanks very much. I apologise, as I can't say we were going to finish stop on time. We were running late, but the enforced short break has left us late, but thank

you very much for coming. Our next session is with Gareth Morgans, who's the chief education officer at Carmarthenshire, and Catrin, do you want to—? Well, do you want to both introduce yourselves, and then we'll go into some questions, if that's okay?

[139] **Mr Morgans:** Fy enw i yw Gareth Morgans. Rwy'n brif swyddog addysg yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yn gyfrifol am wasanaethau addysg, a rhan o'r gorchwyl hwinnw yw cyfrifoldeb am y Gymraeg mewn addysg.

Mr Morgans: My name is Gareth Morgans. I'm chief education officer in Carmarthenshire, responsible for education services, which includes responsibility for Welsh in education.

[140] **Ms Griffiths:** Catrin Griffiths, ymgynghorydd her sir Gaerfyrddin ac ERW. Rwyf hefyd wedi cael fy mhenodi yn swyddog y Gymraeg yn sgîl cynllun strategol y Gymraeg mewn addysg.

[141] **Ms Griffiths:** I'm Catrin Griffiths, the challenge adviser in Carmarthenshire and ERW. I've also been appointed as Welsh language officer in light of the WESPs.

[142] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thanks very much and thanks for the evidence. We've got four areas of questions that we want to try and go through. One is, obviously, on the WESPs and the Welsh Government's Welsh-medium education strategy; assessing and meeting local demand; monitoring, reviewing, reporting, approving and compliance; and, as you've just heard, the last session there was around WESPs and the broader Welsh Government policies. If that's okay, we'll go straight into questions. Can I make the usual 'can we be brief' request, because we have the hour that we have, but we do need to finish spot on if we can? So, Suzy.

[143] **Suzy Davies:** Just to start with a quote from the Minister's written evidence:

[144] 'Local authorities have had 3 years in which to develop and refine their WESPs but the extent to which Ministerial approval has required modifications suggests that there is still some way to go before they are sufficiently embedded in local authority processes to contribute more effectively to the targets and outcomes of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.'

[145] I know Carmarthen was a bit of a stand-alone example, so this question is a bit mean, really, but, looking more broadly at perhaps other local authorities, do you think that the local authorities have understood this and what it's all about?

[146] **Mr Morgans:** Rwy'n credu bod y strategaeth yn rhywbeth eithaf ifanc o hyd. Hynny yw, efallai ei bod wedi cymryd mwy o amser nag oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl i awdurdodau fynd i'r afael â beth oedd ei eisiau. O brofiad sir Gaerfyrddin, cawsom her oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru ar y cynnwys, sydd yn ddigon teg, Ond, yr her oedd bod eisiau mwy o wybodaeth am rai o agweddau'r cynllun, a mwy o fanylder fel eu bod nhw'n deall beth roeddem yn trio sôn amdano. Un o'r pethau oedd eglurder ar beth oedd 'gorsaf iaith' yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Felly, roedd yr ymholiadau'n gofyn am fwy o wybodaeth yn hytrach na herio ar y cynnwys.

Mr Morgans: I think the strategy is still in its formative stages. It may have taken longer than we'd expected for authorities to grapple with what was required. From the Carmarthenshire experience, we were challenged by Welsh Government on the content, which was fair enough. But the challenge was that they wanted more information about some aspects of the plan, and more detail so that they could understand what we were talking about. One of the things was clarity in terms of what was meant by 'language station' in Carmarthenshire. So, the inquiries were in relation to seeking more information rather than challenging the content.

[147] Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n gyffredinol ar draws Cymru—y bu mwy o

I think that's generally true across Wales—that there have been questions to expand

gwestiynau i ehangu ar y cynnwys fel bod eglurder o ran beth roedd yr awdurdodau yn golygu ei wneud, rwy'n credu. O siarad â chydweithwyr yn ein rhanbarth ni, rwy'n credu mai'r cwestiynau a oedd yn dod nôl oedd, 'Beth oedd hyn yn golygu? A ydy'r targed yma'n iawn?' Felly, roedd yr her yn eithaf heriol, ac roeddem yn derbyn hynny ac yn ddiolchgar am hynny.

[148] **Suzy Davies:** O sôn am y targedau, a ydych chi'n cytuno bod yna fwch rhwng y targedau yn y cynlluniau lleol yn gyffredinol a'r targedau sydd yn strategaeth genedlaethol y Llywodraeth, a pham?

[149] **Mr Morgans:** Un peth sy'n heriol o ran y strategaeth yw bod yna darged ar draws Cymru yn strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Wrth edrych ar dargedau lleol, mae'n dibynnu lle mae'r awdurdod addysg hwnnw ar y pryd. Mae'r targedau'n wahanol. Yn ein sefyllfa ni, rydym wedi gosod y targedau yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth a'r wybodaeth sydd gyda ni yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Felly, nid rhywbeth sydd wedi'i dynnu mas o'r awyr ydyw. Rydym wedi creu'r targedau'n seiliedig ar y data sydd gyda ni, a byddwn i'n cymryd bod pob awdurdod arall wedi gwneud hynny. Ond, mae yna ychydig o wahaniaeth rhwng y targedau uchelgeisiol y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u gosod a lle rydym ni wedi cyrraedd eleni. Ar gyfer y dyfodol, rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn her i gyrraedd lle rydym i fod erbyn 2020.

[150] **Suzy Davies:** Fe wnaethoch chi sôn am ddata eiliad yn ôl. A ydych chi'n hapus gyda safon y data ar draws Cymru? Mae'n anodd ichi ymateb i hynny, rwy'n gwybod. Ond, o siarad â'ch cymdogion, a yw'r data o'r un safon dros y rhanbarth?

[151] **Mr Morgans:** Rwy'n credu bod datblygiadau arwyddocaol wedi bod yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf o ran y data sydd gan awdurdodau lleol, yn ein hardal ni yn arbennig, sydd am ein hysgolion. Rydym ni wedi datblygu systemau gwell, lle rwy'n credu rydym yn cael data mwy cadarn gan ysgolion. Mae llawer mwy o waith cymedroli ar draws ysgolion wedi digwydd, ac rwy'n fwy hyderus yn y data sydd gennym ni. Mae'r data ar gyfer y cynllun strategol gyda ni yn eithaf rhwydd nawr, lle, o'r blaen,

upon the content so there was clarity on what authorities were proposing. In speaking to colleagues in my own area, the questions asked were, 'What does this mean? Are the targets correct?' So, it was quite challenging and we accepted that and were grateful for it.

Suzy Davies: Just to talk about the targets, do you agree that there is a gap between the targets in the local plans in general and the targets that are in the national strategy of the Government, and why?

Mr Morgans: One thing that is challenging in terms of the strategy is that there is a pan-Wales target in the Welsh Government strategy. When we look at the local level, it depends where that education authority is at that point. There are different targets in place. As to our position, we have set our targets based on the data that we have within Carmarthenshire. It's not something that we've plucked out of the air. We have drawn up the targets based on the data that we hold, and I would assume that every other authority has done the same. But, yes, there is some difference between the ambitious targets set by the Welsh Government and where we've got to this year. For the future, I'm sure it will be a challenge to achieve where we're supposed to be by 2020.

Suzy Davies: You mentioned data a second ago. Are you happy with the standard of the data across Wales? I know it's difficult for you to respond. But, when you're talking to your neighbours, are the data of the same standard across the region?

Mr Morgans: I think there have been significant developments over the past two years in terms of the data that local authorities have, in our area particularly, on our schools. We've developed enhanced systems, whereby I think we have more robust data from schools. There's a great deal more work done across schools in standardisation, and I am more confident in the data that we have. The data that we have for the WESPs are quite easily accessible now, where, in the past we would have had to

efallai roeddem ni'n gorfod mynd allan i ysgolion unigol i ofyn a holi. Mae gennym systemau gwell nawr, rwy'n credu. Ar draws ein rhanbarth ni, mae'r datblygiad o ganolfan athrawon, y *teacher centre*, fel man casglu data ac ati, yn datblygu, ac mae hwnnw'n hwyluso ein gwaith ni. Yn yr un modd, yn y sector uwchradd, mae ein hysgolion uwchradd ni i gyd ar un system casglu, lle, o'r blaen, roedd yna dair system wahanol. Felly, mae datblygiadau wedi bod o ran casglu data, ac ansawdd y data hefyd.

[152] **Suzy Davies:** A oes rôl i'r consortiwm o ran helpu gyda chysondeb y data?

[153] **Mr Morgans:** Yn sicr. Rhan o waith Catrin yw ei bod hi'n rhan o'r grŵp ERW o ran y Gymraeg. Nhw sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb, mewn ffordd, i edrych ar ddata'r Gymraeg. Mae llawer mwy o drafod, efallai, ar draws siroedd, ynglŷn â systemau a ffyrdd o gasglu data ac edrych ar ddata, a rhannu arfer da hefyd.

[154] **Suzy Davies:** Felly, mae'n debyg nad ydych yn croesawu'r syniad o'r Llywodraeth yn setio targedau ar gyfer y cynghorau lleol.

[155] **Mr Morgans:** Y peth yw, mae gwybodaeth leol yn bwysig, rwy'n credu, ac adeiladu ar yr hyn sydd gennym ni. O ran nifer o'r targedau sydd yn y ddogfen, rŷm ni yn sir Gâr wedi eu croesi yn barod. Felly, o ran y targedau hynny, gallwn ni eistedd yn ôl yn hapus a dweud, 'Mae rhai o'r canrannau wedi'u cyrraedd'. Ond y peth yw, mae mwy o her inni gyda'r targedau uwch. Yn y system ysgol, mae rhai ysgolion da yn cario'r lleill ac ati. Yn y system addysg hefyd, mae'n rhaid inni wneud ein rhan i gyfrannu at gyrraedd y targedau hefyd.

[156] **Suzy Davies:** A ydych chi'n rhannu peth o'ch arfer da gyda chynghorau eraill?

[157] **Mr Morgans:** Byddem ni'n barod i wneud hynny. Mae hynny'n wendid yn y system ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n wendid o ran y cynllun iaith strategol, rwy'n credu, yn gyfan gwbl o ran y Gymraeg. Nid oes digon o gyfle wedi bod efallai i drafod a rhannu beth sydd wedi bod yn digwydd. Mae'n digwydd

have gone out to individual schools to ask for them. We now have better systems, I think. Across our region, we've had the development of the teacher centre, as a data collection centre and so on, and that facilitates our work. Similarly, in the secondary sector, all our secondary schools have the same data-gathering system, where, in the past, we've had three separate ones. So, there have been developments in terms of data collection and also data quality.

Suzy Davies: Is there a role for the consortium to help with consistency of data?

Mr Morgans: Certainly. Part of Catrin's work is that she is part of the ERW group in terms of the Welsh language. They have the responsibility, in a way, to look at Welsh language data. There is a lot more discussion, perhaps, across local authority boundaries, in terms of how we collect data and share data, and share good practice.

Suzy Davies: So, it appears to me that you don't welcome the idea of the Government setting the targets for local authorities.

Mr Morgans: The thing is, local knowledge is very important, I think, and building on what we already have. In terms of a number of targets in the document, we in Carmarthenshire have attained them already. Well, in terms of those targets, we could sit back and say, 'Some of the percentages have been achieved.' But the thing is, we have a greater challenge with the higher targets. In the school system, there are certain strong schools carrying the others. In the education system also, we have to play our part in attaining those targets.

Suzy Davies: Do you share some of your good practice with other councils?

Mr Morgans: We'd be willing to do so. That's a weakness in the system at present. It's a weakness in terms of the WESPs generally, I think, in terms of the Welsh language. There hasn't been enough opportunity to discuss and share what's happening. It happens locally, perhaps. But I

efallai'n lleol. Ond rwy'n credu byddai cyfle pe bai rhyw fath o achlysur yn flynyddol o ran rhannu beth sy'n digwydd, a byddem ni'n dysgu, rwy'n siŵr, o awdurdodau eraill ar draws Cymru am rhai o'r pethau yr ydym ni'n methu â'u cyflawni. Rydym yn teimlo ambell waith, efallai, ein bod ni ychydig yn ynysig. Mae pawb yn gyrru ei agenda eu hunain, o ran y cynllun. Efallai fod sir arall mewn rhanbarth arall yn gwneud rhywbeth tebyg; ac felly pam yr ydym yn gwneud gwaith ar ein pennau'n hunain? Felly, byddem yn croesawu rhyw fath o rwydwaith i rannu arfer.

think there would be an opportunity if there was some sort of annual event in terms of sharing what's happening, and we would learn, I'm sure, from other areas in Wales in terms of some of the things that we've not been able to achieve. We sometimes feel slightly isolated. Everyone is driving their own agenda, in terms of the plan. Perhaps another county in another region is doing something similar; and so why are we all working on our own? So, I would welcome some sort of network to share practice.

[158] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch. Simon wants to come in, does he?

[159] **Ann Jones:** Simon, do you want to come in?

[160] **Simon Thomas:** Ie, jest rhywbeth penodol iawn fan hyn: rydym ni'n sôn am addysg Gymraeg, ond, o edrych ar y dystiolaeth sydd wedi'i chyflwyno eisoes, mae'r diffiniad o addysg Gymraeg yn amrywio o le i le—addysg ddwyieithog, ffrwd Gymraeg a phethau gwahanol. Mae hen hanes yn Nyfed a sir Gâr, wrth gwrs, o ddiffinio ysgolion yn y modd hwn. A ydych chi'n glir ynghylch beth yw addysg Gymraeg? A yw'r gymdeithas llywodraeth leol yn teimlo fod digon o ddiffiniadau neu ganllawiau ar y lefel genedlaethol i yrru'r broses hon? Nid oes pwynt gweithredu ar gynlluniau lleol os yw'r diffiniad yn amrywio ar hyd a lled y wlad.

Simon Thomas: Just something specific here: we are talking about Welsh-medium education, but, in looking at the evidence that has been presented already, the definition of Welsh-medium education varies from place to place—bilingual education, a Welsh-medium stream and different things. There is a long history in Dyfed and Carmarthenshire, of course, of defining schools in this way. Are you clear what Welsh-medium education is? Does the WLGA feel that there are sufficient definitions or guidance at the national level to drive this process? There is no point in implementing local plans if the definition varies across the country.

[161] **Mr Morgans:** Rwy'n cytuno â'r sylwadau hynny. Hynny yw, yn sir Gâr, rydym yn defnyddio'r term 'addysg ddwyieithog' oherwydd pan ydym yn defnyddio'r term 'addysg Gymraeg' mae hynny, yn fy mhrofiad i, yn tynnu llawer o sylw a gwrthwynebiad hefyd. Pan ydym yn sôn am greu disgyblion dwyieithog, lle mae'r Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn ddwy iaith gyntaf, mewn ffordd, mae llawer fwy o dderbyn gan y rhieni o'r ffordd hwnnw o weithio. Felly, byddem yn croesawu rhyw fath o eglurder o ran beth yw'r disgwyliadau o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Byddem ni'n dadlau fod eisiau addysg ddwyieithog, achos mae'r Saesneg yr un mor bwysig ac mae'n rhaid cael y sgiliau hynny ac felly mae'n rhaid gwneud peth gwaith drwy'r Saesneg er mwyn cael y sgiliau Saesneg. Nid wyf yn siŵr os

Mr Morgans: I agree with those comments. In Carmarthenshire, we use the term 'bilingual education' because when we use the term 'Welsh-medium education' that, in my experience, attracts a lot of comment and also some opposition. When we talk about creating bilingual pupils, where both Welsh and English are first languages, in a way, there is far greater acceptance among the parents of that approach. So, I would welcome some clarity in terms of what the expectations are in relation to Welsh-medium education. We would argue that you need a bilingual education, because English is just as important and you need those skills and so, you need to do some work through the medium of English in order to have those skills. I'm not sure if Catrin has anything to add.

oes gan Catrin unrhyw sylwadau.

[162] **Ms Griffiths:** Rwy'n credu hefyd bod y sefyllfa sydd gennym yn sir Gâr yn hanesyddol—. Buom yn sôn am 70 y cant o wersi drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn creu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, felly dyna oedd ein diffiniad ni, sydd yn awr yn rhywbeth cenedlaethol. Y gwir yw, beth sydd wedi bod yn anodd inni yw cynnal y ddarpariaeth honno ar draws cyfnod allweddol 2 a chyfnod allweddol 3, a hefyd newid meddylfryd rhieni. Mae gennym gymhlethdod hefyd, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, dwy ffrwd, ac yna ysgolion sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn benodedig Saesneg, fel petai. Yr her sydd gennym ni wedyn yw cynnal y plant lle mae'r rhieni efallai yn teimlo ei bod yn iawn iddyn nhw gael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg hyd at 11 oed, ond eu bod wedyn yn symud ar draws y ffin ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 3.

[163] Yn ogystal â hynny, mae sefyllfa sy'n codi bron â bod yn ddyddiol gyda ni nawr. Mae 11 o ysgolion dwy ffrwd gyda ni yn y sir ac mae nifer helaeth o'r rheini yn barod wedi symud i fod yn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Yn anffodus, rydym ni wrth gefn iddyn nhw fel awdurdod, ac mae ERW wrth gefn iddyn nhw fel consortiwm, ond, yn genedlaethol, mae'r Ddeddf drafnidiaeth yn creu sefyllfa anodd iawn i symud ysgolion sydd wedi symud yn organig, os hoffech chi. Hynny yw, mae rhieni wedi derbyn bod y plant yn cael addysg ddwyieithog yn y ffrwd Gymraeg ac nad ydynt yn y ffrwd Saesneg; nid oes digon o Gymraeg yn y ffrydiau Saesneg. Felly, maen nhw'n barod wedi symud, ond oherwydd ein sefyllfa ni o ran y Ddeddf ac yn y blaen, mae wedi creu sefyllfa anodd iawn. Yn anffodus wedyn, rydym yn llithro yn ôl a symud yn ôl er bod ein penaethiaid ni i gyd *on board* ac maen nhw'n eisiau symud eu hysgolion ymlaen. Felly, mae'r her yn mynd i fod yn wahanol ym mhob un awdurdod, ym mhob un consortiwm, ac yn genedlaethol. Ond rwyf yn credu, o'n hochr ni yn ymarferol, o ran symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwmm ieithyddol—achos rwyf yn credu mai dyna beth yw ein her ni a dyna beth sy'n bwysig i ni ar draws ERW—rhaid gwneud hynny a sicrhau bod y drysau ar agor i ni ei wneud ac nad ydym yn gorfod hala 18 mis ar

Ms Griffiths: I think also that the situation that we have in Carmarthenshire historically—. We were talking about 70 per cent of lessons in the medium of Welsh creating Welsh-medium education, so that was our definition, which is now something that is national. The truth is, what's been difficult for us is maintaining that provision across key stage 2 and key stage 3, and also to change parents' way of thinking. We have also have the complexity, as you said, of Welsh-medium education, two streams, and then those schools that are, to all intents and purposes, designated English-medium schools, as it were. The challenge we have then is to support the children where the parents feel it's okay for them to have Welsh-medium education up to the age of 11, but then they move across the border for key stage 3.

As well as that, we have a situation that arises almost daily now. We have 11 two-stream schools in the county and many of those have already become Welsh-medium schools. Unfortunately, we're behind them as an authority, and ERW is behind them as a consortium, but, nationally, the travel Measure has created a very difficult situation to move schools that have moved organically, if you like. That is, parents have accepted that children will have bilingual education in the Welsh stream and that they will not in the English stream; there is not enough Welsh in the English streams. So, they have already moved, but, because of our situation in terms of the Measure and so on, it has created a very difficult situation. Unfortunately then, we are slipping back and moving backwards although all our heads are on board and they want to move their schools on. So, the challenge is going to be different in every authority, in every consortium, and nationally. But I think, from our point of view on a practical level, in terms of moving schools along the linguistic continuum—because I believe that is the challenge for us and that is what is important for us across ERW—we must do that and ensure that the doors are open for us to do that and that we don't have to spend 18 months consulting and then have a formal consultation and so on. Because that, unfortunately, then comes

ymgyngori ac yna ymgynghori'n ffurfiol ac yn blaen. Achos mae hynny wedyn, yn anffodus, yn bwrw lan agweddau pobl sydd yn hollol yn erbyn yr iaith efallai nad ydynt ag unrhyw beth i'w wneud â'r ysgol, *actually*—nid oes ganddynt blant na dim byd yn yr ysgol. Ond mae'n creu sefyllfa anodd iawn i'r penaethiaid ac mae nifer ohonynt wedyn yn teimlo, 'Wel, pam ddylem ni fynd lawr yr heol yna, achos mae'n mynd i fod yn anodd ac yn heriol iawn?' Felly, hwyluso hynny byddai'n symud pethau dipyn i ni.

[164] **Suzy Davies:** Jest i orffen ar hyn *really*, achos, fel y dywedoch chi, rydych chi wedi dewis polisi dwyieithog fel yr ydych chi wedi disgrifio, ond mae hynny wedi creu problemau i chi gyda'r eirfa o ran setio targedau. Sut a ydych chi wedi ymdopi â hynny yn y diwedd?

[165] **Mr Morgans:** Wel, rydym wedi ceisio ymateb ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn y targedau ac ati, ond y rheswm mai 'dwyieithog' yw e i ni yw oherwydd rwyf yn credu bod y gair 'Cymraeg' yn gallu hala ofn ar rieni. Ond maen nhw'n hyderus ac yn ddigon hapus os ydym ni'n creu dysgwyr dwyieithog. Rwyf yn credu bod yr her yn dod wedyn. Mae trosglwyddo yn her i rai plant blwyddyn 6 yn mynd i flwyddyn 7. Hynny sy'n creu trafferth i ni o ran targedau. O ran targedau trosglwyddo, mae yna opsiynau i gael yn sir Gâr, yn wahanol, efallai, i rai siroedd eraill, lle, os yw plant wedi dilyn llwybr cynradd Cymraeg, mae'n naturiol eu bod nhw'n mynd i ysgol uwchradd gyfun Gymraeg—neu, mewn rhai siroedd, nid oes y dewis uwchradd Cymraeg ar gael i bawb. Ond, yn sir Gâr, mae yna ddewis o'r Gymraeg neu o'r Saesneg neu'r ysgol AB, B, 2A, 2B, hynny yw, yr holl gategoreiddio cymhleth sydd gyda ni yn y system. Felly, mae hynny'n her i ni ac rydym yn colli rhai plant ar ddiwedd cyfnod allweddol 2 i addysg fwy Saesneg. Mae hynny'n siom, oherwydd yr holl fewnbwn yn y cynradd, ond dyna'r her ni ac mae ein gwaith ni, yn rhan o'r cynllun yma, yw trio sicrhau bod y rheini'n sicr yn parhau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3. Un o'r pethau mae Catrin wastad yn dweud wrthyf yw bod eisiau dwy neu dair blynedd yn yr uwchradd i'w gwneud nhw'n rhugl ddwyieithog. Yna, cyn dechrau TGAU, mae nhw'n ddwyieithog llwyr ac yn gallu

up against the attitudes of people who are totally against the language who perhaps don't have anything to do with the school, actually—they don't have children or anything in the school. But it creates a very difficult situation for the heads and a number of them then feel, 'Well, why should we go down that route, because it's going to be difficult and very challenging?' So, facilitating that would move things on a lot for us.

Suzy Davies: Just to finish on this really, because, as you said, you have chosen a bilingual policy as you've described, but that has created problems for you with the vocabulary in terms of setting targets. How have you coped with that, ultimately?

Mr Morgans: Well, we have tried to respond and the Welsh Government has accepted our targets and so on, but the reason it's 'bilingual' for us is that the word 'Welsh' can alarm parents. But they are confident and quite happy if we are creating bilingual pupils. I believe that the challenge comes later. Transition is a challenge for some children going from year 6 to year 7. That's what creates problems for us in terms of targets. In terms of transition targets, there are options available in Carmarthenshire, which is different, perhaps, from other counties, where, if the children have followed the Welsh-medium primary route, it's natural that they will go to a Welsh-medium secondary comprehensive school—or, in some counties, not everyone has the choice of a Welsh-medium secondary school. But, in Carmarthenshire, there is the choice of Welsh-medium, or English-medium, or the AB, B, 2A, 2B schools, that is, all of the complex categories that we have in the system. So, that is a challenge for us and we do lose some children at the end of key stage 2 to more English-medium education. That is disappointing, because of all the input in the primary sector, but that's the challenge for us and our work, as part of the WESP, is to try to ensure that they do transfer to key stage 3. One thing that Catrin keeps telling me that you need two or three years in the secondary sector to make them fluently bilingual. Then, by the start of GCSE, they are totally

cyfathrebu, ysgrifennu a darllen yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg. Yna, os ydyn nhw'n dewis gwneud y mwyafrif o'u pynciau yn Saesneg, maen nhw yn dal yn ddinasyddion dwyieithog rhugl erbyn hynny. Felly, hynny yw'r her i ni. Rŷm ni'n colli rhyw 10 i 15 y cant ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae dros 50 y cant o'n plant cynradd ni mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ond, erbyn diwedd cyfnod allweddol 3, rhyw 35 i 38 y cant sy'n cael eu hasesu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, iaith gyntaf. Mae hynny'n siom, ond, drwy ad-drefnu addysg yn ysgolion Bro Dinefwr a Dyffryn Aman, rŷm ni'n gobeithio bydd y canran yna'n cynyddu'n sylweddol eleni ac yn sicr mewn dwy neu dair blynedd, oherwydd mae'r ysgolion hynny wedi datblygu darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn ysgol uwchradd ddwyieithog.

[166] **Ms Griffiths:** Sori i dorri ar draws, ond hefyd mae angen i ni sicrhau dealltwriaeth o fanteision dwyieithrwydd, achos gyda rhieni sy'n ffonio, ac rwyf yn cael nifer o alwadau ffôn yn dweud—wel, maen nhw mor wrth-Gymraeg. Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, mae'n nhw'n ddigon hapus nes bod y plentyn yn 11. Ond mae angen i ni gael y negeseuon cryf yna allan heb emosiwn jest i bobl ddeall beth yw manteision dwyieithrwydd ac addysg ddwyieithog. Rwyf yn credu unwaith rwyf yn gofyn i rieni ac yn siarad nhw trwyddo beth yw e'n gyfan gwbl—nid ydynt yn deall y sefyllfa. Maen nhw'n poeni nad yw eu plant nhw yn mynd i allu gwneud pethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

11:30

[167] Unwaith maen nhw'n dechrau sylweddoli beth yw'r manteision, a'r ffaith ein bod ni i gyd fel rhieni yn yr un sefyllfa—. Nid wyf eisiau mynd trwy'r holl gwestiynau sy'n codi, fel gwaith cartref ac yn y blaen. Wel, nid ydym ni'n gallu eu helpu nhw—nid yw'n unrhyw beth i ymwneud â'r iaith; nid wyf yn gallu gwneud ffiseg, ychwaith. Felly, mae'r ochr yna, ac nid yw'r plant eu hunain eisiau cymorth pan fônt yn yr uwchradd. Felly, mae nifer helaeth o bethau yna, ac fe allwch chi chwalu'r rheini, ond mae rhiant yn poeni amdany'n nhw oherwydd eu bod yn teimlo eu bod nhw wedi gwneud penderfyniad dros y plant, felly mae'r

bilingual and can communicate, write and read in Welsh and English. Then, if they choose to study the majority of their subjects through English, they are still fluent, bilingual citizens by then. So, that is the challenge for us. We lose some 10 to 15 per cent at the moment. So, over 50 per cent of our primary pupils are in Welsh-medium schools but, by the end of key stage 3, some 35 to 38 per cent are assessed through the medium of Welsh, first language. That is a disappointment, but, by reorganising education in Bro Dinefwr and Amman Valley schools, we hope that that percentage will increase significantly this year and certainly over two or three years, because those schools have developed Welsh-medium provision in a bilingual secondary school.

Ms Griffiths: Sorry to interrupt, but there also is a need for us to ensure understanding of the advantages of bilingualism, because parents who ring up, and I have a number of phone calls saying—well, they are so anti-Welsh language. As I said, they are happy enough until the child is 11. But we need to get those strong messages out without emotion just for people to understand the benefits of bilingualism and bilingual education. I think once I ask the parents and talk them through what it is entirely—they don't understand the situation. They're concerned that their child is not going to be able to do things through the medium of Welsh.

Once they start to realise what the benefits are, and the fact that all of us as parents are in the same situation—. I don't want to go through all the questions that arise, such as homework and so on. Well, we can't help them—it's nothing to do with the language; I can't do physics, either. So, there's that side of things, and the children themselves don't want any help when they're in secondary school. So, there are a number of things like that, and you can address those, but the parent is concerned about them because they feel that they have made a decision for the child, so the responsibility is, in some ways, greater for them. I think, if we can spread the

cyfrifoldeb yn bron â bod yn fwy iddyn nhw. Rwy'n credu, os allwn ni lledu'r holl fanteision allan ar lefel genedlaethol—. Rŷm ni'n ei wneud yn sirol, ac rwy'n credu ei fod yn bwysig i ni drïo targedu'r disgyblion yn ogystal â'r rhieni, achos mai nhw yn y pen draw sy'n mynd i ddefnyddio'r iaith, a beth yr ydym ni eisiau yw bod yr iaith yn mynd yn iaith gymdeithasol, nid yn iaith byd addysg. Ar hyn o bryd, mae perygl taw dyna beth fydd hi, oherwydd y broblem nad yw'r plant yn defnyddio'r iaith tu hwnt i'r dosbarth, ac yn y blaen. Felly, os allwn ni gyda phethau fel siarter iaith Gwynedd—rŷm ni edrych i mewn i hynny, ac rydym ni'n gobeithio gwneud rhywbeth tebyg ar draws ERW, ond yn sicr yn sir Gaerfyrddin y tymor nesaf, lle mae'r plant eu hunain yn ymfalchïo yn yr iaith ac â dealltwriaeth o beth mae'r iaith yn golygu iddyn nhw, a'i bod hi'n eu gwneud nhw tamaid bach yn wahanol, a'i bod yn arf ychwanegol fydd yn ei helpu nhw yn eu gyrfaedd ac yn y dyfodol. Os gallwn ni droi meddylfryd y plant, y disgyblion, bydd y rhieni yn dod â nhw. Ond beth sydd gennym ni yn awr yw diffyg dealltwriaeth. Felly, mae'r ochr manteision yn bwysig tu hwnt.

message about all the benefits of bilingualism on a national level—. We do this at a county level, and I think that it's important for us to try to target pupils as well as the parents, because they are the ones, ultimately, who are going to use the language, and what we want is that the language is a social one, and that it's not just a language of education. At the moment, there's a danger that that is what will happen, because of the problem that children are not using the language outside the classroom, and so on. So, if we could with things like the Gwynedd language charter—we are looking into that, and we're hoping to do something similar across ERW, but certainly in Carmarthenshire next term, whereby the children themselves are proud of the language and understand what the language means to them, and that it makes them a little bit different, and that it is an additional tool that will help them in their careers and in the future. If we can change the children's way of thinking, their parents will come with them. But what we have now is a lack of understanding. So, the benefits aspect is extremely important.

[168] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. That's it, thanks.

[169] **Ann Jones:** Local authority delivery—Keith.

[170] **Keith Davies:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Bore da. Nid wyf eisiau sôn am y targedau ac yn y blaen, rwyf eisiau sôn am y WESPs a'r awdurdodau lleol, achos mae yna amrywiaeth; maen nhw i gyd yn dechrau o sefyllfa wahanol. Wedyn, a ydy beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn gofyn amdano yn y WESPs yn llawer rhy gymhleth i ambell i awdurdod? Rŷch chi wedi sôn yn gynharach eich bod chi wedi llenwi 60 o dudalennau i chi yn sir Gâr, ond beth am weddill Cymru—siroedd bach, efallai, mewn ardaloedd Saesneg? A ydy beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn gofyn amdano nawr, jest o ran yr ysgrifennu, yn llawer rhy gymhleth iddyn nhw?

Keith Davies: Thank you, Chair. Good morning. I don't want to talk about the targets and so on, I want to talk about the WESPs and the local authorities, because there is variation; they all start from a different position. Then, is what the Government has asked for in the WESPs much too complex for some local authorities? You mentioned earlier that you had filled 60 pages in Carmarthenshire, but what about the rest of Wales—those small counties, perhaps, in English-speaking areas? Is what the Government asking for now, just in terms of writing, far too complex for them?

[171] **Mr Morgans:** Roeddwn yn darllen y cyfarwyddyd y cawsom ni y bore yma i atgoffa fy hunan o'r cyfarwyddyd y cawsom ni, ac un o'r sylwadau sydd ynddo yw y dylid bod yn ddefnyddiol i'r awdurdod lleol. Nid wyf yn credu bod dogfen sir Gaerfyrddin—66 tudalen—yn ddefnyddiol i fi yn fy

Mr Morgans: I read the guidance this morning to remind myself of the guidance that we had, and one of the comments in there is that it should be useful to the local authority. I don't think that Carmarthenshire's document—all 66 pages—is useful to me in my day-to-day work. I

ngwaith bob dydd. Nid wyf yn anghytuno â'r amcanion a'r targedau—mae'n iawn ein bod ni'n cael y rheini—ond mae pawb â system cynllunio busnes ei hunain yn barod. I gyd rwy'n gwneud nawr yw cymryd y rheini a'u rhoi nhw yn ein system busnes ni hefyd. Felly, mae yna ddyblygu gwaith yma. Mae strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru'n glir—pam mae'n rhaid cael rhyw dempled cymhleth, hirwyntog, sydd â manylder eithafol, yn fy marn i, ynddo fe ar gyfer proses monitro neu broses gwirio fan hyn? Ar ddiwedd y dydd, beth sy'n bwysig yw bod y canlyniadau neu dargedau'n cael eu cyrraedd neu'r canlyniadau'n cynyddu.

[172] Mae'n dogfen ni yn sir Gâr yn fwy cymhleth oherwydd rŷm ni wedi rhoi adroddiad ar yr iaith yn sir Gâr hefyd yn rhan ohono fe. Felly, mwy na thebyg, nid yw rhai siroedd eraill yn 66 tudalen—rwy'n siŵr eu bod nhw'n fyrrach—ond eto, fe gawson ni her wrth inni greu'r ddogfen. Roeddwn i'n ysgrifennu pethau dim ond er mwyn eu cofnodi nhw ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae pethau sy'n rhan naturiol o'r ffordd rydym ni'n gweithio yn sir Gâr. Felly, mae cael un model i bawb yn bach o her, rwy'n credu. Byddai llawer gwell petawn ni wedi cael, 'Dyma'r nod, dyma'r amcanion; rhowch ddogfen i ni sydd, yn eich barn chi, yn siwtio'ch cynllun busnes chi ac sydd yn mynd i'w gyflawni fe'. Byddai'n iawn wedyn iddyn nhw'n dod yn ôl a herio a gofyn am rai pethau ychwanegol, ond byddai wedi bod yn llawer haws i ni. Hefyd, rwy'n credu bod hi'n her hefyd o ran ymgynghori ar y ddogfen, achos rydych yn ymgynghori ar ddogfen o ryw 40 tudalen gyda rhieni a rhanddeiliaid ac, ar ddiwedd y dydd, faint o'r rheini oedd yn deall y cyfan yn iawn ac yn gallu ymateb yn briodol? Y gwrthwynebiad y gawsom ni oedd wrth bobl nad oedd eisiau dysgu'r Gymraeg, ond nid oedd llawer o gefnogaeth wrth y rhai oedd yn hapus gyda fe ychwaith. Mae'n broses trafferthus a heriol ac, erbyn hyn, wrth gwrs, mae fforwm y Gymraeg gyda ni ym mhob sir. Felly, mae rôl gyda nhw, efallai, i'n cadw ni i weithio, i ddatblygu ac i gyrraedd y canlyniadau. Rŷm ni'n sicr yn cael her oddi wrth ein grŵp ni yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Pan ydym ni'n cwrdd, rhyw bedair gwaith y flwyddyn, maen nhw moyn manylder, manylion a chynnydd. Felly, mae'r ddogfen fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, rwy'n credu, yn

don't disagree with the aims and objectives, or the targets—it's right that we should have them—but everyone has their own business planning approach already. All I'm doing now is taking those and putting them into our business system as well. So, there is duplication of work there. The Welsh Government's strategy is clear—why do we have to have a complex template that is excessively lengthy and requires far too much detail, in my opinion, within it for a monitoring process or a checking process here? At the end of the day, what's important is that the outcomes or targets are attained or that progress is made.

Our document in Carmarthenshire is more complex because we have also included a report on the language in Carmarthenshire as part of it. So, more than likely, those of some other counties are not 66 pages—I'm sure they're shorter—but, again, we were challenged in writing the document. I was writing things just to record them for the Welsh Government. There are things that are a natural part of the way in which we operate in Carmarthenshire. So, having a one-size-fits-all model is something of a challenge, I think. It would be far better if we'd been told, 'Here's the objective, here are the aims; give us a document that, in your opinion suits your business plan and will achieve it'. It would be fine then if they came back and challenged it and asked for additional things, but it would have been far easier for us. Also, I think that it's also a challenge in consulting on the document, because you're consulting on a 40-page-odd document with parents and stakeholders and, at the end of the day, how many understood the document fully and could respond appropriately? The objections we received were from people who didn't want Welsh-medium education, but there wasn't much support from those who were happy with that provision either. So, it's been a difficult and challenging process and, by now, of course, we have a Welsh language forum in every county. So, they have a role, perhaps, in holding our noses to the grindstone and achieving our targets. We're certainly challenged by our group in Carmarthenshire. When we meet, some four times a year, they want detail, specifics and progress. So, the document at present is difficult, I think.

anodd.

[173] **Keith Davies:** Mae dau beth yn codi o beth yr ydych chi wedi'i ddweud fanna. Yn gyntaf i gyd, nid wy'n credu bod yr un cynllun wedi cael ei dderbyn gan y Gweinidog heb ei fod wedi'i anfon e nôl i newid pethau. So, efallai eu bod nhw'n rhy gymhleth. Wedyn, gyda RhAG yn gynharach heddiw, nid yw'r fforwm ym mhob sir yn cwrdd. Mae sir Gâr efallai yn wahanol.

[174] **Mr Morgans:** Un feirniadaeth ar Lywodraeth Cymru yw na chawsom ni unrhyw gyfarwyddyd am y fforwm. Felly, mae pawb wedi mynd wrthi ar ben eu hunain i greu rhywbeth. Nid oedd rhyw fath o dempled ar gyfer fforwm. Felly, yn sir Gâr, rŷm ni wedi cynnwys aelodau etholedig, mae gyda ni benaethiaid, mae gyda ni'r Mudiad Meithrin, ac ati, felly rŷm ni wedi trio cael trawstoriad, ond byddai rhyw fath o arweiniad clir wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol er mwyn bod rhyw gysondeb o ran y fforymau.

[175] **Keith Davies:** Dyna pam rŷm ni'n craffu fan hyn, ac mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig, rwy'n credu. Un peth arall, a'r cwestiwn sylfaenol mor belled ag y mae'r awdurdodau yn y cwestiwn yw a ydyn nhw'n ymateb nawr i'r galw am addysg Gymraeg? Anghofiwech am y targedau. A ydy pob rhiant sydd eisiau i'w plentyn neu eu plant gael addysg Gymraeg yng Nghymru yn cael addysg Gymraeg i'w plant nawr?

[176] **Mr Morgans:** Nid yw'r manylder gen i am siroedd eraill. Mae yna hanesion am bobl sydd efallai yn methu â chael lle mewn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg ac ati. Efallai fod y busnes mesur am y Gymraeg yma yn rhywbeth sy'n addas i rai siroedd yn fwy nag i eraill. Byddem ni'n dadlau, o'n safbwynt ni yn sir Gâr, nad oes eisiau mesur am y galw gyda ni, gan ein bod ni'n gallu cyflawni'r holl leoedd sydd eu heisiau ar hyn o bryd arnom ni. Rŷm ni yn gwybod am fannau o fewn y sir lle mae yna fwy o alw na mannau eraill, ac rŷm ni yn ymateb i hynny drwy'r system aildrefnu ysgolion ac ati. Os oes yna achosion fel yna'n digwydd, wel, mae'n anfaddeuol, mewn ffordd, fod plant sy'n dymuno cael addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg—. Roeddwn i yn clywed esiampyl yn gynharach, yn yr ystafell gyfarfod, am blentyn o un

Keith Davies: Two things arise from what you have just said there. First of all, I don't think that a single plan was accepted by the Minister without being sent back for changes to be made. So, perhaps they are too complex. Then, with RhAG earlier today, the forum don't meet in every county. Perhaps Carmarthenshire is different.

Mr Morgans: One criticism of the Welsh Government would be that we weren't given any kind of direction on the fora. So, everyone's gone about creating something on their own. There was no kind of template for establishing a forum. So, in Carmarthenshire, we've included elected members, we've got headteachers, we've got Mudiad Meithrin and so on, so we have tried to get a cross-section of people, but having some clear guidance would have been useful to us in terms of providing consistency for the fora.

Keith Davies: That's why we undertake scrutiny here, and that is an important point, I think. One other thing, and the fundamental question as far local authorities are concerned is do they respond now to the demand for Welsh-medium education? Forget about the targets. Does every parent who wants their child or children to have a Welsh-medium education in Wales get a Welsh-medium education for their children now?

Mr Morgans: I don't have any of the detail for any other counties. There are stories about people who perhaps can't access Welsh-medium education. Perhaps this issue of assessing demand is more appropriate in some counties than in others. We would argue, from our perspective in Carmarthenshire, that we don't need to assess the demand, as we're able to deliver all the placements that are currently required. We do know of certain areas in the county where there is a greater demand than in others, and we are able to respond to that through the school reorganisation system and so on. If cases like that do arise, then it's unforgivable in a way that children who do want a Welsh-medium education—. I was listening to one example earlier, in the meeting room, about a child in another authority—which I won't

awdurdod—ni wnaif ei enwi—sydd wedi dilyn llwybr cyfrwng Cymraeg hyd at 13 oed, a bod y dewis yna yn cael ei dynnu nawr oddi wrth y plentyn yna . Os oes yna newid i fod, byddwn i eisiau gweld y plant yna yn mynd drwy'r system cyn rhoi'r newid yn ei le, ond efallai fod yna esiamplau ar draws Cymru o hynny'n digwydd.

[177] **Keith Davies:** Rydym wedi clywed hefyd, rwy'n credu oddi wrthyh chi ac wrth RhAG, fod diffyg cyllid wedi amharu ar y cyfle i rieni gael addysg Gymraeg, a bod awdurdodau wedi sôn oherwydd diffyg cyllid eu bod nhw'n ffael ymateb i'r galw. A ydy hynny'n wir? Rŷm ni nawr â'r arian ychwanegol hwn. Yn sicr, yn ardal Llanelli, mae miliynau wedi cael eu rhoi o dan y cynllun newydd, ysgolion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Pam mae Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru yn dweud bod ambell awdurdod, oherwydd diffyg cyllid, yn ffael ymateb?

[178] **Mr Morgans:** Rwy'n credu ei fod e'n dibynnu ar beth yw blaenoriaethau'r awdurdod yna o ran buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ac ati. Mae yna awdurdodau lle mae cyflwr adeiladau'r ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg yn wael, felly maen nhw'n blaenoriaethu yn eu rhaglen beth yw'r anghenion. Mae rhai awdurdodau hefyd yn fwy effeithiol o ran y rhaglen ysgolion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ac efallai yn creu mwy o brosiectau ac ati. O ran y cyllid yn ganolog, rwy'n credu bod yna bwysau aruthrol ar awdurdodau lleol i wneud mwy gyda llai, a hefyd mae yna nifer o flaenoriaethau. Codi safonau, yn sicr, yw'r brif flaenoriaeth gyda phob awdurdod, byddwn i'n ei ddweud, a hynny drwy ddatblygu dysgu ac addysgu ac arweinyddiaeth. Efallai mewn rhai ardaloedd fod y Gymraeg yn is i lawr y rhestr yna o ran blaenoriaethau—nid oherwydd nad oes diddordeb na'r chwant i wneud pethau, ond mae yna bwysau ar feincnodi, a lefel 2 cymhwysol, dangosyddion pwnc craidd ac ati. Mae'r pwysau yna ar awdurdodau lleol, ac ysgolion a'r rhanbarth hefyd.

[179] **Keith Davies:** Beth ŷch chi'n credu y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i wella'r sefyllfa, i gefnogi'r awdurdodau hyn sydd â thrafferthion yn llenwi'r ffurflenni neu

name—who had gone down the route of Welsh-medium education up to the age of 13, and then that choice has been taken away from that child. If there is to be change, I would want to see those children completing their journey through the system before seeing those changes implemented, but there may be examples of this across Wales.

Keith Davies: We have also heard, I think from you and from RhAG, that a lack of funding has had an impact on the opportunity for parents to have Welsh-medium education, and that authorities have said, because of a lack of funds, they've been unable to meet the demand. Is that true? We now have this additional funding. Certainly, in the Llanelli area, millions have been provided under the new twenty-first century schools programme. Why is the Association of Directors of Education in Wales saying that some authorities, because of a lack of funding, can't respond?

Mr Morgans: I think it depends on what the priorities of that authority are, in terms of investment in school buildings and so on. There are authorities where the buildings of English-medium schools are in a very bad condition, so they are prioritising in their programmes what those needs are. Some authorities are also more effective in terms of the twenty-first century schools programme and perhaps create more projects and so on. In terms of the central funding, I think there is huge pressure on local authorities to do more with less, and there are a number of competing priorities. Raising standards, of course, is the major priority for all authorities, I would say, and doing that through the development of teaching, learning and leadership. In some areas, perhaps the Welsh language comes lower down that list of priorities—not necessarily because there isn't any interest or will to do things, but because of pressure on benchmarking, on level 2 inclusive, core subject indicators and so on. That pressure's on local authorities, schools and the regions too.

Keith Davies: What do you think the Welsh Government should do to improve the situation, to support these authorities having difficulties filling in the forms or responding

yn ymateb i addysg Gymraeg? Ffordd ddylai'r Llywodraeth arwain?

[180] **Mr Morgans:** Yn bersonol, rwy'n credu rŷm ni wedi cael cefnogaeth dda wrth y swyddogion sydd ar gael, ond nid yw'n gefnogaeth reolaidd. Hynny yw, rŷm ni wedi cael cyfarfodydd, rŷm ni'n cael trafodaethau adeiladol, ac rŷm ni'n cael addewidion, ond, yn aml iawn, tîm bach o bobl sy'n gyfrifol am y darn mawr yma o waith. Efallai fod yna *issue* o ran capasiti y tîm yna i gefnogi awdurdodau lleol. Rwy'n credu y byddai arweiniad ar ran sut mae mesur y galw yn gymorth, neu rannu arfer, 'te. Ni fyddwn i eisïau rhyw broses—. Pan fyddwch chi'n ad-drefnu addysg, mae'n broses gymhleth, hir, ac mae'r ymgynghori yn gallu bod yn her, ond os oes yna'r un lefel o waith ynglŷn â mesur y galw, wel, mae yna flaenoriaethau eraill yn mynd i fod o ran gwaith ymgynghori. Os oes yna arfer da yn rhywle yn rhyw sir yng Nghymru, mae eisïau inni wybod amdano fe, ac efallai nad ym ni yn gwybod am hynny ar hyn o bryd. Efallai fod eisïau'r fforwm neu'r fforwm rhannu yma, beth bynnag rydych chi'n moyn ei alw fe, yn cael ei gydlynu gan swyddogion Llywodraeth Cymru i gael rhannu'r arfer yna. Mae'n digwydd mewn rhai meysydd eraill. Efallai fod yna le i'w ddatblygu e fan hyn.

[181] **Ms Griffiths:** Roeddwn i jest yn mynd i ddweud hefyd rwy'n credu o'r ochr genedlaethol fod angen sicrhau bod y cyrsïau sabothol yn parhau. Un o'r problemau o ran, efallai, siroedd eraill yw darpariaeth ar gyfer bod mewn sefyllfa lle mae yna ddigon o bobl sy'n gallu darparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg o safon, sydd wedi cael yr ymrwymiad i'r iaith yn gynnar iawn ond, yn ogystal â hynny, wedi cael eu hyfforddi i addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'n un peth siarad Cymraeg, ond mae'n rhywbeth arall dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae yna nifer helaeth o'n hysgolion ni—gwnaethom ni awdit sgiliau yn sir Gaerfyrddin o ran darpariaeth, ac mae'n hollol bwysig bod rhaid inni gael yr athrawon gyda ni yn y lle cyntaf cyn ein bod ni'n gallu darparu. Rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n fwy o *issue* ar draws awdurdodau lleol eraill, felly, byddwn i'n awgrymu y byddai'n dda o beth petasai'r cyrsïau sabothol yn parhau, ac efallai, ein bod ni'n ychwanegu at y cyrsïau sabothol, achos

to Welsh-medium education? How should the Government be leading on this?

Mr Morgans: Personally, I think we've had good support from the officers who are available, but it's not regular support. That is to say, we've had meetings, we've had constructive discussions, and we've been promised certain things, but, very often, it's a small team of people responsible for this major piece of work. Perhaps there's an issue in terms of the capacity of that team to support local authorities. I do think that some guidance in terms of assessing demand would be of assistance, or sharing practice, then. I wouldn't want some process—. When you reconfigure education, it's a long, drawn-out and complex process, and consultation can be a challenge, but if there is that same level of work on assessing demand, well, other priorities are going to arise from the consultation exercise. If there is good practice going on elsewhere in some county in Wales, we need to know about it, and perhaps we don't get to hear about it at the moment. Perhaps there is a need for this forum or this sharing forum, or whatever you want to call it, to be co-ordinated by Welsh Government officials to share that practice. It happens in other areas. There may be room to develop it here.

Ms Griffiths: I was just going to say as well that I think, from a national point of view, there is a need to ensure that the sabbatical courses continue. One of the problems, perhaps, in terms of other counties, is provision for being in the position of there being enough people who can provide quality Welsh-medium education, who have had that commitment to the language very early on, but, in addition to that, who have been trained to teach through the medium of Welsh. It's one thing to speak Welsh, but it's another thing to teach through the medium of Welsh. A large number of our schools—we did a skills audit recently in terms of provision in Carmarthenshire, and it's extremely important that we have to have the teachers in the first place before we make provision. I think that's more of an issue across other local authorities, so I would suggest that it would be good thing if these sabbaticals continued and, perhaps, if we added to their number, because, at the moment, there is

ar hyn o bryd mae naill ai un cychwynnol neu un gloywi iaith. Beth rŷm ni wedi'i ffeindio yw bod nifer helaeth o'n hathrawon ni sydd yn medru'r Gymraeg efallai'n ddi-hyder yn y Gymraeg, ac maen nhw angen rhywbeth yn y canol.

[182] Yn fwy na hynny, achos dyna ble rŷm ni wedi buddsoddi tipyn o'n harian ni, unwaith maen nhw'n cael y cwrs sabothol ac mae'n nhw'n dod i ryw lefel—ac mae'r cwrs yn arbennig o dda fel mae'n gweithio, ond mae rhaid i chi gofio bod nifer helaeth o'r athrawon yna yn mynd nôl i mewn i sefyllfaoedd uniaith Saesneg—mae'r rôl ofalaeth yma yn hollol, hollol bwysig. Gallech chi byth gael un heb y llall. Yn anffodus, nid oes dim byd ar hyn o bryd yn y cynlluniau o ran sicrhau bod y cyrsiau sabothol yn parhau, a bod y rôl ofalaeth yn rhan o'r *package*, os hoffech chi, i sicrhau'r parhad yna. Mae'n drist o beth pan maen nhw'n dod i ryw lefel ar ôl y 12 wythnos, yn mynd nôl i sefyllfa ysgol, efallai, uniaith Saesneg a ddim yn cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r iaith ar y lefel yna, ac rŷm ni i gyd yn gwybod ein bod ni'n colli iaith yn gyflym iawn.

[183] **Mr Morgans:** Un stori yr oeddwn i wedi'i chlywed gan RhAG yn gynharach oedd ynglŷn â cholli'r arbenigedd i'r canol. Rŷm ni wedi bod yn ffodus yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae'r cyngor wedi rhoi cyllid i ni gyflogi Catrin am dridiau yr wythnos. Mae hwnnw yn sicr wedi bod yn gyfle inni ddatblygu nifer o'r amcanion a'r gwaith a oedd gyda ni yn y cynllun strategol. Heblaw am y mewnbwn yma, byddai wedi bod yn anodd iawn. Efallai fod rhywbeth yn fanna i'r Llywodraeth o ran rhoi rhyw adnodd bach i siroedd i ganolbwyntio ar yr agenda yma. Swyddog ERW mewn gwirionedd yw Catrin, ond rŷm ni wedi ei phrynu hi am dri diwrnod, ac mae'n datblygu deunyddiau marchnata, mae'n delio â rhieni ac mae'n cynghori ysgolion. Felly, mae yna bâr o ddwylo, a dyma'r agenda. Mae wedi hwyluso'n gwaith ni.

[184] **Keith Davies:** Ydy, mae'n bwysig. Diolch.

[185] **Ann Jones:** We're going to move on to assessing and meeting local demand. Lynne, are you going first?

either a beginner's course or one to brush up on your language skills. What we've found is that a large number of our teachers who can speak Welsh are perhaps not very confident in Welsh, and they need something somewhere in the middle.

More than that, because this is where we've invested quite a bit of our money, once they have completed the sabbatical and have reached a certain level—and the course, as it works, is very good, but you have to remember that the a large number of these teachers go back to English-only settings—the pastoral care role is vitally important. You could not possibly have one without the other. Unfortunately, there is nothing at the moment in the WESP plans to ensure that the sabbatical courses continue, and that that pastoral care role is a part of the whole package, if you like, to build on that momentum. It's very sad to see them reach a certain level after the end of the 12, going back into a setting that is perhaps English-only and not getting the opportunity to use the Welsh language on that level again, because we all know that we can lose languages very quickly.

Mr Morgans: One story I heard from RhAG earlier was about losing expertise to the centre. We've been very fortunate in Carmarthenshire. The council has given us funding to employ Catrin for three days a week. That has certainly been an opportunity for us to develop many of the objectives and the work that we had in our strategic plan. If it weren't for this input, it would've been very difficult. Perhaps there is something there for the Government in terms of providing some small resource for counties to be able to concentrate on this agenda. Catrin is an ERW officer, essentially, but we have been able to buy her in for three days, and she develops marketing materials, she deals with parents and she advises schools. So, there is a spare pair of hands, and this is the agenda. It has really helped to facilitate our activities.

Keith Davies: Yes, it's important. Thanks.

[186] **Lynne Neagle:** Just to ask, really, if you can expand on the written evidence you gave that Welsh development is lower on the list of priorities in some areas than others. Maybe you could give us some examples of where you think the geographical variations are.

[187] **Mr Morgans:** Os af i nôl i'r pwynt eto—. **Mr Morgans:** If I go back to the point again—.

[188] **Mr Morgans:** I'll answer this one in English, okay? I go back to the point that there are pressures on local authorities and consortia on improving standards, and I think that's the main agenda item. I think when you look at end of key stages, results et cetera, it's about improving those outcomes for those young people in language, maths and science. So, I think the focus on improving standards, with the focus on improving teaching, learning and improving leadership, really is the priority for most local authorities and consortia. Some local authorities are very small local authorities with small teams of people, and if you think, there are different models of consortia working across Wales, in some local authorities, there are very, very small numbers of officers, because most of the school improvement team and the professionals in that team have moved into the consortia work. It's slightly different in the west. So, the team are deployed from a central base. So, there is a lack of capacity maybe in the local authority itself to do some of this work, and, because of the pressures on school improvement and raising standards, the challenge advisers probably are preoccupied with that agenda. Unless there's clarity from the local authority that the priority is the Welsh language, and the development of the Welsh language and the improvement of the Welsh language, maybe it's not so clear in some areas.

11:45

[189] I'm not going to name authorities but that's the kind of general theme, because of increased pressure on chief education officers and on teams in local authorities, to improve the level 2 inclusive and improve the level 2, and the free school meals difference. So, sometimes, the Welsh language probably slips down that list of priorities, and it's a challenge. In Carmarthenshire, and probably in some of the other authorities in the west, it's high on our list of priorities because over three quarters of our schools are Welsh-medium schools. So, it's part of our daily work. I think there's been an issue in some authorities as well about having that level of support for Welsh-medium schools in some predominantly English-medium authorities, where that level of support through the medium of Welsh is needed for some aspects of school improvement. I think the directors are well aware of that challenge and are responding to it through recruitment et cetera, but it's a tough time and it's a tough agenda.

[190] **Ms Griffiths:** Jest i ychwanegu—. **Ms Griffiths:** Just to add—

[191] As far as ERW's concerned, we're actually in a position where the six authorities come together and the difference, linguistically, is vast, even just within one consortium. But it has enabled the officers to come together and for us to actually work together as a team of people. There are one or two of the local authorities where they are literally working on their own. They have nobody else. So, being able to come once on a termly basis to meet as ERW officers to look at, primarily the WESPs, and then at how we're going to move Welsh education forward, is enabling people to work off each other and to share good practice. With things like the Welsh language charter, we're actually going to look at that across ERW, specifically for Welsh as a second language. So, that's something that I think is a strength, as far as the consortium working is concerned, to give that body so that people have got somewhere to come and they know that they can bring all their issues and we can sort of bash it out because, basically, they're often on their own in their own local authorities.

[192] **Ann Jones:** David.

[193] **David Rees:** Just a quick couple of questions. You indicated earlier in your answers that you didn't think you needed to assess the needs, because you felt that you knew the needs, but I'm assuming there is a formal mechanism for assessing needs within the authority for the demand for Welsh-medium education, or bilingual education in your authority. Is that equivalent across all the education authorities in Wales? Do they have those formal mechanisms to assess the needs? Is there a problem, because previous witnesses indicated concern over the, perhaps, confusion between promotion and assessing needs? Based upon the financial situation we're all aware of, are local authorities perhaps holding back on promotion because they don't have any capacity to deliver the needs if they promote too much?

[194] **Mr Morgans:** Good question. From our perspective in Carmarthenshire, we have a mechanism in place to assess how many school places we need. We keep a very tight control on admissions, and the patterns and trends in admissions, and that helps us, really, when we identify if some of our Welsh-medium schools in our urban areas are reaching their capacity. We have plans in the pipeline already about extending provision in some of our bigger towns because of the demand. We know, because the schools we've built or expanded are filling up, so we will be responding to that challenge. Maybe, in Llanelli, we will need to do a piece of work on communicating with all those parents, prospective parents, in that area, and getting a better grip on the actual numbers of places we might need in the future, and the impact of that as well on the secondary provision within that specific area. As far as other authorities go, I don't know of any examples, but I think support on how to assess needs effectively would be really useful for authorities—a process map or whatever, to help us out with that piece of work.

[195] On your point about promotion, that's an interesting issue, because we've had some experiences where we've been trying to promote, and promotion sometimes is two-way. In our area, it's opposition, whilst maybe in other areas there could be a lot of support for demand for Welsh places, which could be challenging in the very, very short term for local authorities to plan for. The key thing with assessing need, I think, is you do it in a systematic way and you build on the outcomes over a period of time, and maybe you build into that process the expectations for parents to understand that, you know, it's not going to happen by September, but that, maybe in two years' time, we will have built that school or changed this school or whatever, so that there is a kind of understanding from the start of the process of the possible timeline for any changes, so that you don't raise the expectations and can't meet them. I think that's probably more frustrating for parents and very difficult to manage for the authority if you can't meet that expectation at the end of that piece of work. I think some kind of guidance on assessing the need—a simple, easy way of doing it—would be really appreciated.

[196] **David Rees:** Can I ask a slightly off-the-wall question, in a sense that we're focusing on Welsh-medium education here but, clearly, if we are trying to promote it, we are on many occasions going to be promoting it to families that are English-speaking families, effectively? I'm a perfect example; my children went to a Welsh-medium school. What support are you looking at, and do you link up the Welsh-medium education strategies to provide support for families so that they also can actually help children and that the children, therefore, are not disadvantaged by going through Welsh-medium education from an English-speaking background?

[197] **Mr Morgans:** I think one of the pieces of work Catrin is doing for me now, and has been doing for the past two or three months—and I've attended a couple of conferences as well in Scotland, as it happens—is about how to promote the value of bilingual education. I think we've come to a point where we're disadvantaging learners if they don't get that option. I think it's a really good baseline for learning other languages et cetera. So, we've got all the

research now together and our plan is to create a simple promotional pack, which we can share, first of all, with headteachers and teachers, because they are the people who are going to talk to these parents in their local community, so that they are confident about how to promote it and the value of it. We then go to parents' evenings et cetera with simple pamphlets and handouts, but also talking to parents. They are the key things. You know, having Catrin around, she can talk to parents face to face. One of the ways we work Catrin's team is that she manages the athrawon bro—so, the teachers who support Welsh in schools—and she also manages the Welsh for adults programme. So, it's a whole package, really, because we are concentrating now on some of our schools in the more Anglicised areas. We're offering courses for staff and support staff within those schools and also linking that to the community and offering Welsh for adults in that community as well. So, it's a whole package for those parents. So, if they're interested in that Welsh-medium education, we will support them and maybe give them some basic Welsh to work with their young children.

[198] So, it's the whole package approach, really; so, it's all tied up nicely, in the sense that they feel they're not on their own. But I think there's a marketing bit of work to be done there; you know, short and sharp, simple, not too complicated, and just showing the value of learning two languages. Interestingly, in Scotland, where I was in a conference recently, the challenge was—I think it was Gaelic and English—'Why Gaelic? Why not another language in Scotland?', which is a fair point, but, you know—? It's just about the value of being bilingual or trilingual, and the advantages that are there. There's no research to say it's bad for you. Most of the research says it's very good for you.

[199] **Ann Jones:** Okay?

[200] **David Rees:** Just one final question.

[201] **Ann Jones:** Yes, okay. Then Aled wants to come in.

[202] **David Rees:** In your evidence you actually identified that the need to change the school category is challenging. I understand, perhaps, that that is one mechanism of meeting some demand, but do you want to expand upon that, because this is your main recommendation to the Welsh Government, I think?

[203] **Mr Morgans:** Yes. I compiled the report with the WLGA. One of our huge challenges is changing the language category of schools. There's a school organisation code, and we accept that code is there for a reason: to protect schools and to protect the community that school serves. That authority now has been delegated to local authorities, but in Carmarthenshire the process is around 18 months for changing a school's category. A recent example we had was a primary school with about 100 children in the foundation phase. Out of 35, 30 wanted Welsh-medium education and five wanted English. The school argued that they couldn't sustain the English-medium class and met with parents informally and discussed, and had more or less an agreement with the majority of parents, but two parents stuck out and then the authority had to intervene saying, 'Okay, the school has not gone through a process. They can't move on this development because it would mean we'd need to change the school's language category officially.' And to do that we'd have to go through a process of taking it through committees in Carmarthenshire, with a formal consultation, notice periods et cetera. So, it is very, very challenging to make that small change in a school. In that school, we were taking away the option of learning through the medium of English in the foundation phase, but in year 3, parents would still have had that choice. But still, those two parents, really—. It's their choice, of course, but that meant we couldn't make that change. So, there's a very small class in that school now being maintained with a class teacher whereas, you know, there's about 70 or 80 on one side of the school—in the Welsh-medium school—and there's about 20 on the other side. But, you know, that has to be sustained now until, maybe, we go through a formal process with that school.

[204] **Ms Griffiths:** And, actually, those parents weren't in the catchment area of the school either.

[205] **Ann Jones:** Right. Okay. I didn't think we had catchment areas for schools anymore.

[206] **Mr Morgans:** We do in Carmarthenshire, yes.

[207] **Ann Jones:** Oh, you do in Carmarthenshire.

[208] **Mr Morgans:** We use catchment areas to manage school admissions and transport.

[209] **Ann Jones:** Okay. I didn't think catchment areas were allowed. Okay, I'll think about that one. Aled, you've got a point.

[210] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf jest eisiau gofyn am asesu'r galw yma a gofyn i chi pa fath o fewnbnw sydd yna gan Fudiad Meithrin a'r rhaglen Twf, achos yr oeddech chi'n awgrymu eich bod chi'n ymateb i'r galw ar ôl i'r galw gyrraedd lle'r ydych chi'n rheoli mynediad i ysgolion a hwyrach yn gwneud pethau ddwy neu dair blynedd ar ôl. Mae gen i esiampl yn sir Wrecsam, lle mae yna ysgol Gymraeg newydd wedi'i hagor tair blynedd yn ôl ac mae yn 22 o blant wedi cael eu gwrthod ar gyfer y dosbarth meithrin. Felly, rwy'n cwestiynu a ydy'r targedau'n adlewyrchu asesiad galw yn ddigonol o ran awdurdodau.

Alun Roberts: I just want to ask about the assessment of demand and ask you what sort of input Mudiad Meithrin and the Twf programme have, because you were suggesting that you were responding to demand after it had reached that point where you regulate admissions to schools and perhaps do things two or three years after that. I have an example in Wrexham, where a new Welsh-medium school opened three years ago and 22 children have been refused a nursery place. So, I'm questioning whether the targets reflect the assessment of demand sufficiently with regard to authorities.

[211] **Mr Morgans:** Byddwn i'n derbyn hynny. Rŷm ni'n gweithio'n effeithiol gyda Mudiad Meithrin. Mae yna system gyda ni lle'r ydym ni'n cyfathrebu ac yn rhannu gwybodaeth. Mae rhyw 40 cylch meithrin yn bwydo ysgolion sir Gaerfyrddin ar hyn o bryd, ac felly mae'r wybodaeth yna gyda ni ynglŷn â faint o blant sy'n dod drwy'r systemau gyda nhw. Rŷm ni yn gweithio gyda nhw i ehangu'r ddarpariaeth sydd gyda nhw hefyd mewn rhai ardaloedd efallai sydd heb ddim darpariaeth ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n her mewn rhai ardaloedd lle nad oes yna ddim darpariaeth cyn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg ac wedyn nid yw'r plant yna yn cael y cyfle, efallai, i fynd i ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg wedyn achos nad ydyn nhw wedi cael y profiad cynnar yna.

Mr Morgans: I would accept that. We work effectively with Mudiad Meithrin. We have a system where we communicate and share information. There are some 40 cylchoedd meithrin feeding into Carmarthenshire's school system at present, so we have that information about the number of children going through their systems. We work with them to enhance the provision that they have in certain areas where there may be no provision at present. That is a challenge in certain areas where there is no pre-school Welsh-medium provision, and those children do not then have an opportunity, perhaps, to go to a Welsh-medium school, because they haven't had that early experience.

[212] Rwy'n derbyn efallai fod yna waith i'w wneud o ran mesur y galw mewn rhai ardaloedd. Os oes yna blant yn cael eu troi i ffwrdd, nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol mewn gwirionedd—rŷch chi'n colli'r rheini, ac mae

I accept, perhaps, that there is some work to be done in assessing demand in some areas. If there are children who are turned away, then that's simply not acceptable—those children are lost to the system, and that's

hynny'n siomedig wedyn, yn arbennig os ydyn nhw wedi gwneud y dewis i ddilyn llwybr addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg .

[213] **Aled Roberts:** A gaf i jest gofyn o ran y fforwm hefyd? A ydy'r fforwm yn agored i'r cyhoedd?

[214] **Mr Morgans:** Yn sir Gaerfyrddin mae'n agored, ac mae Mudiad Meithrin, fel esiampl, yn rhan o'n fforwm ni. Maen nhw'n cyfarfod yn gyhoeddus, beth bynnag. Maen nhw mewn siambr, ond nid wyf yn siŵr o sefyllfaoedd siroedd eraill. Ond, rŷm ni wedi cytuno ein bod ni'n tynnu pobl i mewn fel yr ydym ni eisiau, fel mudiad y ffermwyr ifanc neu rywun, neu'r Urdd, os ŷm ni'n moyn datblygu'r ochr gymunedol, ac mae yna strwythur hefyd yn sir Gaerfyrddin lle mae yna gyfarfod o holl asiantaethau sy'n cefnogi'r Gymraeg o dan adain y cyngor sir yn dod at ei gilydd hefyd, achos mae'r ochr gymdeithasol, gymunedol yn bwysig. Fel y dywedodd Catrin, rŷm ni'n moyn iddi fod yn fwy nag iaith ysgol. Mae hynny'n bwysig o ran bod y bobl ifanc yn cael cyfle i ddefnyddio eu Cymraeg.

[215] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Monitoring, reviewing, reporting—Simon.

[216] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch. Rwyf jest eisiau cychwyn gyda'r pwynt yna, a dweud y gwir, sef y fforymau yma, achos mae'n ymddangos i mi—ac mae eich tystiolaeth chi yn cyfeirio at hyn—y byddai gan y rhain rôl eithaf allweddol o ran dal trwyn yr awdurdodau ar y maen, fel petai, yn aml iawn, a gwneud hynny'n gyhoeddus hefyd. Rŷch chi wedi sôn rhywfaint am y ffordd y mae'n gweithio yn sir Gâr. A oes gyda chi dystiolaeth o'r ffordd mae'n gweithio mewn awdurdodau eraill? Ac a oes yna arfer—er nad oes canllawiau pendant gan y Llywodraeth, a oes yna rannu arfer da yn digwydd gyda'r gwaith hyn?

[217] **Mr Morgans:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o arfer yn cael ei rannu ar hyn o bryd, ond rwyf i yn gwybod am rai esiamplau. Er enghraifft, yn Abertawe, rwy'n credu bod yna fforwm sydd wedi'i sefydlu ers sbel fanna o ran y partneriaid amlycaf sy'n rhan o ddatblygu'r agenda yna yn Abertawe yn cwrdd â'i gilydd yn rheolaidd i ddatblygu'r agenda. Ond, eto, mae'n wahanol

disappointing, particularly if they've taken that option of following Welsh-medium education.

Aled Roberts: Can I just ask about the forum as well? Is that open to the public?

Mr Morgans: In Carmarthenshire, it is open, and Mudiad Meithrin, for example, is part of our forum. It is a public meeting in any case. It's held in a chamber, but I'm not sure about the situation in other counties. But, we have agreed that we will bring people in as required, such as the young farmers or the Urdd, if we want to develop the community side of things, and there is also a structure in Carmarthenshire by which there is a meeting of all agencies supporting the Welsh language under the wing of the county council, and therefore, the social, community side is very important to this. As Catrin said, we want it to be more than the language of education. It's important that young Welsh speakers have an opportunity to use the Welsh language.

Simon Thomas: Thank you. I just want to start with that point, really, namely these fora, because it appears to me—and your evidence refers to this—that these would often have quite a significant role in holding the authority's nose to the grindstone, as it were, and to do so publicly. You have spoken a little about how it works in Carmarthenshire. Do you have any evidence of how it works in other authorities? And is there practice—even though the Government doesn't have specific guidelines, does the sharing of good practice take place with regard to this work?

Mr Morgans: I am not aware of good practice being shared at the moment, but I know of some examples. For example, in Swansea, I think a forum has been established for quite a while there in terms of bringing the most prominent partners together in Swansea to develop the agenda there. But, again, the situation in Swansea is different from that in Carmarthenshire. That

yn Abertawe i'r hyn yw hi yn sir Gâr. Hynny yw, mae lot o aelodau'r fforwm yna'n benaethiaid neu'n staff mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, ond mae eisiau i'r peth fod yn ehangach na hynny; dyna le mae'n bwysig i ni fod ein haelodau ni yn rhan ohono fe, ac yn aelodau sydd â gwahanol ardaloedd o sir Gaerfyrddin lle mae yna wahanol ddarpariaeth. Felly, mae'n bwysig datblygu ar hyd y continwwm yna.

[218] Mae fforymau yn ifanc, rwy'n credu, yn gyffredinol ar draws Cymru, ac efallai fod yna ddarn o waith yno i'w wneud o ran asesu eu heffeithiolrwydd nhw. Nid oes neb yn gofyn am gael gweld cofnodion neu agenda'r fforwm yna. Byddai hynny'n rhywbeth efallai y gellir ei wneud o ran rhannu beth maen nhw'n ei drafod. Hefyd, rwy'n credu, yn ein hachos ni, mae'r fforwm yna yn adrodd i'r cyngor sir fel rhan o'r broses atebolrwydd i swyddogion ac aelodau.

[219] **Simon Thomas:** Achos mae yna ofyniad statudol i adolygu yn flynyddol, ac mae'n ymddangos i fi, gan fynd yn ôl at bwynt roedd Catrin yn ei wneud, rwy'n meddwl, y byddech chi'n bennu lan gydag un dyn ac un fenyw mewn ystafell yn adolygu ar eu pennau eu hunain, oni bai eich bod chi'n gallu creu prosesau a chynnwys pobl fel hyn. Ac er ei bod yn ddyddiau eithaf cynnar arni, rwy'n meddwl ein bod ni'n cynnal yr ymchwiliad yma er mwyn dysgu o'r gwersi cynnar er mwyn trio lledaenu rhai o'r pethau hynny.

12:00

[220] Ym mha ffordd y byddai'r awdurdodau yn mynd ati nawr i adolygu erbyn mis Rhagfyr, rwy'n meddwl? Beth yw'r strwythurau a'r dulliau y byddan nhw yn eu defnyddio i adolygu nawr? 'Y ffordd yma' ydyw mewn ambell i le—a ydy e lawr i swyddogion unigol mewn ambell i awdurdod arall?

[221] **Mr Morgans:** Mae'r gofyniad i gael fforwm ym mhob sir, wrth gwrs, ond rwy'n credu ar ddiwedd y dydd mae'r adroddiad yn cael ei greu gan swyddogion. Yn ein sefyllfa ni, byddwn yn trafod data yn nhymor yr hydref gyda'r fforwm. Bydd y fforwm yn ein herio ar y data os nad ydynt yn gwella, ond

is, many members of that forum are headteachers or staff in Welsh-medium schools, but it needs to be broader than that; that's where it's important for us that our members are part of that, and that they're from different areas of Carmarthenshire where provision is different. So, it's important to develop along that continuum.

The fora are at a formative stage across Wales generally, and there is perhaps a piece of work to be done there in assessing their effectiveness. Nobody asks to see the minutes or the agenda for that forum. That could be something we could do in terms of sharing information about its proceedings. Also, I think, in our case, that forum reports to the county council as part of the accountability process for officials and members.

Simon Thomas: Because it is a statutory requirement to review on an annual basis, and it appears to me, going back to a point that Catrin was making, I think, you would end up with a man and a woman in a room reviewing it by themselves, unless you could create a process that would include people like this. And even though it is still early days, I think that we are holding this inquiry in order to learn from the early lessons to try to expand on some of those things.

How would the authorities, therefore, go on to review by December, I believe? What are the structures and the methods they would use to review now? It is 'This way' in some areas—is it down to individual officers in some other authorities?

Mr Morgans: There is a requirement for a forum in every county, of course, but at the end of the day the report is drawn up by officers. In our situation, we will be discussing data in the autumn term with the forum. The forum will challenge us on the data if they don't see improvement, but there

mae yna dempled neu gwestiynau wrth Lywodraeth Cymru rydym yn gorfod eu hateb, ac mae'r ffocws ar ddata, fwy neu lai, yn hytrach nag efallai rai pethau eraill sydd wedi datblygu o ran y continwmm iaith ac ati. Efallai fod eisiau i ni rannu mwy o ran creu'r adroddiad blynyddol. Rydym yn trafod ysgolion, wrth gwrs, a rhannu beth sy'n digwydd mewn ysgolion. Ond, mae rôl allweddol gan y fforwm i herio'r adroddiad yna, a'n bwriad ni yw mynd â'r adroddiad drafft yn yr hydref i'n fforwm ni.

[222] **Simon Thomas:** Achos un o'r diffygion sydd yn yr holl dystiolaeth sydd wedi dod drosodd, rwy'n meddwl, yw bod y berchnogaeth leol yn wan mewn ambell i fan yng Nghymru. Hynny yw, mae rhai pobl yn ei weld e—ac rydych chi wedi adlewyrchu rhywfaint o hynny pan roeddech yn trafod gyda Lynne ynglŷn â'r blaenoriaethau lleol. Ac mewn ambell i ardal mae perchnogaeth gref. Rwy'n gwybod, wrth gwrs, yn sir Gâr eich bod chi wedi cael panel i edrych ar iaith yn y sir yn dilyn y cyfrifiad. Mae yna broses yn digwydd ac felly mae diddordeb i fod yn rhan o'r broses yna. Ond, mewn ambell i awdurdod arall, efallai fod y berchnogaeth leol yna ddim mor gref. A ydych chi'n ymwybodol dros y genedl i gyd, er enghraifft, pan fydd yr adroddiad blynyddol yn cael ei baratoi, a fydd yn mynd at gynghorwyr, a fydd ei adrodd yn ôl, a fydd trafodaeth agored arno fe, neu a ydy e'n tueddu i fod yn guddiedig?

[223] **Mr Morgans:** Nid wyf yn gwybod ar draws Cymru, ond rwyf yn gwybod am esiamplau mewn rhai awdurdodau lle mae'r adroddiad yna yn adroddiad cyhoeddus i'r cyngor llawn ac yn drafodaeth. Yn sefyllfa sir Gaerfyrddin, gan ei fod yn rhan o waith ehangach, mae ar agenda'r cyngor sir yn rheolaidd o ran datblygiad y Gymraeg. Mae yna banel ar wahân sy'n edrych arno fe hefyd ynglŷn ag addysg a phethau eraill. Ond, byddwn yn disgwyl bod adroddiadau fel yna yn mynd drwy'r broses wleidyddol er mwyn rhoi gwybodaeth i aelodau a chyfle iddyn nhw i herio os oes eisiau.

[224] **Simon Thomas:** Achos yr agwedd arall yw: wrth ymgynghori ar y broses yma, roedd sôn bod angen cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynnydd ai peidio ar y

is a template or some questions from the Welsh Government that we will have to answer, and the focus is on the data, more or less, rather than some of the other things that may have developed in terms of the language continuum and so. Perhaps we do need to share more information in terms of creating the annual report. We do discuss schools and share good practice from schools. But, the forum does have a key role in challenging that report, and our intention is to submit the draft report in the autumn to our forum.

Simon Thomas: Because one of the weaknesses identified in all of the evidence that has come across is that the local ownership is weak in some areas of Wales. That is, some people see it—and you've reflected on some of that when you were discussing with Lynne about the local priorities. And there is strong ownership in some areas. I know, of course, in Carmarthenshire you've had a panel to look at language in the county as a result of the census. A process is happening and therefore there is interest in being part of that process. But, in some other authorities, perhaps that local ownership isn't as robust. Are you aware on a national level, for example, when the annual report will be prepared, will it go to councillors, will it be reported on and will there be an open discussion on it or will it tend to be concealed?

Mr Morgans: I don't know of the situation across Wales, but I know of some examples in authorities where that report is a public document for the full council and for debate. In Carmarthenshire, as it is part of a broader piece of work, it is on the county council's agenda regularly in terms of the development of the Welsh language. There is a separate panel looking at it in terms as well in terms of education and other things. But, I would expect such reports to go through the political process in order to provide information to members and an opportunity for them to challenge if needs be.

Simon Thomas: Because the other aspect is: in consulting on this process, there was talk about the need to publish an annual report on progress or otherwise on these plans. That

cynlluniau hyn. Fe ollyngwyd y gofyniad hwnnw; dywedodd y Gweinidog mewn tystiolaeth inni y gallai fod yn rhy feichus. Ond mae jest yn ymddangos i mi, os ydych yn mynd drwy'r broses yma yn flynyddol beth bynnag—rydych yn paratoi adroddiad i'r cyngor beth bynnag, felly nid yw cyhoeddi hwnnw yn faich; mae'n rhan o'r atebolrwydd ac yn rhan o'r tryloywder a beth sy'n digwydd mewn awdurdod. Nid yw'n wirioneddol feichus i gyhoeddi rhywbeth fel yna, nac ydi?

[225] **Mr Morgans:** I fod yn onest, nid oes data yn fanna nad ydym yn casglu'n barod fel rhan o unrhyw adroddiad arall. Mae gennym adroddiad safonau sir Gâr bob blwyddyn—ac mae nifer o siroedd eraill yn gwneud yr un peth—sy'n cael ei gyflwyno i'r pwyllgor craffu ac i'r cyngor llawn. Mae'n cynnwys yr holl ddata ar bob maes gwaith yr awdurdod, ac yn benodol ar iaith, gwyddoniaeth a mathemateg. Felly, mae'r data ar gael. Byddai'n ddigon rhwydd i ni wneud e drwy ddiweddarau ein cynllun strategol yn rheolaidd. Ni fyddai'n waith ychwanegol i ni, cyhyd nag ydym yn cael rhyw dempled gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn gofyn i ni ei lanw. Rydym eisiau dilyn proses adrodd sir Gâr, yn lle gorfod—

[226] **Simon Thomas:** Felly, pe bai'r gofyniad yna ond y dull yn aros yn eich dwylo chi, byddai modd i chi gwrdd â'r gofyniad yn ddigon rhwydd.

[227] **Mr Morgans:** Ac mae'r data yna ar gael ac rydym yn ei wneud e beth bynnag.

[228] **Simon Thomas:** Océ. Diolch.

[229] **Ann Jones:** Aled, on WESPs and broader Welsh Government policies.

[230] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf eisiau symud at bolisiau ehangach Llywodraeth Cymru, a gofyn am eich barn chi ar dystiolaeth RhAG sydd yn beirniadu'r cyswllt rhwng gwahanol adrannau o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol. Mae yna enghreifftiau wedi bod y bore yma, er enghraifft ynghylch Dechrau'n Deg, lle mae uned y Gymraeg, wrth gwrs, yn eistedd o fewn adran addysg Llywodraeth Cymru, a bod yna ddim cyswllt. Felly, o ran ymarfer yn sir Gaerfyrddin, beth

requirement was dropped; the Minister in evidence to us said that this could be too burdensome. But, it appears to me that if you're going through this process annually in any case—you're preparing a report to the council in any case, so publishing that isn't burdensome; it's part of being accountable and part of being transparent and what goes on in an authority. It's not really burdensome to publish something like that, is it?

Mr Morgans: To be honest, there are no data there that we wouldn't be collecting anyway as part of any other report. We have the standards report for Carmarthenshire each year—and a number of other counties do the same—which is presented to the scrutiny committee and the full council. It includes all data on all the authority's work areas, and specifically on language, science and mathematics. So, the data are available. It would very easy for us to do that by updating our strategic plan regularly. It wouldn't be overly burdensome for us, as long as we don't get some template from Welsh Government that we would have to fill in. We would want to follow our own reporting process within Carmarthenshire, rather than have to—

Simon Thomas: So, if that requirement was there but the method remained in your hands, you would be able to meet that requirement quite easily.

Mr Morgans: And the data are available and we do that in any case.

Simon Thomas: Okay. Thank you.

Aled Roberts: I want to move to the broader Welsh Government policies, and ask for your opinion on RhAG's evidence that criticises the links between various departments within the Welsh Government and local authorities. There have been examples this morning, for example regarding Flying Start, where the Welsh language unit, of course, sits within the Welsh Government's education department, and there is no link. So, in terms of practice in Carmarthenshire, what is your

ydy'ch barn chi am y cyswllt rhwng y cynllun yma a gwahanol raglenni polisi Llywodraeth Cymru?

[231] **Mr Morgans:** Yn gyffredinol, rwy'n credu bod llawer o waith datblygu gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'w wneud o ran sut mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio ar draws a sut mae'r Gymraeg yn rhan fwy creiddiol o rai cynlluniau sydd ar waith. Rwy'n teimlo ambell waith bod y Gymraeg yn perthyn i Gary Lewis a'i dîm, ac mai nhw sy'n edrych ar ôl y Gymraeg, ac efallai nad yw mor bwysig mewn agweddau eraill o waith Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r un ddatl, efallai, i gynghorau lleol hefyd, efallai. Hynny yw, mae'r Gymraeg fel petai'n perthyn i'r adran addysg yn hytrach na bod y Gymraeg yn perthyn i bob gwasanaeth o fewn awdurdod.

[232] O ran rhai o'r cynlluniau yma, rŷm ni a nifer o siroedd eraill wedi sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael lle blaenllaw yn lleol yn rhaglenni fel Dechrau'n Deg ac ati. Mae gennym ni esiamplau o'r Mudiad Meithrin yn darparu cynllun Dechrau'n Deg mewn rhai o'n hardaloedd ni. Felly, mae hynny eto, yn dibynnu ar sut rŷm ni'n dehongli'r peth yn lleol. Ond, byddai'n werthfawr i ni bod y Gymraeg yn fwy amlwg mewn rhai o'r pethau allweddol yma y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n eu gyrru sydd ar ochr amddifadedd ac ati. Mae yna blant cyfrwng Cymraeg sydd mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn, iawn. Felly, ambell waith, mae yna golli cyfle.

[233] **Aled Roberts:** Felly, beth ydy canran y ddarpariaeth yn y Gymraeg yn Dechrau'n Deg yn sir Gaerfyrddin?

[234] **Mr Morgans:** Byddwn i'n meddwl bod tua 20 y cant i 25 y cant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg oherwydd yr ardaloedd rŷm ni'n gweithio ynddynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae yna ardaloedd nawr yn Rhydaman lle mae'r ddarpariaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg trwy'r Mudiad Meithrin, ac ym Mhen-bre ac ati. Yn fwy yn ardal Llanelli, mae'n fwy Saesneg, ond eto, rŷm ni'n trio rhoi cyfle. Mae Ysgol y Felin yn un esiampl; mae'n ysgol ddwy ffrwd, felly, mae nifer o staff Dechrau'n Deg sy'n cysylltu â'r ysgol yna'n staff dwyieithog. Felly, rŷm ni'n trio sicrhau bod y dilyniant yno drwyddo, wedyn, o Dechrau'n

view of the link between this scheme and Welsh Government's various policy programmes?

Mr Morgans: Generally speaking, I think there is a great deal of development work for the Welsh Government to do in terms of how the Welsh language is used more broadly and how the Welsh language is a more central part of some of its plans and schemes. Occasionally, I feel that the Welsh language belongs to Gary Lewis and his team, and that they are responsible for the Welsh language, and perhaps it may not be as important in other aspects of the Welsh Government's work. The same is true, perhaps, of local authorities. The Welsh language seems to belong to the education department rather than belonging to all services within an authority.

In terms of some of these plans, we and a number of other counties have ensured that the Welsh language is given a prominent role locally in programmes such as Flying Start and so on. We have examples of Mudiad Meithrin supplying Flying Start provision in some of our areas. So, that depends on how we interpret it locally. But, it would be valuable for us if the Welsh language were more prominent in some of these key initiatives that the Welsh Government is driving in terms of deprivation and so on. There are Welsh-speaking children who are in very difficult situations. So, occasionally, there are opportunities missed.

Aled Roberts: So, what is the percentage of the Welsh-medium provision in Flying Start in Carmarthenshire?

Mr Morgans: I would've thought that 20 per cent to 25 per cent was provided through the medium of Welsh, because of the areas that we work in at present. There are now areas of Ammanford where the provision is provided through the medium of Welsh by Mudiad Meithrin, and the same is true in Pembrey. In Llanelli, it's more anglicised, but we do try and provide opportunities. Ysgol y Felin is one example; it's a two-stream school, so many of the Flying Start staff working with that school are bilingual. So, we do try and ensure that there is that continuum from Flying Start into nursery and into primary.

Deg i'r meithrin neu i gynradd.

[235] **Aled Roberts:** Mae RhAG hefyd wedi codi pryder ynghylch sefyllfa cludiant, yn arbennig, felly, ynghylch addysg ar ôl 16. A ydych chi'n teimlo bod angen mwy o eglurder gan Lywodraeth Cymru o ran beth yn union ydy'r sefyllfa?

Aled Roberts: RhAG also raised concerns relating to the travel provision, especially for post-16 education. Do you feel that there is a need for more clarity from the Welsh Government with regard to what exactly is the situation?

[236] **Mr Morgans:** Mae hwn yn faes diddorol a heriol iawn. Mae sir Gaerfyrddin, fel nifer o siroedd eraill, wedi bod yn trafod trafniadaeth ôl-16, achos nid yw'n statudol, felly mae'n un o'r pethau sy'n cael eu trafod o ran cyrraedd toriadau o ran cyllid sy'n dod i awdurdodau lleol. Rŷm ni'n edrych ar opsiynau gwahanol gydag ysgolion a thrafod gydag ysgolion. Yn bersonol, rwy'n credu y bydd yn gam gwag iawn, iawn i dynnu darpariaeth drafniadaeth oddi wrth addysg ôl-16. Bydd eich plant breintiedig chi'n gallu mynd i'r chweched dosbarth, neu i'r coleg addysg bellach, a bydd y plant efallai sydd eisiau mwy o gefnogaeth ac sy'n dod o gartref, efallai, â llai o gyllid, yn methu. Mae yna gynlluniau ar waith ynglŷn â datblygu rhyw fath o system ariannu rhai o'r bys hynny, os yw e'n digwydd, ond byddai mwy o arweiniad o ran beth sy'n statudol ac ati—.

Mr Morgans: This is a very interesting and challenging area. Carmarthenshire, like a number of other counties, has been discussing post-16 transport, because it's non-statutory, therefore, it's one of the things that's being discussed in the context of cuts within local authorities. We are looking at various options with schools, and discussing them with the schools. Personally, I think it would be a mistake to withdraw transport provision for post-16 education. Your more privileged pupils could go on to sixth form or an FE college and those children who need more support and who come from, perhaps, a less well-off home, couldn't. There are plans in place regarding developing a system to fund some of those buses, if needs be, but having more guidance in terms of what is statutory and what is non-statutory would be—.

[237] Yn ddiddorol iawn, rŷm ni wedi cael cyngor cyfreithiol ar y Gymraeg. Hynny yw, rŷm ni wedi cael yr her o ochr yr ysgolion eglwys ac ati. Nid yw darparu trafniadaeth ar eu cyfer nhw yn statudol, ond mae'n statudol ar gyfer ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, maen nhw'n ein herio ni, 'Wel, rŷch chi'n ei wneud ar gyfer y garfan yma o blant achos eu hiaith, ond nid ydych chi'n ei ddarparu ar gyfer y garfan yma oherwydd eu crefydd'. Felly, mae'r agwedd yna'n eithaf cymhleth ac yn anodd iawn. Mae'n annheg, efallai, o ran hynny, a dyna pam rŷm ni'n cael trafodaethau gydag ysgolion uwchradd Catholig i weld a oes yna ffordd i gyfaddawdu ac i ddod i ryw fath o gytundeb ynglŷn â hynny yn y dyfodol, os yw e'n rhywbeth y bydd sir Gaerfyrddin yn penderfynu. Ond, wrth gwrs, yn Abertawe, rwy'n credu, maen nhw wedi cael eu herio ac maen nhw wedi llwyddo. Ond, mae'n faes sy'n eithaf dyrys a chymhleth, a byddai rhyw fath o arweiniad o ran y maes yna'n ddefnyddiol.

Interestingly, we've had legal advice on the Welsh language. We've been challenged by the faith school sector. Transport provision for these schools is non-statutory, but it is statutory for Welsh-medium provision. They're challenging us, saying, 'Well, you're doing it for these children because of language, but you're not doing it for another, because of their religion'. So, that is quite a complex aspect and it's very difficult. It is unfair, in one sense, and that's why we are having discussions with Catholic secondary schools, to see if we can come to some compromise and reach agreement on that in the future, if it is something that Carmarthenshire will decide upon. But, in Swansea, I think they have been challenged and they have been successful. But, it is a very complex area and having some guidance would be useful.

[238] **Aled Roberts:** Roeddech chi'n sôn yn gynharach am yr holl bwysau sydd ar awdurdodau addysg ac ysgolion i wella cyrhaeddiad. A ydych chi'n gresynu nad oes llawer o sôn yn y cynlluniau ar hyn o bryd ynghylch perfformiad a chyrhaeddiad plant sy'n derbyn prydau ysgol am ddim, yn ôl iaith yr ysgol?

Aled Roberts: You mentioned earlier about all the pressure that's on local authorities and schools to improve attainment. Do you regret that there's not much talk within the plans at the moment about the attainment and performance of children who receive free school meals, according to the language of the school?

[239] **Mr Morgans:** Ydym. Mae'r canllawiau a'r ddogfen wedi dyddio yn barod. Fel mae'n digwydd, roeddwn i'n edrych ar ddogfen arall yr wythnos hon, sef cytundeb partneriaeth ysgol ac awdurdod, ac mae'r cyfnod yna'n dod i ben nawr, ac mae nifer o bethau yn y cytundeb yna ynglŷn â sut mae ysgolion yn gweithio. Roeddwn i'n edrych ar y rhagair ac yn gallu gweld bod yr holl bethau sydd wedi newid ym myd addysg mewn tair blynedd yn aruthrol. Roeddwn i'n sôn ar y pryd am fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ond mae hwnnw wedi'i hen gladdu. Felly, mae hwn, eto, yr un peth. Rŷm ni'n mynd yn ôl tair blynedd, pan ddechreuodd treialon y cynlluniau yma yn 2012, ac mae llawer o bethau yn y cyfarwyddyd y mae eisiau eu newid a'u diweddarau. Mae'r ffocws, wrth gwrs, wedi symud at amddifadedd. Mae'n un o flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru. Byddai'n ddiddorol iawn gweld, gan fod nifer o blant mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cael cinio am ddim, sut mae'r rheini'n perfformio o'u cymharu â'u cyfoedion mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg? Yn gyffredinol, rwy'n credu, yn sir Gâr yn benodol, mae safonau'r ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn uwch. Felly, byddai'n ddarn diddorol iawn o waith i weld sut mae'r plant hynny'n perfformio.

Mr Morgans: Yes. The guidance and the document are already dated. As it happens, I was looking at another document this week, namely the partnership document between schools and authorities, which is now drawing to a close and which contains a number of things in terms of how schools work. I was looking at the foreword and could see how much has changed in education over three years. It's quite incredible. We were talking about school effectiveness frameworks, but that has long since disappeared. This is much the same. If we go back some three years, when we were starting to trial these things in 2012, much of what's in the guidance that need to be changed and updated. The focus has shifted to deprivation. It's one of the priorities of the Welsh Government. There are a number of children in Welsh-medium schools who receive free school meals, and it would be interesting to see how they perform as compared with their peers in English-medium schools. Generally speaking, in Carmarthenshire, the standards in Welsh-medium schools are higher. So, it would be a very interesting piece of work to see how those children perform.

[240] **Ms Griffiths:** Hefyd, yn yr ymweliadau craidd gan yr ymgynghorwyr her, un o'r pethau ffocws sydd gyda ni yw edrych ar ddarpariaeth a chyrhaeddiad plant sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim. Felly, mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ffocysu arno.

Ms Griffiths: Also, in the core visits by the challenge advisers, one of the things that we do look at is the provision for and attainment of children who are entitled to free school meals. So, it is something that we are focusing on.

[241] **Aled Roberts:** Felly, rydych chi'n gwneud y gwaith, ond nid yw hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn y cynllun.

Aled Roberts: So, you are doing the work, but that's not reflected in the plan.

[242] **Ms Griffiths:** Nac ydy.

Ms Griffiths: No, it isn't.

[243] **Ann Jones:** Well, thank you very much. We've arrived at the position where I think we started. So, we've just about had the hour. So, can I thank you both very much for your

evidence today? We'll send you a copy of the transcript to check for accuracy, and then we'll publish it as part of our report. But, we do appreciate you, and thanks very much for taking the time to come and share your thoughts with us.

12:11

**Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note**

[244] **Ann Jones:** If we can just move on, I've got three papers to note: a letter from the Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, a letter from the Minister for Communities and Tackling Poverty, and a letter from the Minister for Education and Skills, following his meeting with us on supply teaching. So, if we can note those as papers to note, we can use them and publish them.

12:11

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42(ix) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o
Weddill y Cyfarfod hwn ac o'r Cyfarfod Cyfan ar 10 Mehefin
Motion under Standing Order 17.42(ix) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from
the Remainder of the Meeting and from the Whole of the Meeting on 10 June**

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod cyfan ar 10 Mehefin ac o weddill y cyfarfod hwn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(ix).

that the committee resolves to exclude the public from the whole of the meeting on 10 June and from the remainder of this meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(ix).

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.
Motion moved.*

[245] **Ann Jones:** Now, can we move into private session under Standing Order 17.42? Okay, so we'll go into private session. That's fine. Great.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:11.
The public part of the meeting ended at 12:11.*